Racism on and off the Football field.

Racism and the responses to racism in German Football from the pre-digital era to the present.

Master's thesis (number of credits 30/45)
Author's name: Alexander Adu
Name of supervisor: Pontus Rudberg
Date of defence: 29.06.2022
Examiner: Lars M. Andersson
Semester: (e.g., Spring 2022)

Table of content

1　Introduction

The discussion of racism in football dates to the 1970s as three former West Bromwich Albion players shared their experience with the Guardian in 2014. Currently, racism has been acknowledged and to a certain degree and is being addressed by the Fédération Internationale de Football Association (FIFA). Interventions including organising campaigns that aimed at combating racism in and around the football fields have been instituted.[1] Aligning with campaigns of this nature, investigations have been done by the British Premier League claiming that arrests related to racism have been on the decline and only "a tiny percentage of the 13.4 million individual attendances over the course of the season" have been arrested for racial remarks around the football grounds.[2] Additionally, there are reports from the Culture, Media and Sport Committee in England stating how the football atmosphere in the context of racism has gone through an apparent change since the 1970s and 80s when racism allegedly was more common.[3] One of the objectives of this study is to scrutinize these claims regarding a decrease of racism in football through a study of the responses of players, fans and clubs on social media towards racist cases. Therefore, it is important to understand how racism was experienced and perceived in the pre-social media era and how the social media era impacted racism in German Football today. For example, in 1996 former German Chancellor Angela Merkel strictly refused to accept racism as a major problem in Germany. Therefore, Merkel dismissed and trivialised racist abuse as occasional incidents which were relevant only for Football Back and most of the measures taken were related to law and order but failed to address anti-racist action. Racism in German football seems much more refined than in other parts of Europe. Instead of chanting monkey noises, they have been replaced by codes which refer to the right-wing scene.[4] This gives firstly an impression of how racism was perceived before the 2000's. History proves that racism has always been there, but perhaps now social media has put into perspective how it manifests itself.[5] However, while racism has been acknowledged and addressed to a certain extent on a regional, national and international level,[6] new forms of venues and platforms have hindered

---

[1] Farrington, N., Hall, L., Kilvington, D., Price, J., & Saeed, A. (2014). Sport, Racism and Social Media (1st ed.). Routledge. P. 55-56.

[2] Ibid.

[3] Ibid.

[4] https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Racism_in_Germany. Accessed 14.05.2022.

[5] Wade, Peter (2010)The presence and absence of race. Patterns of Prejudice 44. P. 46.

progress to completely eradicate racism in the football environment.[7] Specifically, social media has provided an outlet for racist views and abuse to manifest itself.[8] An example of this is a research conducted by Kick it Out, English football's main antiracism and discrimination organization, who reported a total of 95, 000 discriminatory posts on social media directed at Premier League teams and players.[9] The same phenomenon has taken place in other countries as well where players have had to endure racial discrimination and abuse in social media. For example, during the FIFA World Cup 2018, Swedish player Jimmy Durmaz received a lot of hate and racial remarks after having caused what users on social media platforms deemed as a decision leading to Sweden losing the game against Germany.[10] Another example was when an open letter was written in 2020 by a fan meant for the German Bundesliga club Mainz 05, with the fan detailing how he got the impression that they were watching games at "the Africa Cup, instead of in the German Bundesliga" due to what the fan referred to as "uneven playtime" of the black players in comparison to the white players.[11] This led to the club posting a statement on social media and addressing the issue openly. The post gained traction and the club received negative feedback for posting the letter. This decision by the club to retort the racist remarks by the fan was appreciated by the black players of the club as well as the fans on social media.[12] This proves that social media can be a catalyst connecting football clubs and fans and an avenue to combat this prejudice behaviour. Studies have shown how, for example, that consumer engagement (i.e., football fans) in relation to football clubs is facilitated via social media.[13] Scholar Joanne Kuzma explores how football clubs use social media commercially, and shows how clubs do not use social media platforms to their fullest, with a wide disparity between different clubs.[14] Another study by scholar Jamie Cleland looks into how social media has added another dimension to

[6] Wachter, K. (n.d.). *Racism in Football – Football against Racism: The FARE Experience*. Un. Retrieved January 31, 2022, from https://www.un.org/en/chronicle/article/racism-football-football-against-racism-fare-experience

[7] Kefferputz, K. (n.d.). *Declaration of the European Parliament on tackling racism in football*. European Commission. Retrieved January 31, 2022, from https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/library-document/declaration-european-parliament-tackling-racism-football_en

[8] Bennett, H. & Jönsson, A. (2017). Klick it out: Tackling online discrimination in football. In Kilvington, D., Price, J. (Eds.), Sport and discrimination, London, England: Routledge. P. 203.

[9] Kilvington, D. and Price, J. (2019) 'Tackling Social Media Abuse? Critically Assessing English Football's Response to Online Racism', Communication & Sport, 7(1), P. 64–66.

[10] Christenson, M. (2018, June 24). *Sweden squad rally behind midfielder Jimmy Durmaz after racial abuse online*. The Guardian. Retrieved January 31, 2022, from https://www.theguardian.com/football/2018/jun/24/sweden-jimmy-durmaz-racial-abuse-germany-free-kick

[11] *No place for racism at Mainz 05*. https://www.mainz05.de/en/news/no-place-for-racism-at-mainz-05/. Zugegriffen 04. February 2022.

[12] Ibid.

[13] Aichner, Thomas. (2019). Football clubs' social media use and user engagement. Marketing Intelligence & Planning. 37. 242-257. 10.1108/MIP-05-2018-0155.

[14] Kuzma, Joanne et al. "A Study of the Use of Social Media Marketing in the Football Industry." (2014).

racist discourse in English football, describing how racist thoughts and ideas are allowed to flourish in message boards, although this is challenged by other anonymous fans.[15]

There have been several studies regarding racism in football, but these studies have failed to establish how social media has influenced football clubs in their roles as facilitators for racist remarks and statements targeting players. Specifically, there is a need to investigate further how social media can act as an enabler as well as an obstacle to racism in the context of football. Essentially, looking into the dual role of social media in the football community in the light of racism. This has only partly been investigated in the form of documentaries shedding light on racism in German football.[16] Therefore, in this study, racism and the responses to racism in German Football from the pre-digital era to the present are going to be investigated regarding its development and changes. More specifically, the research questions that this thesis will set out to address are the following:

● How was racism experienced and perceived in the pre social media era by football clubs, society, fans and in particular players?

● How has social media with its dual role acted as an influential factor for addressing racism against black people in German football clubs?

● From the different perspectives of players, clubs, fans, and society to what degree is social media providing new platforms for traditional prejudices or creating new forms of racism in football? To what degree is social media stopping racism?

● How does social media impact the club's anti-discrimination activities and policy?

This will be achieved primarily through an analysis of Interviews, a documentary, social media postings and the surrounding debate in the wake of racist statements on twitter.

According to a representative study by the Racism Monitor of the German Centre for Integration and Migration Research (DeZIM) from May 2022, racist views are widespread among the German population. 49 percent of the German population still believes in the existence of human "races". Furthermore, the "Mitte"-Studie by the Friedrich-Ebert-foundation from 2021 indicates that 6,4 percent of the population represent racist views based on ethnicity and descent.[17] Cases in the German Bundesliga indicated that racism does not only concern a certain group of Football players. There have been various forms of racism in Football such as anti-

[15] Cleland, J. (2014) 'Racism, Football Fans, and Online Message Boards: How Social Media Has Added a New Dimension to Racist Discourse in English Football', Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 38(5). P. 415–417.

[16] Adel, O. (2022, March 3). *Black eagles: Documentary sheds light on racism in German football*. Gettotext. Retrieved January 31, 2022, from https://gettotext.com/blBlackeagles:DocumentaryshedslightonracisminGermanfootballack-eagles-documentary-sheds-light-on-racism-in-german-football/?fbclid=IwAR2DEY7JZ5Cdp0ACM7DXkf1Iq5GXDpyQ5cSORupPwPUUGBWtIhyqY6ddCLc

[17] *Rassismus*. (n.d.). Mediendienst-Integration. Retrieved June 5, 2022, from https://mediendienst-integration.de/desintegration/rassismus.html

Asian racism, anti-Muslim racism and anti-Semitism. In many European countries such as England or Italy incidents proved that historically black people are more often affected by racist incidents than other ethnicities.[18] Incidents in German Football confirm that black players are more often victims of racist assaults too.[19] For that reason and the scope of this work, the thesis will focus on racism against black people.[20] However, in order to be able to show how racism has transitioned to social media and how it has changed the possibilities of both the awareness and combat of racism, this research will analyse the racism and responses it generated from the football world in Germany both before the breakthrough of social media in the early 2000s and after. For the pre-social media era, interview material and testimonies made by players in a documentary will be used and analysed with the A.O. Hirschman's classic model after which three case studies from the social media era will be conducted and then the findings of all the studies will be compared. In order to establish a clear scope for the study, definitions of racism, social media and other influential factors will also be presented, on which the subsequent discussion of the data is based. In order to explain racism and how it occurs in the digital world, it is necessary to discuss some of the key factors of how and where prejudice may be expressed. Furthermore, it is important to discuss the characteristics of the internet which may lead to disinhibition and affect expressions of racism. This includes anonymity and privacy, and the capacity to create and dissociate online and offline identities.[21] A presentation of the data in the shape of documentaries, autobiographies, available studies as well as observations made from interviews will be presented and discussed. Finally, the last chapter will summarise the findings with a discussion and pertaining conclusions.

---

[18] Lewis, P. (2021, November 21). *Cloudflare*. Lordslibrary Parliament. Retrieved June 3, 2022, from https://lordslibrary.parliament.uk/black-history-month-racism-in-football/

[19] Christenson, M. (2018, June 24). *Sweden squad rally behind midfielder Jimmy Durmaz after racial abuse online*. The Guardian. Retrieved January 31, 2022, from https://www.theguardian.com/football/2018/jun/24/sweden-jimmy-durmaz-racial-abuse-germany-free-kick

[20] *Rassismus-Vorfälle in Deutschland 2021*. (2021, December 20). Spox. Retrieved June 4, 2022, from https://www.spox.com/de/sport/fussball/2112/Diashows/rassismus-im-deutschen-fussball/opoku-union-berlin-lehmann-bellingham.html

[21] Farrington 2014. P. 48.

2 Previous Research

2.1 Race, racism, and German football

"Racism is like a Cadillac. the 1960 Cadillac doesn't look like the 1921 Cadillac, but it is still a Cadillac; it has simply changed form."[22] This quote by Malcom X refers to the change from a biological to a cultural racism. In an attempt to define racism, it is worth noting that there is no specific definition due to its various forms and usages. However, the present study does not aim to define and explain the different forms of racism. Rather, all forms of racism in the context of media and sports will be included and will use the definition of the term used by media and journalism scholars Daniel Farrington, Daniel Kilvington, John Price and Amir Saeed in their study of racism in sport-related social media as "any set of claims or arguments which signify some aspect of the physical features of an individual or group as a sign or permanent distinctiveness and which attribute additional negative characteristics and or consequences to the individual's group's presence." [23] Farrington et al also clarifies that racism is a type of discrimination, which excludes and devalues people because of their origin, skin colour, hair, name, or language. For example, Racism discriminates against people by building on the idea that there are different "races" of people and that there is a hierarchy among these "races".[24] Generally, it is commonly known and accepted that racism discriminates, disadvantages, marginalises a certain group of people. Especially during the period of European colonialism and imperialism. The term "race" has been used to justify the practices of colonialism, slavery, and the crimes of the Nazis. It is, today, also commonly accepted that the invention of human "races" is unscientific and wrong. There are no "races" among humans.[25] Researchers, scholars, academicians, and others have divergent views and assumptions when it comes to racism. One example of this assumption is "white supremacy" which explains that the white "race" is superior to others. Scholar Lori Kodi Lopez confirms this thought to be racism, but she also explains that it is an overall superficial and general definition to use. According to Lopez, understanding of the term racism is everywhere, and it is not only incarnated by a small number of individuals.[26] Sociologist Michael Omi also gives an instance whereby he classifies social schemes as racist, if they create structures of domination grounded on categories of race. According to Omi this definition forces us to look beyond our individual beliefs and attitudes and instead base our

---

[22] Lipsitz, George. "'Swing Low, Sweet Cadillac': White Supremacy, Antiblack Racism, and the New Historicism." American Literary History 7, no. 4 (1995): P. 713-714.

