Economic Growth Policies and Economic Growth Theory Influences

A comparison of Detroit and Trollhättan

Sophie Halldén

Bachelor’s thesis in Political Science 15 ECTS
Department of Economics and Informatics
University West
Spring term 2012
Supervisor: Hanna Kjellgren
Examiner: Ann Towns
Abstract

The aim of this thesis is to describe the presence of theories for economic growth in municipalities’ economic growth strategies, and to compare the municipalities’ of Detroit and Trollhättan. Municipalities formulate goals and policies in order to achieve different outcomes that will impact residents, cities, and the economy. Three different theories for economic growth are operationalized into an analytical framework and applied, in combination with interpretative policy analysis, on the economic growth policies and goals of the municipality of Detroit and the municipality of Trollhättan. The results show that elements all three economic growth theories are present in both municipalities’ approaches to achieve economic growth. It also shows that there are different combinations of economic growth theory elements present in the goals and policies. It is also demonstrated that both municipalities’ emphasize population growth, art and culture, and a high provision of amenities in the approaches’ to achieve economic growth.
Acknowledgements

I would especially like to thank my supervisor Hanna Kjellgren for the continued advice, inspiration, and support that she has provided throughout the process of writing this thesis.
# Table of Contents

1. Introduction ........................................... 6
2. Literature Review ....................................... 8
3. Theoretical Approach .................................... 11
   3.1 Economic growth policy ............................ 11
   3.2 Theories for economic growth .................. 12
      3.2.1 Cluster Theory ................................. 13
      3.2.2 Human Capital Theory ....................... 14
      3.2.3 Creative Capital Theory ..................... 16
   3.3 Analytical Framework .............................. 18
4. Specified Aim & Research Questions .................... 19
5. Research Design and Methods for Gathering and Analyzing Data 19
6. Comparative Analysis ................................... 23
   6.1. Introduction ........................................ 23
   6.2. Detroit ............................................ 24
      6.2.1. Economic Growth Policies .................. 24
      6.2.2. Conclusion ................................... 32
   6.3. Trollhättan ........................................ 33
      6.3.1. Economic Growth Policies .................. 34
      6.3.2. Conclusion ................................... 40
7. Conclusions ............................................ 41
8. Bibliography ............................................ 43
   8.1. Books ............................................. 43
   8.2. Journal articles ................................... 44
   8.3. Newspaper articles ............................... 46
   8.4. Official documents ............................... 46
   8.5. Online Sources .................................... 47
   8.6. Working papers ................................... 47
# Table of Figures

Table 1 Analytical Model: Theories for Economic Growth  
Table 2 Analytical Model: Theories for Economic Growth
1. Introduction

The inspiration for this research is the city of Detroit, USA. It is the only city in modern-time that has been destroyed and abandoned to the point of looking like a war zone, but that has not been subject to war, natural disaster or anything of the like. What happened to Detroit was an economic collapse, initiated by the crisis in the automobile industry. After years of financial problems, one of the municipality of Trollhättan’s largest employers, Saab Automobile AB (Saab), has recently filed for bankruptcy (Cole 2012). Although on a completely different scale, the municipality of Detroit is a city with as a somewhat similar history to Trollhättan. Detroit has, like Trollhättan, been heavily dependent on the automobile industry, and also consequently suffered from the repercussions of the crises in the industry. Several of the large car manufacturing companies such as Ford, Chrysler, Packard and General Motors (GM) have had financial adversities at several points in time (CNN Money: Fortune 2011). The city of Detroit is currently facing a fiscal crisis and there are ongoing discussions whether the state of Michigan is going to have to intervene in order to “avert a financial collapse” (Walsh 2012).

While Trollhättan is currently not experiencing such an extreme fiscal crisis, and the cities are different in many other aspects; size, population, governing structures, national context, culture, etc. the crises of the automobile industry is a common denominator. The impact on the economy of such large companies closing can be expected to be quite severe. Consequently, this could have negative impacts on municipalities and the residents of municipalities as well. Local governments, or municipalities, have the opportunity to influence and manipulate the economy in different ways, by implementing different policies (Weimer & Vining 2011). It can be argued when municipalities should and should not intervene in the economy. Nonetheless a good indication is that intervention should lead to greater social benefits, than social costs (Weimer & Vining 2011). It is not only important for politicians to formulate policies that have a positive effect on the economy in order to generate capital. It is also important for politicians to do so, in democratic societies, for the sake of re-election. The politics and the economics of cities are intertwined and impact each other both inadvertently and deliberately. This opportunity that local governments have to manipulate or alter the economy to some extent indicates that they have considerable powers, and that policies can be very powerful, too. It is therefore crucial that municipalities consider taking measures to increase economic growth in order to subdue the negative effects of economic crises, and improve the conditions for both the economy and for citizens.
Much of the previous scholarship on urban governance, that has researched local governments and their strategies to achieve economic growth, has focused on different types of governance models (Bockmeyer 2000; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Jacobs 2009; Lawless 2002; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005). The most common view is that municipalities act according to choice of governance model (Bockmeyer 2000; Brenner 1999; Lawless 2002; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005). However, some scholars have started to question this view and argue that there are additional factors that contribute to municipalities’ economic growth strategies as governance models provide insufficient explanations. Additionally, it has been recognized that factors or ideas of economics is more or less absent in most urban governance studies (Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Lawless 2002; Pierre 2005). Most of the research is also concentrated largely to cities in Canada, the United Kingdom and to the United States (Bockmeyer 2000; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Imbroscio 2003; Pierre 1999), and there are very few studies of Swedish cities (Brown 2000; Nilsson & Weibull 2010; Pierre 1997).

As previously mentioned, Trollhättan and Detroit are two municipalities that are in many ways different, but with the common denominator of having suffered the crises of the automobile industry. Keeping this in mind, and considering the power that municipalities can have on economies, it is very interesting to compare how the politicians’ of the two municipalities have responded to the crises in terms of economic growth strategies. Despite all the differences, have the reactions been in any way similar? Researching this could help not only the politicians’ of the municipalities in this thesis to formulate more effective policies. It could also benefit politicians’ of other municipalities in similar situations. This thesis aims to study the presence of economic growth theories in the municipality of Detroit’s and the municipality of Trollhättan’s economic growth policies. The theories have been selected as they are concerned with how economic growth is created in cities. Describing and comparing the presence of such theories in policies is also an attempt to cover some of the gap in the urban governance literature. The ideas of economics are almost nonexistent and there is a lack of studies on Swedish cities. Moreover, studying the presence of economic growth theories on municipalities’ economic growth policies will increase the knowledge and understanding of what policies actually consist of. Understanding the different elements of policies, and not only the effects of them, could support politicians’ in making effective policies. This would also add further knowledge to the scientific field of urban governance.
This introduction will be followed by a literature review discussing previous research on urban governance and approaches to local economic growth. The scientific gap will be also be identified in this chapter. The literature review will be followed by a theoretical chapter where the concept of economic policy is defined and where the theories for economic growth are presented and compared. The theoretical chapter will be concluded by an analytical framework consisting of three theories for economic growth and an analytical model. This is followed by the specified aim and research questions and a chapter discussing comparative, descriptive research design. The discussion of the research design will be followed by a discussion of policy analysis and research methods in general. The results of the two cases will be presented and compared and finally the last chapter will conclude this thesis by answering the research questions and discussing the implications of the results of the comparison.

2. Literature Review

Urban Governance & Local Economic Growth

With the changing economics of many cities, due to factors such as deindustrialization, municipalities’ responses to such changes is becoming more important. Scholars of urban governance attempt to distinguish and analyze the different elements in several different ways in order to bring understanding to the scientific field. Firstly, the setting and themes of urban governance research will be presented, followed by a discussion of governance models. The conclusion discusses the notion of additional factors that influence and are present in cities’ economic growth strategies, and identifies the gap in the field. Two gaps have been clearly identified in this literature review; there are additional factors that account for municipalities’ economic growth strategies, other than that of choice of governance model and; the lack of studies on Swedish cities.

Research concerning urban governance and local economic growth strategy in a city or municipal setting has largely been concentrated to the United States, the United Kingdom and Canada (Bockmeyer 2000; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Doberstein 2011; Imboscio 2003; Jacobs 2009; Lawless 2002; Leary 2008; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005; Rhodes 1996; Stoker 1998). There are a small number of studies encompassing European cities regarding changes in urban governance in the European Union (Brenner 1999) and different types of urban governance models (Pierre 1999). There is also a small amount of research on public-private
partnerships in Scandinavia as part of comparative research of the United States and Europe (Pierre 1997), and of the United States and Western Europe regarding local regimes (Haddock et al 1997). However, there are very few studies of Sweden and even less of the city of Trollhättan where urban governance or local economic development is discussed (Assmo 2006; Brown 2000; Nilsson & Weibull 2010; Pierre 1997). When taking into consideration the factor of deindustrialization, and more specifically the automobile industry crisis, even less research can be found that studies the effects in other countries than the United States or the United Kingdom. The city of Detroit, in the United States has been frequently researched and compared in studies regarding all of the above mentioned themes, urban governance, local economic growth strategy and the decline of the automobile industry, each theme researched separately or in various combinations (Bockmeyer 2000; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Haddock et al 1997; Jacobs 2009; Lawless 2002; Strom 2008). Moreover, the themes of race, education, public-private collaboration and partnerships, planning, institutionalism, rational choice, urban regime theory and how these are affected by urban governance and economic growth strategies, as well as how they affect urban governance and economic growth strategies is often discussed (Bevir & Rhodes 2001; Bockmeyer 2000; Cox 1995; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Jacobs 2009, Lawless 2002; Nilsson & Weibull 2010; Pierre 1997; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005; Rast 2001; Rhodes 1996; Stoker 1998; Strom 2008). Additionally, the relationship between the public and the private sector, and the extent of the respective sectors’ powers, in regards to the development of policies for economic growth are frequently analyzed (Haddock et al 1997; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Jacobs 2009). Most other research on urban governance and local economic growth strategy is of analytical, critical and theoretical nature (Bevir & Rhodes 2001; Cox 1995; Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005; Stoker 1998).