[23] Farrington 2014. P. 32.

[24] Ibid.

[25] Russo, Laura. Was ist Rassismus? Definitionen von Rassismus - humanrights.ch. https://www.humanrights.ch/de/ipf/menschenrechte/rassismus/dossier/was-ist-rassismus/. Accessed 13. February 2022.

[26] Lopez, Lori Kido, ed. Race and Media: Critical Approaches. NYU Press, 2020. P. 15.

understanding of racism "in the institutions and interlocking systems of domination and power that have long histories of contributing to the oppression of people of colour."[27] The Jamaican cultural theorist Stuart Hall identifies the foundations of racism in slavery, imperialism, economic exploitation of the native people by the Europeans. Although those practices may have ended, Hall points out that their traces are still noticeable and alive in contemporary views. The inequality and injustice of racism still shape the everyday life of people with different origin, skin colour and language.[28] Other scholars have concluded that although racism can take various forms and be defined in a number of ways, its objective is always dominance. It is a force that establishes, sustains and reinforces oppressive power relations between those defined racially or ethnically different.[29] Farrington also concludes that even though "race" might be an invention without having any clear biological foundation, it is still a present perception that affects interaction of people and a concept created to justify happenings in the world: "Much of the time is a useful process allowing us to simplify and understand the complexities around us."[30] He points out that it is in human nature to categorise very often unconsciously.[31]

The phenomenon of racism in football first became a subject of widespread concern in the 1970's with phenomena such as fan's racist chanting and abuse directed at football players. The first racist chants began in the 1970's and 1980's in England meanwhile racist behaviour reached its peak in Germany during the 1980's and 1990's.[32] In December 1990 former Bundesliga players Anthony Baffoe, Anthony Yeboah and Souleymane Sané wrote an open letter asking for solidarity in combating racism. These players have recently spoken out about their experience back then, how black players in stadiums were racially insulted every week, they were pelted with bananas and every ball touch were accompanied by monkey sounds. Thereby the fans imply that the black players are monkeys. Since then, a lot has changed for the better in German football, many curves have become more colourful places. Nevertheless, racism has not disappeared. It has not disappeared from the stadiums nor from the daily lives of black players.

In the introduction to the path breaking book *Race, Ethnicity and Football*, the editor, the British sociologist Daniel Burdsey, writes that "racism in football is much more than a matter of individual bigotry or occasional, spontaneous prejudice".[33] It is also, Burdsey explains, structural, or 'systemic', by which he means "a material, social, and ideological reality" which is embedded in the major societal institutions.[34] The use of racial categories frequently occurs in sports activities

---

[27] Ibid.

[28] Ibid. P. 15-16.

[29] Farrington 2014. P. 33.

[30] Ibid. P. 47.

[31] Ibid.

[32] Llopis-Goig, R. (2013). Racism, xenophobia, and intolerance in Spanish football: evolution and responses from the government and the civil society. Soccer and Society, 14(2), P. 263-264.

[33] Burdsey, D. (Ed.). (2011). *Race, Ethnicity and Football: Persisting Debates and Emergent Issues*. Routledge. P. 5.

[34] Ibid.

such as football. For example, there are racist assumptions over physical and intellectual abilities, which reinforces biological differences and racialized ideologies. Those racial theories aim to explain the alleged dominance of white over black athletes.[35] Moreover, in society and in sports particularly "race-thinking" is regarded as something that should neither be a criterion for recruitment, nor as something that should be present in stadiums. In theory this is a clear standpoint, but according to the sociologist Adrian Smith the practical implementation of this idea is challenging and problematic.[36] Racism in football means the abuse of players, fans and officials because of their skin colour, ethnicity, or nationality. There have been cases where individuals are being targeted. This occurred by racist chants, crowd violence on and off the pitch. Meanwhile, racist incidents on the field are perceived as irregular incidences which are caused by sporadic outbursts in sports, charged by competition and individual prejudice rather than structural or institutionalised racism.[37]

For example, in February 2021 the German football team Hertha BSC's player Jordan Torunarigha was racially insulted by the Schalke fan-block. After the second-round thriller between Schalke 04 and Hertha BSC, the result of the match faded into the background. Berliners complained about racist chants against their player.[38] In an official statement on the club's website, Schalke 04 explained that there is no room for racism in this club:[39] "On the part of the association, there is zero tolerance for such behaviour. We will do everything we can to identify those who are responsible for this and to prove them with consequences", the club's board members were quoted as saying: "Such behaviour does not only violate the atmosphere in the stadium, but also contradicts all the values of Schalke 04. We will respond with sanctions and report the incidents accordingly."[40] As we shall see, such statements and position-taking of German football clubs have not always come naturally. However, statements and apologies alone are not sufficient to fight racism at its roots. While those incidents take place it is striking that the fans of teams that are making racist remarks also have players in their club who have ethnical backgrounds that makes them possible targets of racist attacks.[41] According to the British historian Adrian Smith, from a historical lens the response within the world of football when

---

[35] Spracklen, Karl (2008) The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail: myths of scientific racism and the pursuit of excellence in sport, Leisure Studies, 27:2, 221-227,

[36] Ibid.

[37] Porter, D., & Smith, A. (Eds.). (2004). Sport and National Identity in the Post-War World (1st ed.). Routledge. P. 5-6.

[38] Bark, Marcus. „Rassistische Übergriffe gegen Herthas Torunarigha: „... dann kicken wir nicht weiter"". *Der Spiegel*, 5. Februar 2020. *www.spiegel.de*, https://www.spiegel.de/sport/fussball/jordan-torunarigha-von-hertha-bsc-rassistisch-beleidigt-dann-kicken-wir-nicht-weiter-a-d9368f1d-4b53-49a2-b234-d56a1b891187.

[39] „Torunarigha ‚hat geweint und wollte aufhören' - Schneiders klare Worte". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/torunarigha_hat_geweint_und_wollte_aufhoeren_schneiders_klare_worte-768895/artikel. Accessed 03. Mai 2022.

[40] Ibid.

[41] Ibid.

being associated with allegations of racism has always been denial: "denial that the problem exists at any significant level at individual clubs or amongst players, denial that there is a problem within the game more generally and, on occasion, denial that racism exists itself as a problem in society."[42] The hypothesis that racial inequality in football is a structural and institutional phenomena is extensively rejected, and one of the reasons why institutional racism in football is widely shunned, may be the inability of individuals to identify, acknowledge and finally exterminate racism.[43] Burdsey argues that the majority of football clubs and associations that play a significant role in anti-racist football movements, still have not found a sufficient approach for identifying and combatting racism: "it welcomes the presence of anti-racist organisations—most prominently Kick It Out and Football Against Racism in Europe—but simultaneously fails to acknowledge the extent to which racism actually continues to exist and the various ways in which it manifests itself."[44]

Various groups and associations such as Union of European Football Associations (UEFA) have attempted to combat the problem of racial discrimination in European football. The association held a seminar in Amsterdam which was supposed to encourage racial equality in the industry with 80 delegates including officials from UEFA and nine different national football federations as well as sports academics, NGOs, and fan activists from the Football Against Racism in Europe (FARE) network. The meeting gave opportunities for raising awareness, dialogue, and sharing of models of best practice. However, as the British sociologist Steven Bradbury notes "the extent to which federation-based attendees fully understood, accepted and have since expressed any sustained commitment to tackling the issues of institutional discrimination remains a moot point."[45] According to research, very little has changed irrespective of all these campaigns and anti-racist associations. Measurements such as financial penalties and stoppages of matches have been unsuccessful and the absence of commitment in the actions by institutions has been labelled as "non-performativity" of anti-racism in sport.[46] However, racism in football is evidently more recognized.[47]

2.2   History of Racism in German Football

It is not only violence that is a negative marginal phenomenon of football. Sport also deals with racism to varying degrees. There has been previous research for example by Johannes Gabler

---

[42] Porter, D., & Smith A., 2004. P. 5-6.

[43] Ibid.

[44] Ibid.

[45] Bradbury, S., 2013. Institutional racism, whiteness, and the under-representation of minorities in leadership positions in football in Europe. *Soccer and Society*, 14 (3). P. 23.

[46] Hylton, K (2010) How a turn to critical race theory can contribute to our understanding of 'race', racism and anti-racism in sport. International Review for the Sociology of Sport, 45 (3). P.10-11.

[47] Ibid.

who talked about xenophobic and racist behaviour within a fan scene. This chapter is going to discuss differences among fans. According to scholar David Zimmermann Football is not always the reason why certain fans go to the stadium. Further this chapter will discuss how the German fan scene was shaped by the society in the 1980s and how it was impacted by right wing groups. According to him, the fan scene reflects society. Just as xenophobic and right-wing extremist ideas are widespread in the society, so are xenophobic and right-wing ideas widespread in the fan scene. This is among the reasons that football is receptive to sexist and xenophobic tendencies. Football was and still is to a large extent shaped by men and traditionally male values.[48] When it comes to fans the scholar Zimmermann differentiates between different categories of fans. Firstly, he mentions the fans that are all about Football as sport and who identify with the club's values and norms. This is followed by fans who watch football as a form of entertainment, for whom football is not everything and can probably be exchanged for other activities. Lastly, he mentions the fan who is experience orientated, who attends every match but is usually critical and constructive towards the club and the performances of the players. But in comparison to many football-centric fans, who have a rather uncritical relationship to the club and players their objective is any form of violence, which includes racism. This important to understand in order to avoid generalization.[49]

However, Günther A. Pilz points out that racism has not disappeared, but occurs in an increasingly covert form. Openly staged racism and right-wing extremism are more likely to be expanded from the stadium to other places that are socially less controlled and regulated areas.[50]

In the 80s, the German fan culture within football was still shaped by the working class. In contrast to today, the lower and middle classes of the society were represented above as average.[51] Thereby, hooligans came into the focus of right-wing groups for the first time. Two of the first German fan clubs to attract attention with their right-wing extremist attitudes were the *Borussenfront* from Dortmund and the *Hamburger Löwen*. Especially the Borussia Front, founded by Siegfried "SS-Siggi" Borchardt, became infamous for becoming violent against migrants outside the stadium.[52]

In the course of this, more and more racist groups were formed. The Frankfurt fan clubs *Adlerfront* and *Presswerk* established close contacts with the banned terrorist group *Wehrsporttruppe Hofman*.[53] According to Scholars Wilhelm Heitmeyer and Jörg-Ingo Peter, the issues of racism in

---

[48] Zimmermann D. (2005) Fremdenfeindlichkeit und Rassismus bei Fussball-und Eishockey-Fans: Theorien, Strategien und Instrumente aus sozioprofessioneller Sicht. P. 48.

[49] Ibid, P. 8.

[50] Pilz A., Gunter, (2016) Rassismus und Fremdenfeindlichkeit im Fußballumfeld – Herausforderungen für die Prävention. Strategien der extremen Rechten, 2016, P. 564.

[51] Gabler, J. (2009). P. 86.

[52] Ibid.

[53] Ibid, P. 74.

football is the change of young football fans to right-wing groups.[54] Pilz regards the social hopelessness of young people, but also the right-wing attitudes that have always existed in football as a reason for its development since the 1980s.[55] The annual report of the central Information Centre for Sport (ZIS) confirmed an increase in the presence of right-wing extremist football fans in the 1st Bundesliga in the season 1999/2000 by about 8% and in the 2nd division by as much as 115%, due to the promotion or relegation of clubs with a comparatively high number of right-wing fans.

These were 12 first division and 11 second-division locations, in which a total of 620 people (400 in the 1st and 240 in the 2nd Bundesliga) were assigned to the right-wing scene.[56]

The commercialization of football in addition to the conversion of stadiums into modern arenas changed the problem of racism in German football. This is proved by the ZIS Annual Report for the Bundesliga 2008/2009 season. This season, in the 1st Bundesliga, a decline in right-wing football fans in the stadiums by almost 12% was recorded. In the second-highest league, only 111 (in the previous year 142) people were classified as right-wing extremists. In addition, it is confirmed that "the proportion of right-wing motivated violence potential in the violent scenes of both Bundesliga's is currently below five percent".[57] In addition, author Jonas Gabler stated that racism has declined in the first two leagues. According to him, another reason for this is that the hooligans have led to a "depoliticization" of the fan curves since many ultras and especially the capo, the leader of the fan curve, was often a student or a graduate. Furthermore, scholar Behn regards the composition of the teams as a possible reason for the decline in racism in German stadiums. The high decreased number of black players would lead to a reduction in racist chants against them, as the fans do not want to stand against their team. Zimmermann states that racist chants by fan groups with racist tendencies are used to weaken the opposition. It is always *we* against *them* and this thought is implemented by using discrimination and violence. However, this does not justify racist tendencies towards players, but it explains a reason.[58] However, scholar Sabine Behn also points out that that does not stop them from chanting monkey sounds against black players of the opposing team.[59] Those behaviours are mostly game-dependent. If your own team is behind, there are chants towards opposing players than if the

---

[54] Heitmeyer, W., & Peter, J.-I. (1988). *Jugendliche Fußballfans: soziale und politische Orientierungen, Gesellungsformen, Gewalt.* Weinheim [u.a.]: Juventa-Verl. P. 21.

[55] Dembowski, G., & Scheidle, J. (2002). *Tatort Stadion: Rassismus, Antisemitismus und Sexismus im Fußball* (1. Aufl.). Köln: PapyRossa-Verl. P. 195.

[56] Vgl. ZIS Jahresbericht Fußball Saison 1999/2000, S. 5. In: http://www.polizei-nrw.de/lzpd/stepone/data/downloads/0d/00/00/1999_00jahresbericht-kurz.pdf

[57] ZIS Jahresbericht Fußball Saison 2008/2009, S. 8. In: http://www.polizei-nrw.de/lzpd/stepone/data/downloads/63/00/00/2008-09jahresbericht-kurz.pdf.

[58] Zimmermann 2005, P.18.

[59] Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. (2006). Rassismus, Fremdenfeindlichkeit und Rechtsextremismus im Zuschauerverhalten und Entwicklung von Gegenstrategien. *Wandlungen des Zuschauerverhaltens im Profifußball,* P. 346.

team is playing well and is leading. Racism is increasingly expressed these days through hidden codes, as Pilz believes.[60]

For example, by wearing clothing brands such as .B. Thor Steinar, through which fans cannot make themselves liable to prosecution. According to Pilz, racism in German Football has partly shifted to the lower leagues and is increasingly appearing in away games, as the fans there are not under observation of the club.[61] Furthermore, the lack of fan projects in the lower-class leagues makes it easier to spread racist chants than in the first two professional leagues. According to Behn and Schwenzer, however, racist chants do not always have a xenophobic background. Among other things, such insults are also a medium to demonstrate power and mark the stadium as their territory.[62] The subtle racism in the Bundesliga is for example proved by the fact that the expectations on the performance of black players are sometimes significantly higher than on footballers from their own country as a fan stated in scholars Behn's work. "[63] In 2003 Prof. Gunter Pilz surveyed the image of the East German football fan, who seems to have a different attitude towards racism than other fans from other parts of Germany. According to the survey, 61.8% of the Hooligans from new federal states claimed that they would not ban racist and right-wing fans from their blocks if they make racist remarks. In comparison, only 11.8% affirm this claim. In contrast, 32.9% of ultras from the old federal states would actively defend themselves against those activities.[64] Furthermore, almost half of all fans surveyed in East Germany think that they would not intervene in the event of racist comments from their group. Almost 60% of the supporters of East German clubs even hold stadium bans due to racist remarks.[65] For sports journalist Gunter Pilz, these outcomes are particularly worrying for the reason that because clubs did not clearly position themselves against right-wing extremists then and racist tendencies are attracting the right-wings and encouraging them to openly express their political views there.[66] Among others, the given statistics proved that the willingness to intervene in incidents partly depends on the concerning part of Germany. Zimmermann concluded that racist remarks by fan groups with racist tendencies within a match are used to weaken the opposition. According to Behn those behaviours are mostly game-dependent. Thereby the fans make use of any means.

---

[60] Pilz, G. A., & Wölki, F. (2004). *Ultra-Szene in Deutschland (Teilstudie I im Rahmen des Gesamtprojekts "Wandlungen des Zuschauerverhaltens im Profifußball - Notwendigkeiten, Möglichkeiten und Grenzen gesellschaftlicher Reaktionen")*. Hannover: Universität Hannover / Institut für Sportwissenschaft. P. 17.
[61] Ibid.
[62] Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. 2006. P. 331.
[63] Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. 2006. P. 331.
[64] Ibid, P.122-122.
[65] Ibid.
[66] Ibid. P. 120.

2.2.1 Historical Perception of Immigration and Social Development in Germany

The "racist question" of a possible threat from the immigration of 'different' immigrants with a migration background has thus been a politically topical debate for about 120 years in Germany.[67] Especially the historical alleged ,contamination of the ,German race by foreign immigrants seems virtually timeless.[68] In particular the 21st century the European union plays a politically and socially significant role, this was caused due to the increased release of national sovereignty rights. Furthermore, the integration of a migration debate in Germany's recognition as a country of immigration plays an important role too.[69] The 'Gastarbeiter' (guest-worker) period in Germany during 1950's and 1960's for example indicated that immigration, migration, integrations policies and racism have always been on social and political agenda. In the 1990s, sociologist A. van Dijk detected the tendency towards a resurgent, but indirect spread of biologically, partly culturally justified racist motives in politics, the media and society. According to him the denial and trivialization of racism is one of the strategies to keep or "positive self-expression" in order to meet the alleged normative and value-based notions.[70] The media have therefore also played a significant role in the resurgence of racism in the 21st century. Media violence became impactful in the modern era, it popularizes with the help of "semantic tricks by spreading negative foreign representation of minorities as a threat or flood wave. The media have therefore also played a significant role in the resurgence of racism in the 21st century.[71] From a historical perspective according to Zuber colonialism would have been inconceivable without racism. During 19th century, colonialism and the associated nationalism created both the 'concept of race' and the original, pseudo-biologically based racism. Racism justified and legitimized colonization efforts. Therefore, even before the Federal republic of Germany was found in 1949 biologic racism was present socially and politically. In contrast to today's daily political life, the term 'race' was established, nowadays the biologically connoted term race is publicly and socially tabu.[72] The refugee movements of the post-war period and the increasing employment of foreign skilled workers industrial German companies allowed the subtle existing racist xenophobia to strengthen again. The guest-workers period could be seen as a racist continuation of the German policy on foreigners. For example, the predominantly forcibly conscripted Polish agricultural and industrial workers by Germany before 1933.[73]

---

[67] Ibid, P. 155.
[68] Ibid.
[69] Ibid, P. 74.
[70] Pilz 2016, P. 74.
[71] Ibid.
[72] Zuber, J. (2015). Gegenwärtiger Rassismus in Deutschland. P. 156.
[73] Ibid.

12

These imports of foreign workers were also marked by discrimination, devaluation, and exclusion by the German population. The policy on foreigners was interrupted by the radicalised and inhuman system of forced labour against "lower races" by the German Nazis.[74] The last consequences of this system show their remaining's in Germany's nowadays politics. There has still been no complete solution and compensation for the victims of the former forced labour.[75] Refugees and displaced people who returned home after World War II. and the founding of the Federal Republic of Germany were initially able to fill the labour gap in Germany that had arisen due to the citizens of working age who had fallen in the course of the war. More than 90% of the population growth between 1950 and 1960 was accounted for by the immigration of refugees and displaced persons, who represented a quarter of the total population of the Federal Republic of Germany in 1960.[76] Foreign workers would no longer have any disadvantages in terms of social and political concerns compared to the period before 1945. They enjoyed the same rights as the West German workers in terms of social policy. This was decided to distance Germany and German politics from the xenophobic agitations of the National Socialist past to prepare the Federal Republic's immigration and migration policy for a new social and international beginning. The reaction of the German citizens was not positive, which reinforced the racist tendencies within society. [77] Initially, the migration policy brought economic growth rates to the young republic. It was the period of the so-called "*Wirschaftswunder*" or (economic miracle) yet this was accompanied by an increasing defensive reaction towards the immigrants. This was due to the fact that the refugees and deported people were according to the biological race ideology still considered as Germans as they spoke the same German language. Therefore, it was impossible to talk about the protection of the race.[78] Xenophobic and racist violence manifested itself with the first economic decline since the founding of the Federal Republic of Germany in 1966 and 1967. When the first foreign guest workers were employed to cover the continuously increasing demand for labour of the Federal Republican economy, that was when direct racist exclusion and devaluation phenomena restrained from defensive tendencies. Although foreign workers were regarded as an economic compensation instrument new fears of unemployment in the federal republican arose within the society. The admission of foreign workers was only admitted by the government on the condition that they would only stay in the Federal Republic of Germany for a short-term economic temporary support. Those were marked by alleged strong competition from

---

[74] Ibid, P. 157.
[75] Ibid.
[76] Ibid, P. 157.
[77] Ibid, P. 159.
[78] Ibid.

the guest workers as well as well-known prejudices, such as the alleged danger of an increasing foreign infiltration of the Federal Republican society.[79] With this knowledge, one can identify a rather ambivalent approach and a less exemplary view of the population can be observed. It is still problematic to consider racist beliefs or tendencies.[80] However, the problem that was not considered was, that many migrant workers made no effort to return to their home countries. Turkish immigrants in particular were motivated to stay in Germany.[81] According to sociologist Johannes Zuber on a political level, there has been a mistake with the term *Guest-worker*. The term implies that guest-workers are only those who do not stay permanently. Zuber argues that German politics were thereby jointly responsible for the increasing public xenophobic and open racist tendencies within the course of immigration and guest-workers.[82] Even a large part of the political level was against the permanent settlement of immigrants in the Federal Republic of Germany, which makes it more obvious that a country's citizen will implement those structures as Zuber explains.[83]

This newly emerging racism was triggered by a misguided and non-optimal organized economic and foreign policy. The political change builds a foundation for the reintroduction of subliminal racism. This caused social exclusion and devaluation of the guest-workers in the politics in Germany. The policies intended to prevent the workers from settling in permanently. At the same time, they were not regarded as guest-workers anymore, but rather 'foreigners' (Ausländer).[84]

This term implies that they are not part of the Federal Republican society anymore, which indicates a political forced exclusion and discrimination.[85] From now on Citizens implemented increased Hostility in their contact with people from other countries. According to Zuber, this can be regarded as racism. The society started to implement terms from the biologistic racist past. The terms included *native*, *foreign* and *Germans*. During the 1970s a discussion about foreign employment arose in Germany on a political and social level. Meanwhile, the employment of foreign workers caused several problems such as the tension between Germans and foreigners. The society had anxieties about their future and existence due to the foreign workers.[86] It showed that the biologically connoted racism thus still partly existed in the following decades of World War II. During the 1980s and 1990s President then Helmut Kohl traced a policy which focused on immigration and migration policy. Those were themes of the election campaign in 1987. He

---

[79] Ibid.
[80] Ibid, P. 158-159.
[81] Ibid, P. 157-158.
[82] Ibid.
[83] Ibid, P. 158-159.
[84] Ibid, P. 160.
[85] Ibid. 160-161.
[86] Ibid, 161-162.