Several scholars in the field of urban governance and economic growth strategy have identified models of urban governance (Bockmeyer 2000; Brenner 1999; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Doberstein 2011; Imbroscio 2003; Jacobs 2009; Lawless 2002; Nilsson & Weibull 2010; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005; Stoker 1998; Strom 2008). Some of them claim that the main objective of a city’s politicians is to choose a governance model that will decide the strategy for achieving economic growth, which will ultimately generate some sort of economic and social development and growth, and capital for the city and its inhabitants. They also argue that the model that a city chooses to implement is often influenced by institutionalism, but also by different ideologies, and by the corporate climate in the city.
(Bockmeyer 2000; Brenner 1999; Doberstein 2011; Jacobs 2009; Lawless 2002; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005; Stoker 1998; Strom 2008). One of the most common governance models used to analyze economic growth strategy is urban regime theory (Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Lawless 2002; Pierre 2005). Some researchers argue that several American and British local governments have implemented policy agendas that are based upon a progrowth regime model of urban governance in order to achieve economic growth as a response to deindustrialization or some other kind of manufacture industry crisis (Bockmeyer 2000; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Haddock et al 1997; Jacobs 2009; Lawless 2002; Rast 2001).

“Progrowth governance is characterized by close public-private interaction” (Pierre 1999:384), and by “the structuring of concerted, public-private actions to boost the local economy” (Ibid: 384).

However a recurring critique is that it is difficult to perform comparative research using this framework, especially between American and European countries, as the concept and scope of governments differ (Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Pierre 2005). While the selected governance models were successful in some cities, in others they were not. Some scholars argue that this is because there are other factors, such as economics or location, in play that promote or impede the chosen strategy (Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Lawless 2002; Pierre 2005).

Conclusion

Many authors of previous urban governance research seem suspect that there could be additional factors that influence, contribute to, or are present in municipalities’ economic growth strategies. Only a few have taken their research further and made an argument for their suspicions though. While the different types of urban governance models are studied extensively, the concept of economics is clearly absent from most research, which is made evident by Imbroscio (2003) and Lawless (2002). Most of the research does not take economic theories in consideration for the success or failure of cities’ strategies to achieve economic growth, and is centered almost exclusively on the choice of governance model. Both Imbroscio’s (2003) and Lawless’ (2002) research indicate that there is a high possibility for additional factors, other than that of choice of governance model, that influence and are present in municipalities’ economic growth strategies. The arguments that the governance model that a city chooses to implement is often influenced by institutionalism, different
ideologies, or by the city’s corporate climate strengthen this claim further. Moreover, while the research on the United States and specifically the city of Detroit is abundant, there is a clear lack of research on Swedish cities.

Two gaps in the scientific field of urban governance have been clearly identified in this literature review; there are additional factors that account for municipalities’ economic growth strategies, other than that of choice of governance model and; the lack of studies on Swedish cities. Studying factors of an economic nature instead of governance models, in a comparative study including a Swedish city would benefit the field by providing new answers that previous research has not been able to answer. It could also provide tools future research that aims to broadening the field of urban governance.

3. Theoretical Approach

Most previous scholarship on the subject of urban governance and local economic growth argues that the factor that local governments’ base their economic growth strategies on is the choice of governance model (Bockmeyer 2000; Digaetano & Lawless 1999; Jacobs 2009; Pierre 1999; Pierre 2005; Stoker 1998). However, some have started to question this as research is proving that there must be other or additional factors (Haddock et al 1997; Imbroscio 2003; Lawless 2002; Pierre 2005). Considering the extent of municipalities’ powers to influence economies in different ways, by the formulation and implementation of policies (Weimert & Vining 2011), it seems the most rational is to study such policies. This thesis aims to describe and compare the presence of economic growth theories in two municipalities’ strategies to achieve economic growth. In order to do this, three theories for economic growth have been chosen. Moreover, there is a paragraph below explaining the concept of economic growth policies and the role and the importance of such policies for cities. Lastly in this chapter, the analytical framework and tool will be presented and explained.

3.1 Economic growth policy

The political economic goal of developed countries is to sustain their high level of wealth, and for the economic development, growth and distribution to continue. “The assumption is that this will generate an expanding economic base that directly provides more material benefits to the population and also enables government to distribute greater welfare to the citizens”
Weimert & Vining (2011) argue that local governments formulate and implement policies in order to influence the economy. In the same way as implementing policies can have both positive and negative effects on the economy, not enforcing policies can have similar outcomes. Examples of types of policies are, but not limited to, those “freeing, facilitating and simulating markets; using taxes and subsidies to alter incentives; establishing rules; supplying goods through nonmarket mechanisms; and providing insurance and cushions (economic protection) (Weimert & Vining 2011: 210)”. Policies as a type of rules or regulations of the economy are important to, and present in all economies according to Lester Thurow, who argues that without those rules “an economy would be in a state of anarchy (Weimert & Vining 2011:255)”. Due to the absence of definitions in academic literature of what a policy actually is, an online dictionary has been used to provide the definition. According to reference.com (2012) a policy is defined as “a deliberate plan of action to guide decisions and achieve rational outcome(s). The term may apply to government, private sector organizations and groups, and individuals (Reference.com 2012: Policy)”. It is also stated that a policy is different from a law in the way that “policy merely guides actions toward those that are most likely to achieve a desired outcome (Reference.com 2012: Policy)”, and thus does not prohibit or forbid any action or behavior. “Policy or policy study may also refer to the process of making important organizational decisions, including the identification of different alternatives such as programs or spending priorities, and choosing among them on the basis of the impact they will have. Policies can be understood as political, management, financial, and administrative mechanisms arranged to reach explicit goals (Reference.com 2012: Policy)”. In conclusion, economic growth policies are political decisions, regulations, and measures that are implemented by a political entity as guidance for the purpose of achieving a desired objective. Consequently economic growth policies should be an integral part of any municipality’s strategy to achieve economic growth and provide guidance that can bring greater wealth to cities. This greater wealth can then be distributed and invested in order to achieve the development needs of cities and citizens.

3.2 Theories for economic growth

The three theories have been selected on the basis of being contemporary theories of economic growth that all in some way focus on the creation of economic growth in cities; Human Capital Theory, Creative Capital Theory and Cluster Theory. All three theories are concerned with both business and human resources to achieve economic growth in cities, but in different ways and combined with different factors (Glaeser et al 2004; Glaeser 2000;
Glaeser 1998; Florida 2003; Florida 2005; Porter 2000). The theories will be presented in terms of what factors are the most important to achieve economic growth, what characteristics a place should have to attract these factors, how economic growth is created and how the theories contrast regarding these aspects. There is also an addition of what policies where the different theories are present would most likely focus on. Considering that all three theories focus on business in some way, it admittedly makes it more difficult to make absolute clear demarcations, but it is the combination of factors and characteristics that differentiate the theories. In order to distinguish whether one or the other theory is present in a municipal goal or policy, several factors of one theory need to be combined. The theories will be categorized using indicators in an analytical model. This model will be applied in the analysis of the empirical data in order to describe and compare the presence of the different economic growth theories.

3.2.1 Cluster Theory
The most important factor to achieve economic growth according to the Cluster Theory is for companies to cluster in agglomerations in order “to gain productive efficiencies” (Florida 2003:4), and competitive advantages (Porter 2000). “Clusters are geographic concentrations of interconnected companies, specialized suppliers and service providers, firms in related industries, and associated institutions (e.g. universities, standards agencies, and trade associations) in particular fields that compete but also cooperate” (Porter 2000:253). A place where one can detect the presence of Cluster Theory need to be characterized by agglomerations of companies in similar, in related or in complementary fields (Florida 2003; Porter 2000). Additionally, the entry and exit barriers are lower in cluster locations and there is often a higher provision of complementary knowledge, services, products, human resources etc. (Porter 2000).

When companies cluster, they gain competitive advantages, become more productive, develop, and cluster even more (Florida 2003; Porter 2000). This consequently causes the economy to grow and to become more productive. Sourcing from outside clusters is often more expensive, and thus for more cost-effectiveness companies source within clusters, causing both demand and supply to increase within the clusters. This often concerns specialized products, human resources, skills and services, and clusters often have a higher percentage of specialized resources than non-cluster locations. Additionally, clusters accumulate information and special knowledge, creating a flow of information and
knowledge, which can be accessed easier or at a lower cost within the cluster than outside, which also increases productivity. Clusters can offer joint marketing of companies, and or marketing of a location of companies in a specific field. Moreover, firms within clusters are often able to take advantage of public and quasi-public programs within the cluster, which can contribute to cost-effectiveness and the utilization of local resources. Companies or services within clusters are often complementary to each other, and for one part to be successful, usually all parts must function well. Relationships amongst companies and entities within clusters, and relationships with other clusters give members information regarding new technology, knowledge, service, marketing concepts etc. within the field more rapidly (Porter 2000).

Economic growth policies where Cluster Theory elements are present are likely to focus mainly on issues that promote companies, companies’ needs, and the establishment of companies. Policies would focus on ensuring low entry and exit barriers for companies, simplification and cost-reduction for the establishment of companies. Policies would also focus on fulfilling companies’ needs, such as the attraction and provision of complementary services to both companies and to the human resources of companies. Additionally, it is probable that there would be a focus on promoting competition and cooperation within and between clusters to increase productivity.

### 3.2.2 Human Capital Theory

In contrast to the Cluster Theory in which the most important factor to create economic growth is the clustering of companies (Florida 2003; Porter 2000), according to the Human Capital Theory the most important factor is educated, and preferably highly educated, and productive people (Glaeser 2000). The level of education or skills of human resources in a location reflects the growth of that area, which means that the higher the education or skills, the higher or faster growth of that particular place (Glaeser 2000). While the Cluster Theory recognizes that highly or specialized resources, in which human resources are included, are often more frequent within cluster locations (Porter 2000), it is not argued to be one of the factors that create economic growth. Other important factors for economic growth in the Human Capital Theory are the accumulation and exchange of knowledge, information and ideas between individuals and between individuals and companies, which ultimately creates an increase in innovation and in particular technological innovation (Glaeser 2000). This could be compared to the accumulation and flow of information and special knowledge that
occurs in clusters. However this is argued to increase productivity (Porter 2000), not to increase innovation.

Cities are places that facilitate the crucial sharing of ideas and creation of innovation and therefore needs to attract the individuals and companies that this interaction occurs between. Proponents of this theory argue that in order to do this, there needs to be an abundance of amenities in the city that serve the residents and enable consumption, which is also a crucial factor to create economic growth (Glaeser 2000). While according to both the Human Capital Theory and the Cluster Theory businesses are important in a city, in the latter the presence of companies in clusters is important as this provides competitive advantages, for companies (Porter 2000). In the Human Capital Theory the presence of companies, or amenities, in cities is of importance to the human capital; they are to serve them by enabling consumption (Porter 2000).

To create economic growth according to the Human Capital Theory, the most important factors need to be combined with the most important characteristics of a place. Productive and highly educated or skilled people should be rewarded for their productivity, which they often are in the shape of higher incomes and faster increases in income. Highly educated and productive individuals are attracted to places with plentiful of amenities, and consequently companies are attracted to these places. Due to the higher incomes and faster increases in incomes, consumption rises in these places. This in turn attracts more of this type of human capital to these places, more sharing of knowledge and creation of innovation occurs, and both economic growth and population growth increases (Glaeser et al 2004, Glaeser 1998; Florida 2003). The emphasis in this theory for how economic growth is created is on the human capital. They must be creative and productive in order to increase their earnings, and consequently increase their consumption. The amenities are just a tool for facilitating the consumption (Ibid. 2004; Ibid. 1998; Ibid. 2003). This is quite different from the Cluster Theory where businesses are the most important factors, and human capital is only viewed as a type of resource (Porter 2000).

Economic growth policies where Human Capital elements are present would most likely focus on three areas: business establishment particularly in the form of amenities and service providers, education and population growth. Policies focusing on education would most likely emphasize the increase and improvement of education, knowledge and skills of its population.
Additionally, these policies would also focus on improvement and maintenance of educational facilities and the increase of innovation. Policies focusing on business establishment of amenities and service providers would concentrate on issues that simplify and promote such businesses. Policies focusing on population growth would emphasize attracting human resources from outside the city by enhancing the attractiveness of the city in various ways. The likely policy focus on business establishment is one indicator of the Human Capital Theory that is similar to that of the Cluster Theory. To differentiate the two theories in this aspect, a goal or policy must also indicate other foci, factors or characteristics of the same theory.

3.2.3 Creative Capital Theory

The third theory in some ways encompasses those two previously presented, but requires additional factors and conditions for economic growth to occur. The most important factors to create economic growth according to the Creative Capital Theory are “the 3Ts of economic development: technology, talent, and tolerance” (Florida 2003: 10). Talent is defined as people that hold at least a bachelor’s degree or higher, these people are part of the creative class. They are referred to as creative people or the creative capital. There are also certain professions that are more creative than others which make up the so called super-creative core of the creative class. Professions included in this category are “scientists and engineers, university professors, poets and novelists, artists, entertainers, actors, designers, and architects, as well as the “thought leadership” of modern society: nonfiction writers, editors, cultural figures, think-tank researchers, analysts, and other opinion-makers” (Florida 2003:8).

The creative people can be compared to the highly educated human capital of the Human Capital Theory, which is also one of the most important factors of said theory. Moreover, it can be argued that talent and the super-creative core of the creative class (Florida 2003) is an extension of the highly educated human capital of the Human Capital Theory (Glaeser 2000), and the skilled human resources of the Cluster Theory. However, as mentioned previously, skilled human resources is merely one of several resources in the Cluster Theory, and is not accounted for as one of the most important factors. It is argued in both the Creative Capital Theory and the Human Capital Theory that the presence, increase and sharing of innovation and knowledge is an important characteristic of a city to create economic growth (Florida 2005; Glaeser 2000). This can also be compared with the argument that knowledge is to be collected and shared in a cluster, in order to gain advantages within the cluster, according to the Cluster Theory (Porter 2000). As this characteristic of innovation and knowledge is
present in all three theories, in order to distinguish between them, this indicator must be combined with other factors of a theory.

Cities need to have certain characteristics to attract talent. The location that talent is attracted to need to possess characteristics of the Creative Capital Theory’s T called Tolerance (Florida 2003; 2005). Fulfilling the criteria of Tolerance translates to a city that is characteristic of “openness, inclusiveness, and diversity to all ethnicities, races, and walks of life” (Florida 2005:37). Tolerance is measured by indexes, such as the Gay Index or the Bohemian Index. If a city scores high on these indexes, it means that there is a high degree of diversity. These indexes indicate a high proportion of homosexual people, artists, and for example people who lead so called alternative lifestyles. The score a city achieves on these indexes reflects the diversity, openness and tolerance of a place. Having a high proportion of immigrants is also important. The importance of scoring high on these indexes is related to low entry barriers for population growth not related to births, but to people moving in from the outside and members of for example the gay or bohemian groups, and the creative class are often attracted to diverse, open and tolerant places (Florida 2003). Additionally, it is important that there is a concentration of high-technology and innovation in a city (Florida 2005). The Gay Index is very strongly correlated with high-tech industry concentration and growth. The Bohemian Index strongly correlates to high-tech industry concentration, and economic and population growth. Furthermore, Florida (2003) agrees with the basics of the Cluster Theory; that competitive advantages occur in clusters (Porter 2000). However, he argues that “concentrations of talented people who power innovation and economic growth” (Florida 2003:5) are the reason that companies cluster. Additionally he argues that a concentration of talented people is the competitive advantage for companies. Human resources is not just one of many resources, it is the main resource for the creation of economic growth in clusters (Florida 2003), similar to the highly educated capital in the Human Capital Theory (Glaeser 2000). The characteristics of Tolerance cannot be found in the other two theories; however it could be argued that they are a type of low entry and exit barrier, and in a way factors that could signify an attractive city.

For economic growth to be created according to the Creative Capital Theory, all three T’s are necessary and must coincide in one city. Where there is tolerance, talent is attracted to, and technology is attracted to talent. When all three T’s are combined a creative center is created, and regional and economic growth occurs (Florida 2003; 2005). Creating a center or a cluster
could be compared to the Cluster Theory (Porter 2000), and attracting talent could be compared to the highly educated people of the Human Capital Theory (Glaeser 2000). However, the Creative Capital Theory can be distinguished as it requires highly educated people, clustering of high-technology and tolerance in order for economic growth to be created.

Economic growth policies where Human Capital elements are present would most likely focus on creating policies with three different foci. There would be policies focused on higher education, improving and maintaining a high level of its educational facilities and on the education and knowledge of the population. It is also likely that there would be policies focusing on diversity, equality and integration, as these characteristics attract talent. Policies focusing on high-technology business establishment would concentrate on issues that attract and promote the establishment of such companies and institutions in the area. The policy focus on education is similar to that of the Human Capital Theory and the focus on high-technology business establishment could be compared to the policy foci of the Cluster Theory. However the presence of the Creative Capital Theory can be distinguished by the combination of the other foci and factors, as they are all necessary in creating economic growth.

3.3 Analytical Framework
This analytical framework is based on the three theories for economic growth that have been presented in this theoretical chapter. These have been used to analyze the empirical data that has been collected. The questions that have been selected as indicators for each of the theories are focused on the most important factors for growth, the characteristics of places and how economic growth is created according to each of the theories. There has also been an addition to the framework, where the author of this thesis has concluded from the previous questions and by studying the theories in question, what policies where the theories are present would most likely focus on. These indicators have been transformed into an analytical model which will be used in the analysis of the empirical data. The analytical model will be used in combination with the further explanations of the most important foci, characteristics, creation of economic growth and the probable policy focus of each of the theories, mentioned above. In order to facilitate the most accurate demarcations between the theories, some factors must be combined with others. In situations where this is not possible, due to insufficient
information to be able to distinguish between the theories, it could be indicated that there is either a combination of theories, or simply a coincidence.