14

still followed the path that the Federal Republic of Germany was not a so-called country of immigration.[87] But Since the change of the migration policy at the end of the 1990s, which was favoured by the change of government from black-yellow to red-green, it has prevailed that immigrants in Germany are not "guests", but remain permanently and that their children grew up in Germany are Germans despite the foreign origin of their parents. Unlike in the past, children born in Germany have automatically become Germans since the reform of the citizenship law in 2000. The hurdles for the naturalisation of persons of foreign origin living in Germany have been significantly lowered. One consequence of these reforms is that society is no longer divided into "Germans" and "foreigners" in public discourse.[88]

Initially, the phenomenon of racism in Europe was first considered as expired at the end of colonization. In the 21st century, however, one can still clearly identify racist tendencies across European nations and their societies. Especially the new development of racist political styles in many European countries has helped the racism phenomenon to a revitalized it's significance. According to Zuber Questions about immigration and race seems to have gained a new meaning in politics and society.[89] This showed that the trend of so-called Right-wing populism within the 1990s indicates the regained relevance of racism in European countries society's but especially in Germany. It can be understood as a right-wing movement, which is focused on taking up latent and openly mobilising antipathy in the population and heating them emotionally and consequently making political capital out of them. Right-wing populism, therefore, adapts the long tradition of racism in a new, modernised guise and re-establishing it in broad areas in societies of European countries.[90] Scientist Zuber pointed out that the devaluation of certain groups of people is made within right-wing populism by devaluating and discriminating against them. The new phenomenon of racism brought a modified version of racism which adapted to current needs, but the alleged motives are the same.[91] Today's racism is formed from the economic, financial and euro crisis, a certain racist tradition of European society and a partially institutionalized structure of social and political discrimination against immigrants. Immigrants were regarded as 'threats' that take jobs away and endanger them, especially against the background of existing unemployment or even in times of economic crisis. An antipathy could be observed when the economic crisis in Greece, Italy etc. was going on. Citizens see competitors in the increased migration from crisis regions to Germany thereby they start to build prejudice.[92] The lack of political, economic, and cultural explanation within those prejudice causes the fall

---

[87] Zuber Ibid, P. 162.
[88] https://www.bpb.de/shop/zeitschriften/izpb/298556/migrationsgesellschaft-deutschland/Acessed 13.06.2022
[89] Ibid, P. 162-163.
[90] Betz, Hans-Georg (1998): Rechtspopulismus: Ein internationaler Trend? in: Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte, Beilage zur Wochenzeitung Das Parlament, B 9-10, 3-12, Bonn, S. 5.
[91] Ibid, P. 190-191.
[92] Zuber, P. 207.

back on biological race theories and simple science as a basis for legitimation. Zuber explains that the number of subliminal racist tendencies within the society is worrying. Many Citizens use subliminal strategies to cover their racist thoughts. He believes that racism does not occur as always obvious as it used to in the past.[93] However, the socially hidden racism phenomenon appears even more problematic and threatening for politics and society, as it is difficult to identify and to combat preventively. The new social racism in comparison to the past manifests itself by a trivialized concept of xenophobia such as a higher innate crime rate, lower productivity, lower cognitive abilities and much more.[94] Thus, this makes clear that the stranger serves as an ideal scapegoat for personal fears. It also showed that within the post-war era in 1945 and the modern era, racism is thus constructed, placed, stabilized, and reproduced institutionally, but also by the lower population.[95]

2.3   Media and Racism

In the digital era it can be observed that social media contributes to the spread and reinforcement of racism. Due to the social and political power the media are considered the fourth power. The Media create social conflicts and problem situations as an important everyday discourse. They provide prefabricated, disregarded, and prejudiced opinions and interpretation offers for the media-consuming population.[96] In this context, it must be stated that media violence has a direct share of responsibility for the dissemination and reproduction of the current phenomenon of racism. It is triggered by the "sensations lust" and the desire for entertainment of the media-consuming citizens. This benefits populist circles, especially when it comes to such sensitive topics as racism and xenophobia. With short headlines, latent xenophobic and racist attitudes can be reinforced.[97] Furthermore, the tabloid media in particular support the social debate about 'good' or 'bad' immigrants in a populistic way by outlining symbolically a threat posed by the alleged 'alienation' by immigrants from abroad.[98] A Statistic conducted in 1995 identified an increasing trend in the foreign population in the Federal Republic of Germany to about 7.2 million people. The proportion of the population of the foreign population rose to about 8.9 per cent only until 1995. A short deviation was spotted between 1990 and 1991 due to the reunification of Germany.[99] However, Zuber brought out that since 1991 there has been a

---

[93] Ibid.
[94] Zuber, P. 207-208.
[95] Ibid, P. 210-211.
[96] Ibid.
[97] Zimmermann 2005, P. 20.
[98] Ibid, P. 213-215.
[99] Ibid, P. 202.

16

stagnation of number of foreign citizens within the Federal Republic of Germany. On the other hand, it can be proved that between the years 2006 and 2010, both the number of foreign people in Germany and their share of the population dropped to about 6.8 million and 8.2 per cent respectively.[100] Considering the background of today's demographic change in the German society, foreign citizens have become even more important to the Federal Republic's economy. It is striking that without them, Germany's role model function would not be possible. Especially after the ongoing economic and fiscal crisis developments since 2007/2008, it became obvious that the outstanding economic position would hardly be possible without the impact of foreign workers. Thus, the effects of support from foreign citizens on the German economy were and are still consistently impactful in the 21st century. The foreign population has developed into a permanent and supportive component of Germany.[101]

2.4   Social media and the football clubs

In order to define social media, we have to understand the context, growth and its use of it before adjusting the definition to the purpose of this work.[102] Generally speaking, social media means the variety of platforms, which also includes among other blogs, forums, business networks, photo sharing, social gaming and virtual worlds.[103] Social media was designed as a tool to connect people with common interests. According to Aichner, this expanded to creating and sharing user-generated content in 2010.[104] In several works of the last 25 years there have been various definitions of social media. The various definitions can be due to the reason that the understanding and interpretation of social media varies during the different periods. This has the disadvantage that researchers for example have difficulties to define it.[105] Social media means a form of communication which is based on the Internet. Social media refers to websites and applications that focus on communication, community-based response as well as the sharing of contents. Scholar Clay Shirky for instance describes social media as a platform which is focused on the user.[106] Social media offers the opportunity for users to stay in touch and communicate with family and friends, etc. Product marketing is another social media benefit. Many Businesses are presented on various social media platforms, they use it to promote their product, to engage

---

[100] Ibid, P. 202-203.

[101] Ibid, p. 202-203.

[102] Farrington 2014. P. 7.

[103] Aichner, Thomas, Grünfelder M., Maurer O., 2021. P. 215.

[104] Ibid. P. 220.

[105] Aichner 2021. P. 215.

[106] Farrington 2014. P. 6-7.

with their customers and to reach more range. It helps to improve the business by receiving feedback about certain products or events, for instance.[107] Among others, social media enables its users to connect with friends, discover new ideas, trends and build up your business and audience. Farrington argues that there is a performative part in all social media platforms.[108] Whether as a private person, artist, entrepreneur, or athlete, one can just share it and yet others will repost it. By sharing a photo for example, the intent could be to convey a message about their status or condition. According to the scholar, Twitter is even more performative. It is not only there to communicate but also to inform about live events such as nature catastrophes or in a situation where a group of individuals is threatened [109] A change of communication can therefore be identified within social media when people communicate about breaking news. Information is now available to the public, and it can be used to inform and spread awareness.[110] According to previous research conducted by the previously mentioned media and journalism scholars Daniel Farrington, Daniel Kilvington, John Price, and Amir Saeed, social media platforms are ultimately vehicles aimed to contribute to the financial success of businesses. Thus, they emphasise that consumer engagement becomes a key variable in assessing the economic impact of social media activities initiated and carried out by companies, including Football Clubs.[111] Certainly, social media has taken place online before the great breakthrough of large platforms like Facebook and Twitter, but at that time it was distributed through a business-related platform and nor was it a medium which was used by companies to communicate.[112] With the early 2000's the usage of social media and its activity started to grow. The amount of data which became possible to share just grew rapidly. Concurrent activities which were known to take place in the physical world such as shopping, dating, or filling started to take place digitally.[113] For users it is very beneficial as they get the opportunity to share their experiences, which the business can respond to. Furthermore, he describes it as a *tool* to create, share, comment and interact with another.[114] According to Farringdon et al, social media can be seen as online facilitators or enhancers of human networks, "enabling webs of people that promote connectedness as a social value"[115] as it has the capacity to break down barriers between supporters and players, they state, referring to the fact that while professional sportspeople are

---

[107] Ibid.

[108] Ibid. P 10-11.

[109] Ibid.

[110] Ahmed, W., Bath, P. and Demartini, G. (2017) Chapter 4 Using Twitter as a Data Source: An Overview of Ethical, Legal, and Methodological Challenges. In: Woodfield, K., (ed.) The Ethics of Online Research. Advances in Research Ethics and Integrity (2). Emerald. P. 2.

[111] Aichner, T. (2019), "Football clubs' social media use and user engagement", Marketing Intelligence & Planning, Vol. 37 No. 3. P. 245.

[112] Ibid.

[113] Ibid.

[114] Farrington 2014. P. 6.

[115] Ibid.

18

willing to make use and expand their personal brands, they are also made more tangible than they used to be. Compared to more traditional platforms, social media has made it possible for sportspeople to directly reach their fans.[116] The Marketing scholar Thomas Aichner's article *"Football clubs' social media use and user engagement"* measures and compares to which degree social media is used by the football clubs and evaluates the differences in user engagement with commercial social media advertisement targeting football fans, based on the advertisements' appeal. Aichner's aim was to further the understanding of consumer engagement in social media. According to his study, the digital era has shown that social media is indispensable for companies, brands, or football clubs etc. nowadays. They all have in common that their aim is to engage customers, fans, or followers, but also to interact with them. Engagement itself is valuable to companies because it positively affects consumer purchase intentions, Aichner argues.[117] It is also important for the marketing managers and football clubs to know about the social media utilisation in order to identify their weaknesses, strengths and improvements compared to their competitors.[118] As a business or Football club it is necessary to understand the behaviour of the users in order to merchandise the Club and its products. There is no team in the major football leagues that does not own a social media platform or channel on Instagram, Facebook, or YouTube etc. The large amount of interest in football on those platforms is also reflected by the user's engagement.[119] Sport fans, and especially football fans, have a special relationship of social and cultural attachment to their favourite team. Aichner describes three social media encounters of the fans: user-generated content, content generated by football clubs and content generated by other companies. Fans generally prefer to engage in social media platforms that they can use to interact with each other, the fan community, and the team.[120] What sort of postings the clubs mattered less, according to Aichner. Regardless of goals, private news, or emotional postings – fans will comment, like or share them as often as possible.[121] In this study, Twitter is going to be used as the social media platform for analysis. One of the reasons for the use of Twitter is that its data is accessible.[122] According to Farrington, Twitter is also known to be more performative than Facebook.[123] Twitter has been described by previous researchers as "a microblogging platform that acts as a medium for the flow of information where users can post updates and subscribe to other users, known as following, in order to receive updates or microblogs from

---

[116] Ibid. P. 7.

[117] Aichner, T. 2019. P. 242-257.

[118] Ibid, P. 242-243.

[119] Ibid.

[120] Ibid. P. 244.

[121] Ibid.

[122] Ahmed 2017. P. 3.

[123] Farrington 2014. P. 10-11.

other users."[124] Twitter quickly separated itself from traditional media providers as the first broadcaster of breaking news about escalating situations. The platform provides a few key functions.[125] The postings on Twitter are called tweets, short messages which are authored by a user and sent to the public via twitter's home page or app. The user's text message is reduced to 140-character text messages that can contain various information about activities, news or just a state of mind.[126] It is its limits that makes twitter appealing and interesting. Pithy, sharp statements and breaking new flashes is what makes Twitter.[127]

Another function of the platform is the hashtag, which can be explained as a platform convention to indicate user defined topics. The intention is to show the topic of communication for example #Brexit.[128] In connection to that, users have the possibility to *reply* to the tweet by clicking that reply button in order to respond to the post of the author. If the user wants to reply to a specific comment of a user, one has to mention him with '@' sign. This function acknowledges the user and also enables the user to react to a retweet with a comment. Consequently, it is possible to repost the original tweet and comment and it by tagging the author: @Uuserhandle I agree.[129]

A trend on Twitter is to use a keyword or hashtag of a topic which is popular at the moment.

The platform provides a list of topics that are currently trending based on the particular keywords the users apply.[130] In order for researchers to get in touch with data from Twitter they can use several software applications such as Application Programming Interface to retrieve the data from Twitter. Software applications such as the above mentioned are more accessible as compared to other social media platforms, which attracts more researchers for academic work.[131] In comparison to Twitter, Facebook makes it simpler to trace conversations which enables the user to look up tweets. Tweets can also appear within a search on google. Facebook is more known to be a private platform and the number of posts which appear in google search results. According to the scholar Purohit, Facebook provides more privacy regulations than Twitter.[132] Researchers have noted that the platform seems to attract more research due to its cultural status. It is widely used by journalists both as sources and a channel to distribute breaking news. Postings on Twitter receive much media attention because celebrities, politicians, and sports stars

---

[124] Ahmed 2017. P. 3.

[125] Farrington 2014. P. 9-10.

[126] Purohit, H., Hampton, A., Shalin, V. L., Sheth, A. P., Flach, J., & Bhatt, S. (2013). What kind of #conversation is Twitter? Mining #psycholinguistic cues for emergency coordination. Computers in Human **Behaviour**, 29(6), 2438-2447.

[127] Farrington 2014. P. 9-10.

[128] Purohit, H., Hampton 2013. P. 2440-2446.

[129] Farrington 2014. P. 9-10.

[130] Ibid. P. 3.

[131] Ibid. P. 9-10.

[132] Ahmed, 2017. P. 5.

20

often tweet about current events, and some tweets may be controversial and are therefore reported in the news.[133]

Blogging and the commercial background which changed from *search* to *social* contributed to our understanding of what we now know as social media.[134] Instagram, Facebook, and Twitter are among others the most popular platforms where online interactions take place.[135] (Chaffey, 2016; Macy, Mejova, & Weber, 2015). Though, Twitter is one of the most researched platforms in regard to academic research.[136] Compared to other social media platforms such as Facebook, Twitter is more effective when there is a need to investigate the utilisation of data-sources during an emergency circumstance for example.[137] Partly, this is due to the fact that it is more open and accessible than other platforms.[138] Researchers have also noted that it is possible to use the data from Twitter to monitor political events, disasters, and health problems in real time. It has also been used to provide information and support to people at the time and place when most needed.[139] Twitter as a platform can play a significant role in the pre-incident activity close to the real-time notification of an occurring incident. It can provide first-hand reports.[140] Based on quoted Tweets, the posts can be traced back to the individuals who initially tweeted it. Scholars use data from Twitter to gain a better knowledge of how people utilise social media in particular circumstances. The scholars point out that despite the fact that Twitter is open and accessible for everybody, users are not aware of the publicity of their post. They are open and accessible for analysis. It is not uncommon that Tweets get reposted and cited by other media such as newspapers after an event arose.[141]

---

[133] Ibid. P. 5-6.

[134] Farrington 2014. P. 9-10.

[135] Ahmed 2017. P. 4.

[136] Weller, Katrin & Kinder-Kurlanda, Katharina. (2015). Uncovering the Challenges in Collection, Sharing and Documentation: The Hidden Data of Social Media Research? P. 30.

[137] Ahmed 2017. P. 3.

[138] Ibid. P. 5.

[139] Ibid. P. 3.

[140] Ibid.

[141] Ibid. P. 3.

3   Theoretical framework

3.1   Exit, voice and loyalty

In 1970, the economist Albert O. Hirschman in his now classic *Exit, voice, and loyalty: responses to decline in firms, organisations, and states* presented a theoretical model describing the three basic possible responses to decline in firms or polities (quitting, speaking up, staying quiet). The framework, which is multifunctional and has been applied to various topics such as political parties, businesses, interest groups and personal relationships, will also serve as the theoretical framework for which the findings of this study will be analysed and presented.

The model implies that when members of an organisation have a reasonable exit threat and the organisation is dependent on its members, organisations are less likely to act against their members. The present study is using Hirschman's categories of responses, exit*, voice, and loyalty* (which basically means quitting, speaking up, or staying quiet). In the context of the thesis, these responses will be applied to the sources, which are testimonies given in a documentary film, an interview, and social media postings by clubs, players, fans, and other users. Based on the source material, I will analyse the correlation between the different responses of the different actors in the German football world. Whereby I am going to use protesting by the fans as a voice. *Exit* will be used as possible a withdrawal by the fans from the club if they do not respond to their claimed demands. However, there is also a third option, which is to stay quiet in order to show what is perceived as loyalty to the team, club, and its leadership, or fanbase.

The basic idea of the model is that for example, members of an institution whether they are members of a union, organisation, or a business (or football players or supporters) have two main actions when they perceive a loss or change in disadvantage of the member. Members have the choice either to exit, which means to exit the relationship, or they can use their *voice* to boycott, claim or just try to improve the situation.[142] Within an employment relationship, an employer has the choice to quit and complain about an unsatisfying job or they can try to improve the situation. Dissatisfied customers can decide to do their groceries shopping elsewhere or to complain. But due to revenue drops for instance the board of the grocery shop is forced to investigate the errors which finally leads to exits.[143]

Hirschman explains that there is a correlation between exit and voice. He believes that those two actions can be used to scale a decrease in a company or organisation. Voice is usually more meaningful than exit: "The voice is the only option in which dissatisfied customers or members can react whenever the exit option is unavailable."[144] Hirschman refers to situations within social organisations like the family, the church, or the state. If one does not take advantage of exit, then

---

[142] Hirschman, Albert. *Exit, Voice, and Loyalty.* [Edition missing]. 1972. Reprint, Harvard University Press, 1972. P.21.
[143] Ibid. P. 4.
[144] Ibid. P. 33.

one must use voice especially if there is no given alternative for an exit.[145] Voice can include praise, complaints, critique and is, therefore, more helpful for the organisation. Meanwhile, an exit is a cautioning sign of a threatening decline. To reduce or even avoid exit, the institution can provide room for improvement and criticism. If this is not provided institution members have the option to leave the relationship or to accept the given situation. According to Hirschman's understanding, the less chance of availability of an exit there is, the less it is to be expected from members to take advantage of their voice. In vice versa for example if customers regard voice as effective the possibility of exit gets shifted away. But exit will most likely always be the last reaction when voice is unsuccessful, as Hirschman explains the correlation between those actions (i.e., voice and exit).[146] I will argue that the same is true for the relation between football clubs and their players and fans. For example, in the German football club FSV Mainz 05, a former fan and club member chose to "exit" the football club due to an alleged high number of black players in the starting eleven. The board welcomed his decision to leave the club as a fan as they do not tolerate discrimination in any form.[147]Now Hirschman introduces the third response: possibility loyalty. He believes that loyalty can impact the choice of whether choosing to exit or voice since the member must consider the worthiness of the possible outcome. In an organisation where strong loyalty by members is to be found, chances for a possible exit are mostly low. According to the available body of knowledge, they are also low due to the lack of appealing alternatives. This could be a small job market or any other financial hurdles for instance. From the perspective of my study, one could assume that exiting the supported football club after an incident is not as easy because a fan has a social relationship with his supported club.[148] However, the devotion of loyal football fans can be built up if they have a voice. Finally, Hirschman states that the understanding of the correlation between exit and voice and the interaction with the loyalty level can generate better ways and means to address the concerns and matters of their fans. This could eventually lead to improvement. Misunderstanding these relations have the consequence of leading to reduction and error within the organisation.[149] Exit proves that it drives out voice, yet the voice is very important to organisations.

According to Hirschman, competitive business, by nature, includes the maintenance of performance. This, in turn, relies on a majority on exit and a small number on voice:[150] "(…) the likelihood of voice increases with the degree of loyalty."[151] Fans with a strong bond to their

---

[145] Ibid. P. 34.

[146] Ibid. P. 37.

[147] https://www.mainz05.de/en/news/no-place-for-racism-at-mainz-05/?fbclid=IwAR0P66UHfF2L-9rDk0cH_apmiQI-jb9837YnVhDP1zAdMwXWrP3POy4UXgA. Accessed 23 February 2022.

[148] https://www.planet-wissen.de/gesellschaft/psychologie/fans/index.html. Accessed 23 February 2022.

[149] Hirschman 1972. P. 76.

[150] Ibid. P. 76.

[151] Ibid. P. 77.