Table 1 Analytical Model: Theories for Economic Growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Human Capital Theory</th>
<th>Creative Capital Theory</th>
<th>Cluster Theory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most important factors for economic growth:</td>
<td>Highly educated/skilled, productive HR. Exchange of knowledge Creation of innovation.</td>
<td>Talent, super-creative core. Technology, high-technology. Tolerance, openness, diversity.</td>
<td>Clusters of companies in specific fields and complementary businesses and services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place/location characteristics:</td>
<td>Abundance of amenities, enabling consumption.</td>
<td>High degree of diversity. Low entry barriers. High-tech industry.</td>
<td>Companies in a cluster should be similar, in related fields or complementary. Low entry and exit barriers. High provision of complementary resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How is economic growth created?</td>
<td>Cycle of increasing incomes, consumption, HR, knowledge, innovation.</td>
<td>Talent, Technology, Tolerance Creative center</td>
<td>Competitive advantages Cost efficiencies Clustering</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Specified Aim & Research Questions

The aim of this research is to describe and compare the strategies formulated by local governments to achieve economic growth in the municipality of Trollhättan, Sweden and in the municipality of Detroit, USA. More specifically, the thesis asks:

1. Can the presence of elements of the Human Capital Theory, the Creative Capital Theory and the Cluster Theory be found in the municipality of Trollhättan’s and the municipality of Detroit’s approaches to achieving economic growth?

2. What are the similarities and differences of economic growth theory approaches of the two municipalities?

5. Research Design & Methods for gathering and analyzing data

Research design

The design of this research is descriptive and comparative (Bryman 2008; Denk 2002; Esaiasson et al 2012). It has been selected as the most suitable design as the aim of this thesis
is to describe and compare the presence of economic growth theories in the strategies formulated by the municipality of Detroit and the municipality of Trollhättan. Comparative case studies are mainly carried out with the intention of adding increased understanding to politics and political systems (Denk 2002). The intent of this thesis is that the results will add knowledge to the field of policy-making, and in particular, knowledge and awareness of what policies actually consist of. This could provide tools for increasing the effectiveness of policy-making. There are different methods that can be applied in order to select cases and what makes good selection of cases is dependent on the relevant theory to be tested. Often one of two systems is used to select cases for comparative studies; most similar system design, or most different system design (Esaiasson et al 2012). When applying the most similar system design, cases are selected based on the principle of being the most similar in all respects but the question of interest. This facilitates comparisons that can exhibit or explain for different outcomes of strategies (Ibid. 2012). The opposite applies to selecting cases based on the most different system design. In this design, cases are selected based on only the dependent variable, the one to be studied, being similar, and all independent variables differing. This case selection design is often used when one aims to strengthen the belief of one theory or claim, and at the same time weaken the credibility of other theories or claims (Ibid. 2012). Traits of both case selection designs can be seen in this thesis, such as similar or different independent and dependent variables etc. Additionally, the general purpose of this thesis is to show that there are additional factors that contribute to the choice of strategies to achieve economic growth that municipalities choose to adopt, other than that of choice of governance model. This matches the intent of how the most different design system is often used (Ibid. 2012). However, as this thesis is descriptive and does not make any causal claims or aim to make generalizations neither of these designs have been applied. The cases have been selected based on being municipalities with different governing structures, but with the common denominator of having been heavily dependent on the automobile industry and suffered the crises of the industry. This makes it interesting to compare the municipal responses to such crises by studying the strategies formulated to achieve economic growth. Additionally, to see whether there are any similarities or differences in the economic growth theories that may or may not be present is also of interest and could add further to the field of policy-making.

Research Methods
The research will have a qualitative approach to the analysis of the empirical data. It is the best choice in order to realize the aim of this research, which is to analyze which theories for
economic growth can be found in the strategies to achieve economic growth in the two cases, and to compare the similarities and differences. Although the purpose of this study is not to delve deeper into the meaning of the results of the data, it also does not aim to measure quantity, value or the degree of influence of economic growth theories. Additionally, with the research project containing cases set in two different countries, the researcher needs to have an openness and flexibility to differences in policy-making practices, influences of these, approaches to collecting data, different governing systems etc. that could make a difference to the design of policies, which means also an openness to methods, theories and results that may or may not be expected, throughout the process. If a quantitative design had been used this flexibility and openness would have been more difficult to retain as said design calls for a stricter use of methods and the project might have been very difficult to realize (Bryman 2008; Fischer et al 2007).

The empirical data that has been collected is primary data in the form of official documents from the municipality of Detroit and the municipality of Trollhättan. The official documents are the most current City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies (Master Plan) and the most current municipality of Trollhättan’s Goal and Resource Plan (MRP), with including vision statement and constitutive principles. These official documents have been collected from the respective municipalities’ official websites. They were chosen because they are the most current and contain the goals and policies for the municipalities’ strategies to achieve economic growth, and are thus the most relevant to study in order to see which economic growth theories are operative in these strategies and to compare the similarities and differences. Alternative methods of collecting data include different types of interviews, such as structured where the questions are set and inflexible, or semi-structured where the questions are more flexible and un-structured interviews that are carried out in a conversational demeanor. The methods of participation or observation, where the researcher participates in activities, or observes activities or situations, are also common in qualitative social research (Bryman 2008). Interviews with officials from the two municipalities’ who had been present in the formulation of the Master Plan of Policies and the Goal and Resource Plan were considered in order to supplement the study with additional data to increase and strengthen the validity of the results of the analysis of the official documents. Due to time constraints, the use of interviews was decided against.
The gathered data has been analyzed using a combined method of policy analysis (Bryman 2008; Fischer et al 2007) and by the application of the analytical framework presented in the theoretical chapter. It is recommended to develop an analytical model in comparative, descriptive research as it guides the analytical process in terms of determining what to search for. An effective analytical model should make clear differences between the variables, in this thesis between the theories for economic growth (Esaiasson et al 2012). By operationalizing the chosen theories accurately and adequately in an analytical tool, it is not only easier to analyze the empirical data, but the study can also be replicated which strengthens the reliability and validity of the research (Bryman 2008; Johnson & Reynolds 2005). Policy analysis can be divided into three parts; the causes of policy formulation, the process of policy formulation and the outcomes of an implemented policy. It concerns how policies should be interpreted, what influences the particular interpretation of a policy, and how the interpretation, the meaning and the understanding of a policy shape action. The specific type of policy analysis that has been applied to this study is interpretative policy analysis, which focuses on how policymakers formulate policies, as opposed to why (Fischer et al 2007). This indicates that conducting this type of research is beneficial to policy makers and others who have an interest in the processes of policy making. Consequently studies of this nature could lead to improved policy making processes, which could ultimately also improve policies. One could say that interpretative policy analysis interprets how policies have been formulated, which corresponds to the objectives of this research of studying which theories for economic growth that are present in the municipalities’ strategies to achieve economic growth. This could also be interpreted as meaning that what is to be studied is how politicians understand economic growth to be achieved. This type of research can be conducted both by analyzing documents and by conducting interviews or observational research (Fischer et al 2007).

The analytical framework is designed in such a way that when applied to a goal or policy one can ask the indicator questions, and check if any of the categorical indicators in any of the theories match with the focus of the goal or policy. The indicators for each theory are based on and correspond to the information provided on each of the theories in the theoretical chapter and will be used to analyze which of the different theories have influenced the economic growth strategies of the two cases; the municipality of Detroit and the municipality of Trollhättan, in order to make a comparison of the similarities and differences.
6. Comparative Analysis

6.1. Introduction

Both Detroit and Trollhättan have experienced deindustrialization and the crisis in the automobile industry. Trollhättan has only just recently experienced the closure of the Saab Automobile factory but in Detroit the deindustrialization and crisis have been going on for a long time. The situation in Detroit has gone so far that parts of the city are in ruins due to the collapse of the economy. The aim of this research is to describe and compare the economic growth strategies formulated by local governments to achieve economic growth in the municipality of Trollhättan, Sweden and in the municipality of Detroit, USA. This will be done by applying the analytical framework to the empirical data and then comparing the similarities and differences of the two cases. The selected documents are the most current and up to date. While the use of the word policy is not frequent in the Goal and Resource Plan like it is in the Master Plan of Policies, the function of the content of the two documents are similar and have been treated equally by the analytical framework in order to conduct an expedient analysis and to enable a comparison of the two cases.

The results of the analysis of the municipality of Detroit will be presented first. This will be followed by the analysis of the municipality of Trollhättan which will be compared to that of Detroit. The analysis will be concluded by a concluding summary of answering the research questions.
6.2 Detroit

The data which has been analyzed for the case of the municipality of Detroit is the current City of Detroit Master plan of Policies. It has been in use since July 2009 when it was adopted by the Detroit City Council and the mayor at the time. The Master Plan of Policies is “intended to be both long range and visionary and to provide guidance for actions to be taken in the next ten years” (Master Plan 2009: 3). Subject to changes in available resources, needs, or market conditions etc., it will be updated and the most current version is always available on the City of Detroit’s official website.

The Master Plan of Policies consists of and meets the requirements of the City Charter which states amongst other things that “The mayor shall propose and the city council shall approve, with the modifications it deems necessary, a master plan of policies for the social, economic and physical development and conservation of the city...” (Master Plan 2009: 3), and “The Master plan shall be a set of guidelines to assist the mayor and others in proposing and the city council in evaluating and implementing, specific proposals for the total development of the city and its residents” (Master Plan 2009: 4). It also meets the requirements of Michigan’s State Legislation and in particular the state of Michigan’s Municipal Planning Act which constitutes further requirements for the master plan. Both the requirements of the State Legislation and the City Charter can be found in the City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies or on the State of Michigan’s and the City of Detroit’s respective official websites.

The City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies is structured in such a way that an overview of each activity area is given which is followed by the issues that describe the current situation in the city regarding the specific activity area. This is followed by the goals which describe what the desired outcomes for the particular issues are by the implementation of the policies that state the strategic guidance to achieve the goals. The Citywide Policies have been studied, but not the goals and policies of particular neighborhood clusters.

6.2.1. Economic growth policies

Important characteristics of a place:

The most important characteristic of the city of Detroit for various reasons, but ultimately in order to achieve growth and development, is an extensive supply of amenities. The importance of amenities is evident in several of the goals, policies and statements made
throughout the Master Plan of Policies to address issues in different sectors of the city. This characteristic of a place is one of the most important in order to achieve economic growth according to the Human Capital Theory. The importance of this characteristic is especially evident in the following policy: “The quality of life in the City’s neighborhoods is determined in large part by nearby amenities” (Master Plan 2009: 44). It clearly states the importance of amenities for residents’ quality of life. Another policy that indicates the importance of providing amenities to residents and visitors and which is a response to achieve the goal to “Pursue support for regional attractions” (Master Plan 2009: 41) aims to “advocate for regional funding to maintain and improve Detroit’s parks, recreational facilities, museums, and other cultural venues” (Master Plan 2009: 41). It is further believed that “People and business are attracted to places that offer ample breathing space and diverse places to relax, play, learn and gather. Open spaces and recreational amenities generate economic and cultural benefits for neighborhoods, cities and the entire region” (Master Plan 2009: 46).

These statements indicate that amenities are important not only for attracting people and businesses, but also that they are important for achieving economic growth.

“Ensure development projects maintain views and vistas to the riverfront and along major thoroughfares. Encourage development in commercial and mixed-use corridors that take into consideration qualities such as walk-ability, scale, continuity of street wall and streetscape, gateways and view corridors. Promote development in high-density areas that includes both day and evening activities” (Master Plan 2009: 15). This indicates the importance of implementing policies that both benefit and ensure the appeal and vitality of the city and commercial districts, something that could attract both people and companies to the city and particular areas. Policies that would attract people and consequently increase population growth, if implemented, indicate elements of the Human Capital Theory. Policies that emphasize promoting the development or establishment of business, which here is termed ‘day and evening activities’ could indicate Cluster Theory. However, as this policy is combined with the notions of making a city more attractive, I argue that this type of business establishment is an indication of a policy focus with elements of the Human Capital Theory. Additional policies in the City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies that highlight amenities as important to the city aim to: “Continue to reinforce Downtown Detroit as the primary location for sports, leisure, cultural and convention attractions”; “Expand the role of the performing and visual arts in the city’s Downtown and Cultural Center” (Master Plan 2009: 22). These goals and policies imply yet again, that amenities are regarded to be important.
characteristics to achieve growth and development and thus indicate elements of the Human Capital Theory.

**How economic growth is believed to be created:**

The explicitly stated views of how economic growth is created in the Master Plan of Policies indicate a combination of the presence of all three theories. It is stated that “A thriving arts and culture scene can serve as an economic development tool” (Master Plan 2009: 13). There is a strong focus on art and culture and that there should be an increase in public exhibitions, concerts, plays and that it is important that more residents and visitors should be able to attend these events as a way to achieve economic growth. If these goals are fulfilled, it is likely that they would be beneficial to one of the super-creative professions of the Creative Capital Theory: the artists, which indicates components of this theory. However, it can also be considered that this focus contains elements of the Human Capital Theory, as it aims to provide a sort of amenity to the citizens. However, this does not seem to be combined with any other of the factors for economic growth of the Human Capital Theory. Therefore, I argue that this “economic development tool” (Master Plan 2009: 13) is more indicative of an element of the Creative Capital Theory where this would be one of the fundamental parts to create economic growth. Another issue where the goal would promote artists in particular states that: “While Detroit artists and cultural figures produce a myriad of artistic and cultural products the city is not able to fully capture the associated benefits and is often unable to retain and nurture its creative innovators. To rectify this, the goal is to: “Improve the viability of the arts and culture community” by “Identifying areas of the city that may be appropriate for live/work opportunities for artists; Providing assistance to artists in the marketing and packaging of events and products; Developing programs for provision of professional training in fine and performing arts” (Master Plan 2009: 14). These goals and policies demonstrate a focus directed at establishing and supporting businesses and activities that would benefit artists. A likely outcome of such policies would be that super-creative talent is attracted to the city, and thus contributing to the development of a creative center.

Policies and goals in the Master Plan of Policies that indicate the presence of Cluster Theory elements emphasize the importance and the increase of concentrations or clusters of certain industries to achieve economic growth. “The concentration of the automobile industry within Detroit is important for future economic growth. In addition, diversify the economy into other sectors. Increased diversified economic activities should translate into more jobs, more
opportunities for advancement, higher incomes, increased wealth, and a greater variety of services for residents” (Master Plan 2009: 21). The first part of this statement and the use of the word concentration clearly indicate clustering, hence an automobile industry cluster in Detroit. However, the second part of the statement matches the indicator of how economic growth is created according to the Human Capital Theory; the cycle of increasing incomes, consumption, human resources, knowledge and innovation. Therefore, I argue that this is approach indicate a combination of elements of both the Cluster Theory and the Human Capital theory, and a distinction is not possible. Additionally, it is argued that economic growth is achieved by “targeting geographic areas for business investment and growth” (Master Plan 2009: 21), i.e. creating economic clusters, in which “the benefits of synergy, economies of scale and positive spillover effects associated with concentrations of economic activity” (Master Plan 2009: 21) and should be emphasized, in order to counteract the negative impacts of disinvestment and decline in economic activity. Clustering leads to competitive advantages and cost-efficiencies for companies within clusters, this consequently leads to economic growth according to the Cluster Theory. This indicates the presence of Cluster Theory elements in these policies. Considering both the Cluster Theory and Human Capital theory elements in this section, it is possible that the view of the formulators of the policies is that clustering creates an economic growth circle like that of the Human Capital Theory. While elements of all theories are present in the municipality’s approach of how economic growth is achieved, it is clear that there is a combination in the approach. This means that it is not possible to distinguish, at this stage of the analysis, whether any of the theories are more prominent in the municipality’s approach to achieve economic growth.

Policy focus:
In order to provide a more effective overview of the different policy foci, these have been divided into three categories where the main overall directions have been distinguished; The Attractive City, Education and Commerce. The policies whose focus fit into these three categories do not exhibit the same economic growth theory elements, and they often have different objectives, procedures etc. What they have in common is that they either aim to achieve a goal that matches with the category, or the process of achieving a differently aimed goal corresponds to the given category.

The Attractive City
The emphasis on providing the residents of Detroit with a good quality of life is a recurring focus. “The density of development in urban areas is often at the expense of green spaces and natural habitat, thus limiting residents’ access to and interaction with the natural environment” (Master Plan 2009: 27). To solve these issues the goal is to “increase the accessibility of open space and natural habitat” (Master Plan 2009: 27) by implementing the following policies; “establish an inter-connected open space system throughout the City; work with communities to convert vacant properties into neighborhood parks and natural habitat areas; encourage and support urban agriculture; investigate recovering the City’s rivers, streams and creeks to provide habitat and promote biodiversity; designate and protect natural areas and critical habitat within the City; encourage large-scale developments and developments in high-density areas to incorporate open space” (Master Plan 2009: 27-28).

These measures might not be intended only for the benefit of the citizens’, but they will be the eventual profiteers of a healthier and more attractive environment. The provision of outdoor space and activities, nature, sceneries and spaces for outdoor recreation, which is a type of amenities, could also attract new citizens and visitors. I argue that this approach to attracting people to the city would be in the Human Capital Theory category. The Creative Capital Theory is also concerned with attracting people, or talent, to a city. However, talent is argued to be attracted to places with characteristics that indicate tolerance. Such characteristics are not mentioned in these policies.

The city’s commercial areas have problems with unattractiveness and inaccessibility which can be discouraging to both companies and customers. Subsequently, the goals are to “improve the accessibility and attractiveness of commercial areas; increase the safety of commercial areas and increasing support of locally owned businesses” (Master Plan 2009: 53). The municipality aims to do this by supplying business owners with the guidance and resources that they need. Additional efforts include encouraging business owners to cooperate with local institutions for higher education that can provide business knowledge and training. Moreover, incentives and tax relief will be granted to those in need and locations that are interesting for commercial development will be evaluated. They hope that these measures will support existing businesses and attract new companies. (Master Plan 2009: 53-54). This approach of supporting companies, but also enhancing the attractiveness of the city could attract both companies and citizens. It is difficult to absolutely distinguish between the Human Capital Theory and the Cluster Theory in this instance as both these theories would focus on supporting and promoting business in different ways. However, considering that
there are more elements of the Human Capital Theory combined in these goals and policies than there are Cluster Theory elements, the presence of the prior theory is more distinctive.