Football club for instance, will try to make their voice heard when he believes the navigated direction is wrong according to his opinion. "As a rule, then, loyalty holds exit at bay and activates voice", Hirschman writes.[152] This quote points out that even though there might be dissatisfaction with the management, a member can keep his loyal role without having any impact, as long as he or she believes in the improvement of the given bad situation.[153]

In regard to his club, a fan might exit from a club but likely might not join a new one due to the connection the person has to the football club.[154] Out of all introduced three concepts, Hirschman describes loyalty as a main concept because loyalty keeps them closer to the football club and therefore voice gets used more often when needed, compared to exit. On the other hand, loyalty is helpful because it indicates the disloyalty of a member to his organisation. Even though members are heavily loyal, there is still a threat of exit by the loyalists. Before the fans exit, he will make sure that every possibility was taken before he takes the consequences.[155]

As mentioned, Hirschman explains that exit and voice can be used to change negative developments in an organisation. For example, unhappy football fans can express their dissatisfaction with their club online via social media. The clubs are dependent on the fans because they are both their most important source of income as well as they are a part of the game itself. Football is a game which is driven by emotion. The club is dependent on their fans as they are dependent on ticket revenues, corporations, and advertisers. Psychology scholars who have studied the emotions of fans have noted that fans, especially on match-days, experience many different emotions related to their teams, like the excitement after a remarkable win or the frustration of a championship loss. Therefore, emotions shape fan behaviour and impact participation, engagement, consumption of merchandising, and match attendance.[156]

Voice can not only be used by fans. While trying to combat discrimination, players can use their figure and use their voice to address certain problems in and around the game. A statement can be brought up on social media with a post or after an interview. To stand up for something as a professional football player is not that riskless. Certain topics such as politics and discrimination for instance are not easy to address. Furthermore, as a club they make usage of their voice to show loyalty and show positioning in relation to an incident.[157] For example, the British Premier League football club Arsenal F.C. distanced itself from comments shared on-line by their former German player Mesut Özil in which he takes a position and disdained the persecution of the Muslim Uighur's population by China. One can only assume that Arsenal F.C. distanced itself from its player out of business and commercial interest. In a statement published in the press the

---

[152] Ibid. P. 78.

[153] Ibid.

[154] Ibid. P. 81.

[155] Ibid. P. 83.

[156] Shakina E, Gasparetto T and Barajas A (2020) Football Fans' Emotions: Uncertainty Against Brand Perception. Front. Psychol. 11:659. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2020.00659. P. 1-2.

[157] Hirschman 1972, Reprint. P. 34.

club declared: "The content published is Özil's personal opinion. As a football club, Arsenal has always adhered to the principle of not involving itself in politics."[158] Relating this incident to the Hirschman model, it is not unlikely that the club leadership refused to use their voice in this case due to the fact that they would risk important Chinese partnerships which in turn could cost them important revenues for the club.[159] A similar scenario could be observed during the FC Bayern Munich annual general meeting on 25 November 2021 where among other questions, the club's partnership with Qatar Airways was discussed. Qatar's treatment of foreign workers in the country before the upcoming World Cup that the country hosted had been the object of heavy international criticism. 77. 8% of the club's members voted for the club to align with the internationally acknowledged human rights' standards, a decision which would mean that they would have to terminate the clubs' partnerships with the Qatar Airline after expiration of the contract in 2023.[160] The club CEO Oliver Kahn, however, defended the deal which did not please the fans, but continued to heat up the situation. The gathered fans chanted: "we are Bayern, and you are not", and "Hainer out", referring to Bayern Munich president Herbert Hainer.[161] Reportedly, the deal with Qatar Airlines secures the club 20 million euros yearly, for five years. Moreover, the club uses the airline for their annual winter training camp. The example indicates that FC Bayern failed to respond to club members' demand to end the sponsorship deal over human rights concerns. However, the club board promised to provide room for communication regarding this topic and added that there is still no decision on the future of Qatar sponsorship. However, it also stressed that the current contract would be fulfilled.[162]

These two examples show how voice can include praise, complaints, and criticism that can be an important and powerful tool for the fan-clubs. Meanwhile, exit is a cautioning sign of a threatening decline. In order to avoid or reduce the risk of exit, the football clubs must listen to critics and provide room for improvement. If this is not provided, fans have the option to accept the conditions or resign from the club membership which can cause painful financial damages for the club.[163] The two examples also show the clubs' difficulties in taking a position in situations in which standing up for human values are risking their relations to their business-partners.

As mentioned also, Hirschman's model stipulates that the less availability the members have of an exit, the less they are inclined to take advantage of voice. However, if they regard voice as effective there is very little need of an exit. Exit is generally only used as a last option, when voice

---

[158] Ames, Nick. „Arsenal Distance Themselves from Mesut Özil Comments on Uighurs' Plight". *The Guardian*, 13. Dezember 2019. *The Guardian*, https://www.theguardian.com/football/2019/dec/13/arsenal-distance-themselves-from-mesut-ozil-comments-china-uighur-people. Accessed 02. March 2022.

[159] Hirschman 1972. P. 34.

[160] https://www.sportspromedia.com/news/bayern-munich-agm-qatar-airways-deal-kahn-hainer-2022-fifa-world-cup/ Accessed 03. March 2022.

[161] Ibid.

[162] Ibid.

[163] Hirschman, 1972. P. 37.

is unsuccessful.[164] An unusual example of the phenomena is when a former club member of the German Bundesliga football club FSV Mainz 05, once exited the football club due to, in his opinion, an alleged high number of black players in the starting eleven. The board welcomed his decision to leave the club as a fan, as they do not tolerate discrimination in any form.[165]

In a football club with strong loyalty from members and fans, the chance of exits is generally low. However, they are also low due to the lack of attractive alternatives for the fans.[166] However, the devotion of loyal fans can be built up if they are given the room for voice as in above mentioned, but the voice has to be heard and considered too.

Finally, Hirschman states that the understanding of the correlation between exit and voice and the interaction with the loyalty level can generate better ways and means to address the concerns and matters of members (or fans in this case), this could eventually lead to improvement. When those relations are misunderstood it can have negative consequences for the club, like a drop of the number of fans in the stadium during games. Exit proves that it drives out voice, yet voice is very important to Football clubs. Fans with a strong bond to their Football club, for instance, will try to make their voice heard when they believe the navigated direction is wrong.[167] A fan may exit from a club but will probably not join a new one, due to the connection the person had to the former football club. Out of the three concepts in the model, loyalty is the key because it keeps the members (the fans) closer to the football club and therefore voice gets used more often when needed compared to exit. This can be observed when it comes to high ticket prices. A fan will boycott the ticket prices and eventually stop going to the stadium. Yet they will still follow the matches on television. The boycott should thus be seen as a form of voice rather than an exit. However, even when fans are very loyal there is still a threat of exit, but before they do, they will make sure that there are no other options. As Hirschman writes: "So far it has been shown how easy availability of the exit option makes the recourse to voice less likely. Now it appears that the effectiveness of the voice mechanism is strengthened by the possibility of exit."[168] Loyalty can delay exit, reinforces voice and therefore, it can save a football club's and organisations from the dangers of an exit.[169]

---

[164] Ibid.

[165] *No place for racism at Mainz 05*. https://www.mainz05.de/en/news/no-place-for-racism-at-mainz-05/. Accessed 02. January 2022.

[166] WDR. *Psychologie: Fans*. 15. Juli 2019, https://www.planet-wissen.de/gesellschaft/psychologie/fans/index.html. Accessed 02. February 2022.

[167] Hirschman 1972. P. 78.

[168] Hirschmann 1972. P. 83.

[169] Ibid. P. 92

3.2   Racism in a digital world

It is true that social media platforms such as Facebook, Instagram or Twitter can be very useful for connecting, making aware, discovering new ideas, trends and building up a business and audience. As previous research has noted, there is a performative part in all social media platforms. Whether someone is an artist, entrepreneur, or athlete, one can just share something and yet others will repost and comment on it. In fact, it provides users to be closer, updated and connected about occurrences about their favourite football player or club for example.

It breaks down the barrier between supporters and players.[170] However, the usage of social media comes with a lot of challenges.[171] For instance, many users use the platform to spread hate speech and discriminating comments. In their article, Farrington et al. is asking, why people post racially charged statements on social media. Especially on Twitter, the phenomenon of *trolling* each other online is a widespread phenomenon. This action means that a user intentionally tries to initiate arguments in a social community of a platform. The trolls, as the users who are doing this is called, mostly take place in the comment section of a platform.[172] One of my objectives in this work is to be able to comprehend *racism* on social media within the context of football. It has been argued that the web is a face neutral and even egalitarian sphere. We are creating a world where anyone, anywhere may express his or her beliefs, no matter how singular, without fear of being coerced into silence or conformity, which indicates that anonymity on the web gives opportunities accessible to everyone, regardless of background characteristics which could otherwise be an obstacle to some. Moreover, it points out that everyone has a voice and the right to represent their opinion.[173] Yet for the sociologists Jack Glaser and Kimberly Barsamian Kahn this utopian idea of a web filled with equality and without discrimination and prejudice comes within an interrelation. The scholars agree on the idea that the internet to some degree provides its users the possibility to connect on equal terms due to the possibility it provides of hiding one's *social category cues*. However, building on John Suler's concept of *the online disinhibition effect* they also argue that the web is liable to increase and expand the expression of prejudice. [174] According to Suler, the effect explains how a person would not say and behave on the internet as they would usually in person. This behaviour could be positive just as well as negative. It could be to donate money to a charity or posting hateful comments. Suler stresses that there are six factors that interact with each other in creating this online disinhibition effect: Dissociative anonymity,

---

[170] Farrington, 2014. P. 9-10.

[171] „What Is Social Media?" *WhatIs.Com*, https://www.techtarget.com/whatis/definition/social-media. Accessed 02 February 2022.

[172] Farrington 2014. P. 13.

[173] Farrington 2014. P. 42- 43.

[174] Glaser, J., and Kahn, K.B. (2005) 'Prejudice and disccrimination and the Internet', The Social Psychology Of the Internet. P. 247.

invisibility, a synchronicity, solipsistic introjection, dissociative imagination, and minimization of authority. All of these factors contribute to the online *disinhibition effect*. Dissociative anonymity is the first factor which enables a detachment from the moral concepts of their identity in everyday life. Anonymity on the internet allows the use of an alternative identity, such as a pseudonym, which can also be created on the internet. This created personality can be almost completely detached from the other personality. Suler explains that some people are convinced that their invented personality has nothing to do with their real-life personality: "In the case of expressed hostilities or other deviant actions, the person can avert responsibility for those behaviours, almost as if superego restrictions and moral cognitive processes have been temporarily suspended from the online psyche "[175] The communication occurs asynchronously. A response does not have to be immediate, and the effects of online sanctions can also be partially avoided by absence.[176] The physical invisibility of the person leads to the absence of non-verbal communication, such as facial expressions, gestures, and intonation, as well as to the absence of a visible reaction of the other person. This can reduce empathy. In addition, an image and a voice of the other person is created in one's own imagination, which comes from oneself.[177] Further, the increasing use of technology and media in everyday life can reduce empathy. On the internet, there is a minimization of status and authority, because both are initially not recognizable, from which a disinhibition in communication can follow.[178] The personality of the communicators has an impact on online communication. While extraverted and theatrical people tend to be open and emotional, compulsive individuals tend to be more reserved. Cultural and social background, level of education, age and gender also have an influence on online disinhibition.[179] To summarise, these factors have the potential to promote racist behaviour. It provides room on platforms such as twitter to freely express racist opinions and material. The sociologist Kevin Hylton, who is one of the pioneers in the study of racism argues similarly:

"Through the seeming privacy of the Internet, its individualistic communications process and the relative anonymity of the interactants, cyberspace becomes a "safe space" for normally borderline and more abhorrent views"[180] Furthermore, racial and social divides that take place during the offline life seems to become amplified on the web,[181] or in the words of Farrington et al., "deepening divides are by-products of old inequalities, digital technology is intensifying inequalities, and new inequalities are appearing'."[182] Therefore, Farrington advises to consider

---

[175] Suler, J. (2004). The Online Disinhibition Effect. Cyberpsychology and **Behaviour**, 7. P. 321–322.