To attract and retain visitors and residents the city aims to improve the artistic and cultural climate by “increasing access to arts and culture” (Master Plan 2009: 14). To accomplish this, the plan is to “advocate for public exhibitions, concerts, plays, and other events in neighborhoods and alternative settings; provide transit to connect residents and visitors to art and cultural venues; encourage developers and property owners to incorporate works of art into public spaces” (Master Plan 2009: 14). The objectives of these goals and policies could be indicative of elements of both the Creative Capital Theory and the Human Capital Theory. However, they seem to be more aimed at providing people with a sort of amenity, and attracting people by attractive space. Artists could benefit indirectly from an increase in access to their work; however that is not the motivation of these goals and policies. Hence, I argue that the elements of the Human Capital Theory prevail over those of the Creative Capital Theory in this instance.

The city also wants to promote diversity through culture and arts programs by “developing outreach programs that emphasize the contribution of neighborhood history, architecture, diversity and culture to increase pride of place and understanding among Detroit’s diverse population and perspectives” (Master Plan 2009: 13-14). A policy focus on diversity can be interpreted as the Creative Capital Theory’s Tolerance factor and a city with such characteristics would be attractive to talent. Further policies where characteristics of Tolerance are present are Detroit’s neighborhood and housing objectives; one of the main points is that the policies of this sector be permeated by such notions as to ensure that the city “remains vital, diverse and inclusive” (Master Plan 2009: 42). The policy to: “encourage sufficient and diverse rental opportunities to retain current city residents and to attract new residents to the city, especially students, young professionals and artists” (Master Plan 2009: 43) contains elements that would indicate that it is aimed at attracting talent that is part of the super-creative core.

**Education**

The goals and policies of the Master Plan of Policies that focus on reaching educational objectives or where education is used purposively to achieve an objective, are mainly
influenced by the Human Capital Theory, but to some extent also by the Creative Capital Theory.

The policies that are to solve the problem of dilapidated educational facilities are policies that would be implemented to improve education and educational facilities, and also to provide activities and services (Master Plan 2012: 25). It is also emphasized that high quality education should be available for all, and especially young children and those in need should be provided extra support. The municipality aims to collaborate with local schools and organizations to achieve these goals and to improve the level of education (Master Plan 2012: 24). Additionally, educational programs particularly targeted at immigrants should “Support efforts for non-English speakers to gain proficiency in English as well as retaining their literacy and proficiency in native languages” (Master Plan 2009: 24). Elements of the Creative Capital Theory can be found in this policy where values of tolerance are evident.

Moreover, educationally oriented policies aim to “provide child care resources (Master Plan 2009: 30)” in order to support particularly working single parents by “implementing before- and after-school programs to provide school-age children with activities that enhance academic and social development” and by “encouraging employers to provide childcare and additional family support services (Master Plan 2009: 30)”. If implemented, these policies would contribute to improved complementary educational programs, as well as facilitating for parents as human resources to pursue work, which would not only be beneficial to parents and children but also to companies that require human resources. This translates to not only people being attracted to areas where such support is present; it would also support companies and the human resources of companies. It is also likely that policies that aim to improve and increase the level of education, and to provide extra support for those that require this, would increase citizens’ knowledge. The increase in knowledge and the support of companies by the provision of childcare could also facilitate for the increase of innovation. The combination of these factors indicates that Human Capital Theory elements are present.

**Commerce**

While industrial production and commerce remains an important part of Detroit’s economy, it has experienced a decline in the past 50 years and the production sites in the city have decreased as well as employment in the sector. “Changes in technology and business practices within industrial sectors have altered the structural and technological requirements
of industrial facilities” (Master Plan 2009: 36). The goal is therefore to “enhance the economic potential of industrial centers” (Master Plan 2009: 36) by “educating and informing both existing and prospective businesses of available incentives for renovating or rehabilitating industrial facilities; work with existing and prospective businesses to assess and pursue initiatives to meet the infrastructure needs of industrial centers” and “recruiting and creating incentives for green industry” (Master Plan 2009: 36). Implementing these policies would provide companies with the information of what facility support is available to them, and collaboration between the municipality and existing and potential businesses would be promoted. While all three theories are concerned with attracting and supporting business, I argue that the combination of factors indicates that the elements present in these policies are indicative of the Cluster Theory. There is a clear focus on industrial centers, a type of cluster, supporting businesses, and on cooperation between the city council, existing and potential businesses.

The following policies indicate that there is a medical and health facility cluster in Detroit and the objective is to maintain this by retaining and attracting new members to the cluster. Additionally, the policies’ call for maintaining and increasing research in the field which could lead to increased knowledge and innovation. “The Detroit Medical and other health facilities in the City not only provide necessary medical services to City residents but also provide employment opportunities and are leading research facilities” (Master Plan 2009: 33). The goal is to “maintain the City’s status as a hub for health providers and research” by “providing assistance and incentives to attract and retain health providers and research facilities”; “advocating at all levels of government to maintain and increase health providers and research facilities in the City” and “advocating for research relevant to the particular challenges and needs of the Detroit community” (Master Plan 2009: 33). It could be argued that elements of both the Human Capital Theory and the Creative Capital Theory are present in these goals and policies. Providing services to residents, increasing knowledge and innovation, and the importance of high-technology are examples of elements of these theories. However, there are no other factors that would support that the presence of either of these theories is prevalent. The presence of Cluster Theory elements is evident in several ways. It is clearly stated that there is a cluster of health care providers and research, and that the aim is to increase the size of this cluster. Specialized skills or resources are often more frequent within clusters, and Detroit’s medical and health cluster have leading research facilities. Additionally, businesses in this field are to be promoted and supported.
The city aims to: “enhance financial and technical assistance programs that support small business and neighborhood revitalization in underserved areas (Master Plan 2009: 22)” and to “support business start-up and growth efforts (Master Plan 2009: 23)” by “encouraging home occupations that promote individual entrepreneurs and business formation” and to “provide access to the resources and information necessary for successful business operation, including access to capital resources and technical assistance (Master Plan 2009: 23)”.

Additional efforts are to “maximize regional, national and global collaboration” (Master Plan 2009: 23) and to “develop strong international and interstate cooperation” (Master Plan 2009: 41) by: “supporting metropolitan cooperation and partnerships with State, Federal and other regional governments on economic development initiatives”; “supporting international trade agreements that benefit the city and the region” (Master Plan 2009: 23); “upholding strong connections with trade and cultural associations in Canada, particularly Windsor, and sister cities around the world” and “supporting efforts to increase the flow of goods and services throughout the mid-west and at the Detroit/Windsor border crossing” (Master Plan 2009: 41). The implementation of these policies would benefit companies and could potentially increase business. These areas could be perceived to be other clusters or part of a larger cluster in which Detroit is included. They are thus policies that simplify and promote regional and international trade for companies in the city, which would also be a positive aspect for those considering establishing companies in the city. Achieving this goal could also enlarge company clusters. Promoting and supporting business and the establishment of businesses is something that would be important to all three theories.

However, I argue that the factors of clusters, cooperation and business are a combination of Cluster Theory elements.

6.2.2. Conclusion

One can see that elements of all three theories are present in the goals and policies of the City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies. Ensuring the visual attractiveness of the city and providing amenities and increasing and improving the art and culture scene are important characteristics of a place. The ways in which Detroit’s city council believe that economic growth is created indicate a combination of elements of all three theories. The focus is on concentrations of economic activity that will result in a cycle of increasing employment opportunities, incomes, consumption etc., and efforts that promote art and cultural attractions and activities and that benefit artists in particular. In general the goals and policies focus on measures that will
attract business and people, and facilitate their success. It is also important to provide all citizens’ with high quality education and provide extra support for people-at risk to attain an education.

6.3. Trollhättan

The initial plan was to compare the municipality of Trollhättan’s economic growth policies with those of the municipality of Detroit’s. However, after starting the research, it became apparent that the municipality of Trollhättan does not have a particular strategy to achieve economic growth, and thus no policies that have been formulated with the clear aim to achieve economic growth. However, the municipality of Trollhättan’s current Goal and Resource Plan which includes the Vision and constitutive principles, state the city’s vision for the future and general economic goals, and also include a proposal for each of the municipality’s committees’ which state the economic activity areas and the objectives, missions, goals, resources etc. for each of these, for the mandated period. It also includes the budgetary propositions for the years 2012-2014; however these have not been analyzed as they are not contributory to the purpose of this research. For every term of office, a new goal and resource plan is created and adopted. The plan is created by the different committees that are responsible for the different activity areas of the city and includes propositions that focus on the political priorities that should be made during the term of office, specific directions of the scope of activities and actions, commitments, indicators and financial ratios etc. The Goal and Resource Plan is structured differently from the City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies. It is divided into the respective committees’ of the municipality, the focus and the scope of activities and responsibilities of these. Because the City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies is more detailed and has more content in each area of activity than Trollhättan’s Goal and Resource Plan, the Vision and Constitutive Principles have also been analyzed in order to be able to perform a more complete comparison of the results. Considering that the Vision and Constitutive Principles are to permeate the work of all committees they are an important part of the Goal and Resource Plan\(^1\) and this analysis (MRP 2011). This data is considered to be sufficient to discern the presence of economic growth theories for the municipality’s direction of work and activities. As in the other case the citywide goals and policies have been studied, but not those of particular neighborhood clusters.