[176] Ibid.

[177] Ibid. P. 322-323.

[178] Ibid. P. 323-324.

[179] Ibid.

[180] Hylton, K. (2013) 'Dispositions to „race" and racism on the internet: online reactions to a ‚racist' comment against Tiger Woods' CERS Working Paper, University of Leeds. P. 14.

[181] Nakamura, L. (2002) Cybertypes: Race, **Ethnicity** and. Identity on the Internet, New York: Routledge. P. 30.

[182] Farrington 2014. P. 48.

internet and social media content from the same lens as we do in real life.[183] The approaches and views about race found offline are mostly spread on social media. The internet is part of our real world and impacted by its ideologies.[184]

4 Method and sources

The objective of the study is to analyse the responses of players, fans, and clubs on social media to racist cases. In order to understand the problem of racism online, it is significant to understand how racism was experienced and perceived in the pre-social media era and how the social media era impacted racism in German Football today. Therefore, three different forms of sources will be used, namely, interviews, documentary film and social media postings. Previous research will be used to contextualize and understand the findings and Hirschmann's model to analyse them. From a historical perspective Racism has always been there but perhaps now social media has made it clearer and showed how it manifests itself.[185] In the analysis of the sources, the exit,

---

[183] Ibid.

[184] Ibid.

[185] Wade (2010). p. 46.

voice, loyalty-model serves as a framework to help to understand the responses. The respective category in the model – *exit, voice, and loyalty* – will be applied on the particular source to show whether the individuals or the club made use of an exit, used their voice, or stayed quiet in connection to racist incidents in the Bundesliga, Germany's highest football league. Based on the data, the correlation between the different responses and the football Club, fans, and players will be showcased. One question that this study deals with is therefore how racism was perceived in the pre-social media era within the Bundesliga. The first part of the analysis will mainly deal with statements, perceptions and the experiences of the interview and documentary by the players in the past. The statements will be assessed and evaluated together at the end with the other used sources. The Interview and the documentary are used to display how racism has been perceived by players in the past in Germany. Therefore, an interview with former black German-Ghanaian player, Otto Addo was conducted. It serves as a source to get a better insight into how racism was experienced and how it was perceived in his active time from the 1980's to 2008. Addo is suitable for this study as he was one of the first black players in the Bundesliga. As the current Assistant Coach of Borussia Dortmund and the current interim national coach of Ghana, he can give insights of his experience as a former player and as a coach currently. Furthermore, he will give his opinion about what has changed in current times. Those commonalities and distinctions can help indicate the significant impacts or changes. The idea, to use an interview with former Ghanaian football player Otto Addo as a source for this work came after watching the German documentary *Black eagle* in which he played a vital role. Due to his biography as a former black Ghanaian player and activist born and raised in Germany, he seemed to be very impactful for this work as he not only had experience as a player but also as a youth growing up in Germany which was split at that time. Due to my Ghanaian roots and the connection to the Ghanaian community in Germany, where I was born and raised too, I was able to establish contact with him through acquaintance. Initially, the idea was to meet him personally but due to his time limitation, an interview in person could not be conducted. Therefore, we had to interview via phone conversation. The interview was 20 minutes long and it was divided into 5 questions. Before the interview was even conducted Addo was already informed in an email about the purpose of this work. I still introduced Otto Addo to the context of my work and how I am going to use it. I offered him to ask questions if there are any obscurities. This was not the case, and he kindly permitted me to use the discussed information for this work. The idea was to prepare and ask the questions in a way that, I would get insights to his personal experience and perception of racism in German Football and what advises he can give. However, the interview started with the question: how has racism changed from the time of your active career as a player and how did it change in times of social media nowadays? Since he is also responsible for young upcoming talents at the German Football Club Borussia Dortmund the second question was, are young talents at the club also facing racist incidents? Next to his personal experiences, it is significant

for this work to get an idea of how clubs and fans contributed to the picture of racism in German football and how it differs from today. How did the German Football Club and your current Football club position themselves against racism? Given the time of his career in the 1990s and early 2000s, I was wondering if there was any possibility or any platform to speak up on racism during his active career? I also asked how he thought racist incidents could be reduced in the future? The interview ended with the question, how has the struggle of combatting racism developed from your active career until today? The objective was to create versatile questions that focus on the perception and experience of a player in the past and the present. Those questions should be answered and compared to findings in the other sources to see how far they correlate to get a conclusion and answer to the given questions of this study. Another source used in this study is the documentary (Black Eagles), which was broadcasted in June 2021 on Germany's public-service television channel *Zweites deutsches Fernsehen* (Second German Televison, ZDF), which is going to be a source of this study. The documentary was accessible on ZDF media centre and other diverse streaming platforms. The documentary takes 1 hour and 40 minutes therein 14 former black football players gave first-hand testimonies of the racism they experienced in the German football world, from the 1960s till nowadays. The documentary is significant as it showcases the change and the experiences of different periods. The idea was to provide many versatile pictures of racism by different players to come to a convincing result in this thesis. The interview was helpful but not sufficient to give an overall estimation of how racism was perceived in pre-digital era and present by mainly black football players but also football clubs and fans. Therefore, I have selected and used statements made in the documentaries about racist incidents in matches and confrontations with the players, which show how they experienced these incidents and the change in how racism has manifested itself over time. In order to get versatile experiences and perceptions of racism, I chose from 14 interviewed players in that documentary and selected statements of 9 different players. Jimmy Hartwig, Erwin Kostedde, Otto Addo, Shary Reeves, Gerald Asamoah, Anthony Baffoe and Guy Acolatse are former football players. Whereas Jean-Manuel Mbom and lastly Jordan Torunarigha are still active. Hartwig, Kostedde, Asamoah, Mbom and Tournarigha have played or are still active for the German National team. The remaining selected players never played for Germany. This information is needed to understand their story. All of them have different backgrounds but share the same story of experiencing racism in different ways. Among others, the objectives of this work were to get diverse backgrounds. The selection was based on the player's biography and their connection to Germany. Furthermore, it is based on players from different periods since this work investigates football players from the pre-digital era around 1960 to the present. The experience differed from those who were born and raised in Germany in comparison to those who just transferred to a new club. The once that was not born and raised in Germany did

not necessarily know the country, language, and its culture at that time. It is significant for the perception of racism to understand the problematic of racism and its development. 6 of the selected players were born and raised in Germany but in different periods. Jimmy Hartwig and Erwin Kostedde were born in the post-war period in Germany. Hartwig was born in 1954 in Germany and Kostedde was born in 1945. Otto Addo was born in 1975, Baffoe was born in 1965 and Shary Reeves was born in 1969. Mbom was born in 2000 in Germany and Torunarigha was born in 1997 in Chemnitz. The two remaining players were not born in Germany, they were either raised in Germany or transferred to Germany. Acolatse was born in 1942 in Togo and transferred to Sankt Pauli in 1963 whereas Asamoah was born in Ghana in West Africa but moved to Germany at the age of 12 years. His professional debut was in 1996 at the German Football Club Hannover 96. While implementing questions and statements from the documentary in my studies, I tried to use those which were relevant and correlate with questions and statements from the interview I made with with Otto Addo. Additional statements to questions from the documentary were used to give a wider insight. Thereby these statements focused on experiences and the perceptions in the documentary. Generally, it was striking that the documentary was divided into former players from the past as the post-war era and players that were or are still active from the 1990s to the present. Depending on the period it was striking that for example Kostedde and Hartwig spoke the most when talking about the past. While talking about the modern era Acolatse, Asamoah, Baffoe and Torunarigha spoke the most. Every story of the players was meaningful, but it is to assume that the mentioned Football players were more impactful with their stories. Thereby I focused especially among others on Kostedde, Asamoah, Torunarigha and Hartwig but I simultaneously examined the statements of the remaining 4 players. While watching the documentary I tried to use an approach where I would stop the documentary whenever, a meaningful question or statement was made, which contributes to the answer to shed light on the research questions of this study. Each time an important statement or question was made asked I stopped the time and noted by whom this statement was made and what it indicated. I divided the documentary into 5 central questions for my study. The first question in the documentary was, what did it meant to the players to play for the black eagle? The black eagle is the national symbol of Germany. Thereby I focused among others on Kostedde because he was the first black German-born football player that played for the national team. This is an important insight as he gave insights about how it was perceived and this was later compared to the first black African-born football player Gerald Asamoah, who played for the national team. And finally, I build a relationship to Mbom and Tournarigha who are both active football players in the present digital era. Those comparisons are meaningful as they give valuable insights into how the perceptions of the players and within the national team may have changed over the different decades. How was racism perceived among fans, citizens, and the media in the post-war era? The documentary clearly indicates how structures of

institutional racism dominated racist views and Ideologies. Furthermore, it showed how black people and racism were perceived from the 1960s onwards to the present. Especially the findings from the post-war era, when Germany got rebuilt by the allies and foreign workers helped to rebuild the German Economy portray how the effects and consequences of the lost war and the politics then impacted certain patterns of the society. Due to the given time in the documentary, it seemed as if fighting racism during the post-war era was not common, as mentioned racism was normalised. Therefore, the last questions from the documentary which were important for my studies was, how did players defend themselves? Was there any platform given to raise your voice?

How does social media impact the club's anti-discrimination activities and policy? How do social media channels of German football clubs deal with racist comments? In order to address these questions, an Interview with one of the officials responsible for the social media channels for the Bundesliga club Eintracht Frankfurt has been conducted. Eintracht has officially declared that the club supports and stands for diversity and equality. Furthermore, the club is known to be committed to the fight against any form of discrimination. The club is an official ambassador for the UN International Weeks against Racism on Sunday. "Haltung zeigen" (Show attitude) was the year's motto of the action weeks. The International Weeks Against Racism take place every year around the *Day Against Racism* on 21 March with various actions throughout the region, municipalities, trade unions, migration organisations, religious communities, schools, sports clubs, and many other participants participate in different formats also online.[186]

However, Due to time limitation to meet personal, a set of questions was sent to the social manager of Eintracht Frankfurt beforehand. The interview took place via phone call and lasted for 22min. The set-up of questions was based on the same approach as the previous Interview with Otto Addo. A concept which introduced my thesis topic had to be written and handed over via email to the club's social media manager. This included an introduction of my study and its purpose. After the interest in my study was confirmed, I created 5 questions for the responsible person that were based on recent incidents in European football.[187] At the beginning of this interview, I introduced Julian Bente once again into the context of my work and how I am going to use it. He permitted me to use the discussed information for this work. The idea was to prepare and ask the questions in a way that, I would get insights into the club's general- and social media activities, experience, and perception when it comes to racism. In the digital era, it is conspicuous how important it is to manage social media account as a company, institution or as a

---

[186] "Kein Platz für Rassismus - Eintracht Frankfurt Klub". *Eintracht Frankfurt*, https://klub.eintracht.de/soziales-engagement/kein-platz-fuer-rassismus/. Accessed 16. April 2022.