---

\(^1\) Translated from Swedish: Mål- och Resursplan.
6.3.1. Economic growth policies

**Important characteristics of a place:**

Like in Detroit’s Master Plan of Policies, elements of the Human Capital Theory can be found in the Goal and Resource Plan (MRP 2011). The municipality of Trollhättan aims to increase the population by making the city attractive. To do this, providing amenities and services especially in the form of areas designated for leisure and outdoor recreational activities, cultural venues, libraries and nature sites etc. are of importance. Both municipalities aim to provide amenities and services, but as characteristics of a place, it is of much higher importance in Detroit. It is so important that the degree of amenities in a neighborhood determines to a large part the quality of life for residents.

The most important characteristics of a place to the municipality of Trollhättan are of a more abstract nature. These include equal rights and treatment of all, inclusiveness, integration and cultural and ethnic diversity. The constitutive principles, as part of the Goal and Resource Plan, are to permeate all municipal work and activities. These principles include amongst others solidarity with the weak and vulnerable, justice and equality by everyone’s equal right to services regardless of sex, background or economic powers and integration of all people of different ethnical backgrounds as a prerequisite to create a good future for Trollhättan. Cultural diversity should be the aim and discrimination and xenophobia is to be discouraged at all times. All citizens should feel safe and the special needs of children, the elderly and handicapped are to be accommodated. Agenda 22, the UN’s standard rules regarding participation and equality for people with disabilities is also to permeate all communal work and activities (MRP 2011). The constitutive principles indicate tolerance, one of the Creative Capital Theory’s necessary aspects required to creative center which is what creates economic growth according to the Creative Capital Theory.

**How economic growth is believed to be created:**

One of the most important factors for the city’s development and growth is that all citizens should have employment. To achieve this, prospects for more employment opportunities in Trollhättan must be created. The efforts to create such prospects for the citizens’ must involve mutual cooperation with local, regional, national and international parties, with regional cooperation being prioritized, and to view competence as one of the most important resources which has to be maintained, improved, changed and utilized (MRP 2011: 4). If one interprets what is here termed ‘parties’ to be businesses, institutions, potential employers etc. it is
possible to discern elements of the Cluster Theory; the emphasis on cooperation between companies, companies and individuals and companies and other entities within the cluster, but also with other clusters.

Good preconditions for growth and a highly developed infrastructure in the municipality with the aim of more people and businesses choosing to establish themselves in the municipality\(^2\) must be created. The emphasis on attracting people is an element of all three theories. However the combined emphasis on low entry barriers and the promotion of business establishment indicate that these are elements of the Cluster Theory. More specific development objectives of the municipality include that the population is to increase to 70000 by the year 2030 (MRP 2011: 4). Higher education and research at the local university that will provide the city with the latest knowledge in technology, environment, health care, media and other important areas are also of importance. Moreover, business establishment within the movie, gaming, music, environment and technology sectors as well as researchers, innovators, entrepreneurs, are recognized as fundamental to the development and growth of the municipality (MRP 2011: 2). There seems to be a high-technology cluster in the city. While clustering is an obvious element of the Cluster Theory, a high-technology cluster is one of the cornerstones in a creative city. Establishment of business would be important in all theories, as would attracting people and higher education and innovation be. Elements of all three theories are equally presented and relevant. This indicates that the view of how economic growth is created is a combination of all three. Although both cities show a combination of all three theories in their beliefs of how economic growth is created, the combinations are different. In the municipality of Detroit, growth occurs by improving the arts and culture scene, and by the clustering of companies which in turn leads to the Human Capital Theory cycle of economic growth.

**Policy focus**

**The attractive city**

The constitutive principles in the Goal and Resource Plan (MRP 2009) emphasize issues concerning the quality of life of the citizens. It is stated that if there is a good quality of life in the city, people will want to live and work there. The city’s approach to this is to continue the

---

\(^2\) Translated from Swedish: “Uppdrag 2: Kommunstyrelsen ska skapa goda förutsättningar för tillväxt och en väl utvecklad infrastruktur i kommunen i syfte att fler människor och företag ska välja att etablera sig i kommunen (MRP 2011: 94)”.

35
preservation of the environment, to continue the creation of an ecologically sustainable society, meet the demand for housing and communications for all current and future residents’, to help establish extensive and comprehensive culture and art activities and to offer high quality public services. Venues, agencies and community amenities are to be available and accessible at the times requested by the users (MRP 2011: 46). Additionally, various forms of cultural and leisure activity efforts that contribute to tolerance and understanding in general is to be encouraged (MRP 2011: 52). The importance of providing available and accessible venues, agencies, housing and community amenities in order to increase the city’s attractiveness and growth imply Human Capital Theory elements. Establishing extensive culture and art activities could be a type of amenities, but in combination with the values of tolerance they could benefit and attract talent. This indicates that elements of the Creative Capital Theory are also present.

Financial support as well as support in the shape of information, education and guidance should be provided for cultural and recreational clubs and associations in the city and work within these is to be permeated by the notion that Trollhättan is a multicultural society, and be a positive force in efforts for integration. These efforts are to contribute to a good quality of life, improved public health for the municipality’s residents and increasing the attractiveness of the city. Minority groups should also be encouraged to increased participation in cultural and leisure activities\(^3\) (MRP 2011: 52-53). The importance of attracting people to the city by improving amenities shows that elements of the Human Capital Theory are present. However, I argue that due to the combination of attracting people and the different efforts to increase tolerance and understanding, these are elements of the Creative Capital Theory.

Both municipalities’ goals and policies focus to a great extent on attracting new citizens, especially by providing citizens’ with a good quality of life, amenities, art and cultural attractions and activities, public services, healthy and attractive environments and neighborhoods etc. However, art and cultural activities seem to be viewed purely as an amenity in Trollhättan and only with the combination of values of tolerance could it be viewed as indicative of the Creative Capital Theory. In Detroit on the other hand art and culture is also a type of amenity, but also something that directly could and should be used to attract talent.

---

\(^3\) Translated from Swedish: “Uppdrag 4: Verksamheten ska uppmuntra och stödja olika former av insatser som bidrar till tolerans och förståelse, samt stimulerar underrepresenterade grupper till ökat deltagande i fritids- och kulturlivet” (MRP 2011: 53).
Attractive and exciting housing environments and public spaces, which take into consideration aspects of safety and comfort, are to be created in order to increase the preconditions for population growth. The city is also to become more attractive as a place to visit. One of the objectives to achieve this is to concentrate the detailed plans for residences, venues, agencies etc. on the fact that by the year 2030, Trollhättan has 70000 inhabitants\(^4\) (MRP 2011: 76). Policies with elements that purely aim to attract human resources and increase population growth by enhancing the attractiveness are indicative of the Human Capital Theory. Policies formulated by the municipality of Detroit also focus on making the city more attractive and especially public spaces are importance, but also commercial districts. Detroit’s focus on providing attractive housing environments is directed at attracting talent. Both cities are also to be permeated by notions that ensure diversity, inclusiveness, equality etc.; values of Tolerance that are elements of the Creative Capital Theory.

**Education**

As in the case of Detroit, elements of both the Creative Capital Theory and the Human Capital Theory are present in Trollhättan’s approach to education. The vision for the city of Trollhättan especially emphasizes knowledge, innovation, sustainable ideas, and the right to a good education. Knowledge is to play a central role and the aim is for Trollhättan to become a role model amongst Swedish municipalities as a leader in education\(^5\) (MRP 2011: 8).

Research conducted at the local university in the fields of technology, environment, media and several other fields is to supply the city with the latest knowledge in these and other important fields. In addition to the strong emphasis on education; technology and innovation are prominent in the future vision of Trollhättan. The different educational units of the municipality, such as pre-schools, youth leisure centers and other educational institutions are to cooperate and ensure that there is an exchange of knowledge concerning methods and results. Additionally, the educational environments should be permeated by democratic values and everyone’s equal value (MRP 2011: 9). The factors of high quality education, innovation and exchange of knowledge are particular elements of the Human Capital Theory. The emphasis on high-technology research, higher education and values that indicate tolerance are

---

\(^{4}\) Translated from Swedish: “Uppdrag 1: Detaljplaner för bostäder och verksamheter skall inriktas på att Trollhättan har 70000 invånare år 2030 (MRP 2011: 76)”.

\(^{5}\) Translated from Swedish: "Vår Vision inom utbildningssektorn skall vara: "Trollhättan en förebild som ledande utbildningskommun i Sverige” (MRP 2011- 8).
elements of the Creative Capital Theory. I argue that because these appear to be intertwined, there is a combination of the two in the municipality’s approach in this instance.

Furthermore, the city’s cultural venues are to provide children and youth with educational guidance and premises for music, media, arts, dance, drama, fashion, meetings and events. They are also to reflect the international diversity of its users and contribute to integration and contact with the Swedish language and culture, as well as with other cultures and languages. Additionally, the library’s media supply and services is to be available for everyone and offer a comprehensive and high quality selection to promote reading and knowledge development (MRP 2011). The provision of amenities and emphasis on education and promotion of learning are elements of the Human Capital Theory. However, the emphasis on integration and diversity indicates values of tolerance which is an element of the Creative Capital Theory. Education is also of importance to this theory. Because of the combination of education and values of tolerance I argue that these are elements of the Creative Capital Theory. The multicultural focus of Trollhättan is similar to that of Detroit where immigrants should have the opportunity to learn the English language, but where retaining their native languages is also importance.

As with the Detroit case, the Trollhättan case shows that there is a combination of Creative Capital Theory and Human Capital Theory elements in the municipality’s goals and objectives that concern education. Both municipalities aim to provide all citizens with high quality education and libraries. They also aim to attract and support people and businesses by providing amenities, so that a population growth occurs. Education and activities in multicultural settings should be encouraged, immigrants should have the opportunity to learn the new language and there should be an exchange of culture. A main difference between the two municipalities’ approaches is that Trollhättan’s cultural venues should provide educational guidance, while Detroit’s cultural venues are mainly seen as amenities and places that will benefit artists in different ways.

**Commerce**

The former industrial area in the city which today is designated for technological innovation is committed to and offers opportunities for entrepreneurs to establish viable companies in video game, movie and music production, environment and technology (MRP 2011: 2) and
the goal is that investment in this area is to be continued (MRP 2011: 4). Trollhättan’s former industrial area is similar to Detroit’s medical and health facility and research cluster, which the municipality aims to expand and improve by informing companies of the support that is available. The vision of the Goal and Resource Plan further states that Trollhättan should be a node for innovators, creators, entrepreneurs, researchers and other inspiring individuals from all over the world. The municipality also aims to facilitate and simplify the networking connections for innovators, entrepreneurs, small- and medium sized companies and other development forces in the municipality 6 (MRP 2011: 93). The municipality of Trollhättan’s aim to support companies and entrepreneurs within the cluster is similar to that of Detroit’s aims for the companies in the medical and health facility and research cluster. The municipality of Trollhättan’s combination of focusing on business establishment, low entry and exit barriers, cooperation and a concentration of companies and human resources in similar or related fields are clear elements of the Cluster Theory.

Trollhättan is to be attractive to enterprises specialized in technology and knowledge by ensuring that the economy has a good entrepreneurial climate and that the way of handling issues that are of importance to such businesses are nonbureaucratic. The city also plans to develop the infrastructure, focusing particularly on regional roads, regional and international railroad connections 7, the river, flight connections and the Information Technology network. These planned developments, could both directly and indirectly benefit companies, and the establishment of companies. The infrastructure development plans could attract companies indirectly, while the plans for the development of the entrepreneurial climate would benefit and attract companies directly, both being policy focuses of especially the Cluster Theory where the focus would not only be on attracting companies indirectly, but also on supporting and promoting companies directly by different methods and where the nonbureaucratic administration and promotion of a good entrepreneurial climate corresponds to the focus of said theory. Trollhättan’s goals and policies to support and promote entrepreneurship and business establishment are quite similar to those of the municipality of Detroit’s and both mainly indicate that elements of the Cluster Theory are present. Additionally, Detroit also aims to increase regional and international cooperation, however not in the same way as Trollhättan where the aim to do this is by infrastructure. Detroit aims to do this by supporting

7 http://www.riksdagen.se/sv/Dokument-Lagar/Forslag/Motioner/Norge-Vanerlanken_GF02T547/?text=true
trade agreements. Both municipalities’ efforts to increase regional and international cooperation could be seen as either expanding clusters or increasing cooperation between clusters, which would both be elements of Cluster Theory.

6.3.2. Conclusion
Similar to the City of Detroit Master Plan of Policies, elements of all three theories are present in the goals and policies of Trollhättan’s Goal and Resource Plan. The main important characteristics of a place appear to indicate the presence of Creative Capital Theory elements. The emphasis is on universal equality, diversity and integration, openness, inclusiveness, and tolerance. This differs from Detroit where ensuring the visual attractiveness of the city and providing amenities and increasing and improving the art and culture scene are the most important characteristics. These indicate that elements of the Human Capital Theory are important. The importance of ensuring the attractiveness of Trollhättan by providing amenities and services in the form of areas designated for leisure and outdoor recreational activities, cultural venues, libraries and nature sites etc. is also important. However, these are not the most important characteristics, those that indicate values of tolerance are.

The ways in which both the municipalities believe that economic growth is created indicate combinations where elements of all three theories are present. However the combinations are different. The most important factors to achieve economic growth according to the municipality of Trollhättan include increasing employment opportunities and increasing the population. Additionally, attracting and promoting high-tech business establishment is important. This is quite different from the view of Detroit where the focus is on concentrations of economic activity that will result in a cycle of increasing employment opportunities, incomes, consumption etc. Additionally, efforts that promote art and cultural attractions and activities and that benefit artists in particular are important to create economic growth.

In general the goals and policies of the municipality of Trollhättan focus on measures that will attract people by the provision and promotion of especially cultural, leisure, and recreational activities, healthy environments and activities that increases tolerance and ensure a good quality of life for citizens’. Additionally, higher education and research, technological innovation and attracting companies and entrepreneurs in high-technology fields are of great importance. The municipality of Detroit’s goals and policies focus in on measures that will
attract business and people, and facilitate their success. It is also important to provide all citizens’ with high quality education and provide extra support for people-at risk to attain an education.

7. Conclusions

The analysis of this thesis shows that municipalities’ strategies are not only the result of a chosen governance model, as elements of all three theories for economic growth are present in both Detroit’s and Trollhättan’s goals and policies. It also shows that economic ideas are present in the strategies which were argued to be missing from the research of urban governance by some scholars. This thesis also addressed the issue of a lack of Swedish cities in the field, by studying the economic growth strategy of Trollhättan.

Elements of all three theories; the Human Capital Theory, the Creative Capital Theory and the Cluster Theory are present in the goals and policies of both Trollhättan’s Goal and Resource Plan and Detroit’s Master Plan of Policies. There are several similarities of elements present in the strategies, but also some differences. However, the differences are mainly different combinations of the presence of elements of the theories for economic growth. Both municipalities’ view an extensive provision of arts and cultural activities and attractions as vital to ensuring a good quality of life for its residents’. Both Detroit and Trollhättan are very focused on attracting new residents’, especially by the provision of a good quality of life, mainly by the supply of amenities. However there seems to be a difference in opinions on what these two things are. To Detroit a good quality of life is an extensive supply of amenities such as retail and attractions, often in the form of art and culture. To Trollhättan a good quality of life is also characterized by an extensive supply of amenities in the shape of cultural activities, but also by outdoor and recreational activities and spaces. Perhaps this indicates that the definition of amenities or what defines a good quality of life is subject to national or local contexts. Possibly nature and outdoor life is more important than retail opportunities to the residents’ of Trollhättan than it is to those of Detroit. This divergence could also be subject to the actual resources of the municipalities’, and might not necessarily reflect the preferences of the residents’.

Additionally, Trollhättan puts a much stronger emphasis on values that indicate elements of tolerance, than Detroit. However, while Detroit does not emphasis this to the same extent, it is recognized that Detroit is a diverse place. This difference could be due to various reasons.
Whereas United States is and has always been multicultural and ethnically diverse, Sweden has not to the same extent as it was not founded by immigrants, so perhaps this is not an issue in Detroit. Other reasons could be that municipalities’ in Sweden are subject to not only national regulations, but international, and some of the constitutive principles of the Goal and Resource Plan are international regulations or recommendations, or just simply different views by politicians.

The presence of the elements of the different theories does not necessarily mean that the politicians’ considered these theories when they formulated the strategies to achieve economic growth. It also does not mean that the intention was to follow specific paths, which differ or are similar between the two municipalities. It could be that the politicians are taking advantage of the resources that are present in the cities. It is also possible that the municipalities have some resources that are similar, and others that are different and that this influences some of the results. This does not explain why the strategies are similar or different. However, as this thesis does not aim to study why the municipalities’ have chosen their particular strategies, what is of interest is the actual content of the goals and policies formulated to achieve economic growth. I believe that by knowing and understanding what political strategies and policies actually consist of could benefit policy-makers in making more effective policies. Considering the extensive powers that municipalities have to influence or even manipulate economies by the implementation of policies and rules it should even be demanded in democratic societies that politicians know and understand what the policies that they formulate consist of. To be able to predict the outcome of a policy, one must know the elements that it consists of. This is necessary to produce effective policies. This does not only concern economic growth theories, but other elements as well.

The results of the comparison of the strategies of the two municipalities that have experienced similar crises are also of interest. The results show that there are several similarities, and the differences are mainly different combinations of the presence of elements of the economic growth theories. This could indicate that these combinations could impact the outcomes as even though the cities have experienced similar crises, the situation of Detroit today is extreme. The study of the relationship between these combinations of economic growth theories and outcomes of policies is something that would be very interesting for future research. Additionally, studies that measure other elements of economy than economic growth
theories, or other theories for economic growth, would be interesting for the field of urban governance.

8. Bibliography

8.1 Books


Denk, Thomas (2002), Komparativ metod – förståelse genom jämförelse. Studentlitteratur, Lund


### 8.2 Journal Articles


8.3 Newspaper articles


8.4 Official documents


8.5 Online sources


Accessed on: 2012-05-09

http://www.riksdagen.se/sv/DokumentLagar/Forslag/Motioner/Norge-Vanerlanken_GF02T547/?text=true Accessed on: 2012-04-11

8.6 Working papers