[187] https://www.statista.com/chart/25333/gcs-football-benchmark-racism-and-social-media/ Accessed 15. June 2022.

football club. As the previous sources predominantly focused on racism in the past it is meaningful for this work to know how racism is perceived and handled by German Bundesliga Clubs. In order to get an introduction of impactful social media is in general for a club, the first questions asked how important is it nowadays in the digital age as a Bundesliga club to manage social media channels? A club's official channel serves as a platform where fans can inform, discuss, argue, and leave comments after an unsuccessful game for example. Therefore, I asked if the club had special measures against hate comments or discriminatory statements? The previous documentary and the Interview with Otto Addo indicated how clubs used to position themself during a racist incident in comparison to nowadays. Therefore, the social media manager was asked how the clubs today position themselves against racism?

It is also important to analyse the question of how important is it to take a stand against racism as an association? Regarding the anonymity online and the easy accessibility it could have become easier to make racist remarks. Finally, the influence of social media in our society is strong. Thus, I asked if he considered social media to be a helpful tool in the fight against racism and what could or must be actively done in German football to reduce racist hostility online and on the pitch?

I did, however, not only conduct interviews and look at documentaries, but also studied social media as such. As we have seen in the past, there have been prominent cases in Bundesliga football where players have been attacked especially online. As initially mentioned, the digital era has proved that it is almost impossible for among others, football clubs to make do without social media today. Therefore, the social media platform Twitter was used to collect data for this research. What they all have in common is the aim to engage and interact with fans, customers, or followers.[188] Twitter served as a source to portray views against racism. The platform caused the most engagement by users during the incidents. Generally, the relevance of social media shows in its numbers. There are worldwide 4,2 billion users of social media, of which 38 millions of them are from Germany. 317 million worldwide are using twitter with a million Twitter users from Germany.[189] One of the reasons for the use of Twitter is that its data is accessible. Moreover, Twitter quickly separated itself from traditional media providers as the first broadcaster of breaking news about escalating situations.[190] Twitter has been described in previous research as "a microblogging platform that acts as a medium for the flow of information where users can post updates and subscribe to other users, known as following, in order to receive updates or microblogs from other users."[191] Therefore, in the second part of the analysis statements and responses to racist incidents related to German football that caught special

---

[188] Aichner 2019. P. 244.

[189] „Twitter: Number of Users Worldwide 2020". *Statista*, https://www.statista.com/statistics/303681/twitter-users-worldwide/. Accessed 09. May 2022.

[190] Ahmed 2017. P. 3.

[191] Ibid.

attention on Twitter will be tackled. Not every case was necessarily predominantly discussed on Twitter but on other platforms such as online sports magazines, newspapers or they stand out due to their special composition and context.

Due to the broad number of racist incidents in Europe but especially in German Football in the last decade, I had to create certain criteria by which the cases was selected.

The selection of the cases was based on topicality, League, Football club, media attention, actor, the social media platform, and audience. The topicality is important because the more current the case is the more meaningful it is for my study as I am focussing on the digital era. An incident that happened 15 years ago might not be significant anymore because the media changed as well. Therefore, I set a period from 2015 to 2021. The league is important as well in order to be able to make a comparison between clubs that might have a similar scope. Therefore, the cases must have occurred in the first Bundesliga or within the National team.

Moreover, the league is significant because the higher a club plays the more attention it can get from the Media. Thereby it is easier to get further information about it. Since this part of the study deals with social media, I went online and searched for racist incidents in Germany in newspaper, sport magazines and google. I looked at 10 racist incidents in German Football and categorized them into the above-mentioned sections to decide on which 3 to analyse. The objective was to find 3 different cases: I wanted to analyse 3 different cases where racism emerged from 3 different actors. This should make it possible to portray the function it has for society nowadays. Furthermore, it should demonstrate that racism does not only occur in the space of football but includes people from different areas.[192] In order to measure how much impact social media and media, in general have on racism in German Football, I needed to make sure that the cases were covered and discussed online as well. Lastly, due to fact that people belonging to groups that face racism as well, I focused on black people. In seven of those 10 cases, the racist assaults emerged from partly fans of the opposing team. In one case racism emerged from a CEO of a club. In the other cases it emerged from a former football player. One case emerged involving a Politician. Conclusively, For the first racist incidents case on twitter, I decided to take the case of Schalke CEO Clemens Tönnies in 2019 in which he insulted Africans.[193] Due to the high media public awareness back then the case serves as a good example to demonstrate how clubs, fan and players react when it comes to a racist incident. The case is also special because it went out from the chief executive officer, who is a representative of the

---

[192] „https://twitter.com/dlfnachrichten/status/736888716392828928". *Twitter*, https://twitter.com/dlfnachrichten/status/736888716392828928. Accessed 16. April 2022.
[193] „https://twitter.com/s04/status/1157298751071019008". *Twitter*, https://twitter.com/s04/status/1157298751071019008. Accessed 05. Mai 2022.

club and its values and therefore actually a role model.[194] Clemens Tönnies has been Managing Director of the company since 1994. In addition, between 2001 to 2020 Clemens Tönnies acted as the Chairman of the Supervisory Board of the German Football club Schalke 04. The second case describes a case where the incidents got initiated by a part of Schalke fans during the match between Schalke 04 and Hertha BSC.[195]

The black German-born Torunarigha gets racially insulted by fans of the home team. How does the case manifest itself when fans express racist remarks and how does that differ from the CEO Tönnies? This case is interesting as Schalke 04 got black players in their own squad. Lastly, the last case is from 2016 and deals racist statement by German right-wing politician Alexander Gauland who made racist remarks towards the German National player Jerome Boateng. The case of Alexander Gauland shows that racism does not only occur in the space of football but includes people from different areas.[196] I decided to take those three cases because they met the criteria that I set up above. The cases occurred within the first division, the German Bundesliga. But one significant point was that these cases reflected racism that emerged from people in different areas. In order to get a first overall result out of these cases, they had to be evaluated by a certain approach and criteria. This approach was applied to the Tönies case and partly to the others. The case of Gauland and Torunarigha case were not necessarily discussed much on Twitter compared to Tönnies, but surely in the media in general. Gauland's case stood out due to its constellation because that right-wing Politicians who had nothing in common with football picked up this topic by insulting a football player. It got selected to be analysed as the reaction of the people in Germany caught in other online forums. The case was primarily investigated upon the three significant german newspapers: Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, Die Zeit and the Football newspaper Kicker. However, in the first case of Tönnies, 360 comments, and their intended message were reviewed. Due to the number of comments not all the comments were reviewed. 50 comments were assessed until a rough estimation and a pattern could be identified. Due to the number of comments, I reviewed 50 comments after I recognized a pattern. Thereby the profile had to be considered to identify whether the user was a supporter of the club, political active users that could maybe be right-winged or just neutral user. Those categories imply, how they are set up and how they should be understood. If most of the user were connected of the

---

[194] „Clemens Tönnies empört mit rassistischen Aussagen". *Der Spiegel*, 2. August 2019. *www.spiegel.de*, https://www.spiegel.de/wirtschaft/unternehmen/clemens-toennies-empoert-mit-rassistischen-aussagen-ueber-afrikaner-a-1280178.html. Accessed 16. April 2022.

[195] Bark, Marcus. „Rassistische Übergriffe gegen Herthas Torunarigha: ‚... dann kicken wir nicht weiter'". *Der Spiegel*, 5. Februar 2020. *www.spiegel.de*, https://www.spiegel.de/sport/fussball/jordan-torunarigha-von-hertha-bsc-rassistisch-beleidigt-dann-kicken-wir-nicht-weiter-a-d9368f1d-4b53-49a2-b234-d56a1b891187.

[196] „https://twitter.com/dlfnachrichten/status/736888716392828928". *Twitter*, https://twitter.com/dlfnachrichten/status/736888716392828928. Accessed 16. April 2022.

club, they can still be critical to the club but tend to be maybe biased. Most of the supporters noted that they are supporters by the profile picture and its description. If the profile indicated a right-wing tendency, it was to be assumed that they have racist tendencies. If none of the mentioned two criteria was met, then the users were assumed to be neutral. People of the respective category were asserted by profile and the respected comment. Due to the amount of 50 comments, the study demonstrated exemplary 10 collected comments on each post. Those 10 comments should reflect the clarity of the common comments of the particular Twitter case and by whom they were made. This approach was mainly applied on the Tönnies case as it provided more engagement on Twitter than the others. The numbers and statements of the particular case will be compared with the findings of the other sources to see if there is a conclusion that results from this. The post was drawn through comments that were critical of Clemens Tönnies and his statements. The post was low on comments that agreed with him. Even though there the critical comments overweighed there were still negative comments that agreed with his racist statements. I categorized those 50 comments into how many were supportive, critical, or racist comments. Comments on tweets are supportive if they do agree with the addressed person. Whereas critical comments are defined as such that do not agree and provide a reasonable explanation. Racist comments of users are defined as those that either agree or further insult them too. Out of those 50 comments, 43 comments were critical of Tönnies racist statements. 7 were supportive of Tönnies. To demonstrate examples of those tweets, 10 comments under each Tweet were collected. Those 10 comments should reflect the type of comments that draw through the whole tweet. They were also selected by type of person they were. Those could be either supporters of the club, political active users that could maybe be racist and right winged or just neutral. Those categories imply, how the categories are set up and how they can be understood. If the majority of the users are connected to the club, they can still be critical of the club but tend to be maybe biased.

If the profile indicated a right-wing tendency, it could be assumed that they have racist tendencies. If none of the mentioned two criteria was met, then the users were probably assumed to be neutral. People of the respective category were asserted by profile and the respected comment. Out of 43 people that were critical towards Tönnies 32 were either Schalke fans or general fans. Out of the 7 supportive people 3 seem to be Schalke fans, 2 seem to be neutral and the last two seem to support activists against racism. It was striking that there were people that seem supportive but no tendency of racism. While the first case was mainly based on postings and statements from Twitter, the second case of right-wing politician Alexander Gauland and black German national player Jerome Boateng was mainly based on statements and opinions

from online newspapers. The material for this part was based 2 newspapers, 2 online articles and 1 twitter post were used in this study. The first well respected German newspaper *Die Zeit* covered this racist incident and portrayed their disagreement of two other German politicians to Gauland's case. These politicians were officials of the German party CDU and SPD. The second newspaper which was used in this thesis was FAZ *Frankfurt Allgemeine Zeitung*. The idea of having newspapers was to see if the voices do agree with the ones from the first newspaper. Thereby officials of German Football association Reinhard Grindel, Oliver Bierhoff took a position by disapproving with the statement of the politician. Furthermore, they stated that this was an attempt to reject tolerance and openness in a nowadays multicultural German culture. Moreover, the idea was to portray to which extent the perception of racism has been changed when we consider the past. All opinions were categorised in whether they were denying or critical against the incident. Summarising, the questioned 4 people were all against his statements. Lastly, the analysis of the racist incidents follows the same pattern as the previous case. So, Hertha BSC Football player Jordan Torunarigha got insulted by partly fans of the home team Schalke 04. In order to understand how 2 teammates, 2 coaches and 1 club officials position themselves. The study relied mainly on the biggest Germanys sport newspaper *Kicker,* which portrayed their opinion. Their opinions were categorised in whether they were denying or critical against the incident. It was striking that every one of the 5 concerned people took the same position as not tolerating that. Instead of denying what happened the home team promised their help in investigating on this behalf as the incidents does not correlate with Schalke 04 norms and values. Additionally, one online newspaper that published the victim's statement and emotion and a twitter supportive post of 1 twitter post of black German football player Jerome Boateng was among others used to for this study.[197] Under his post there were 22 comments 19 that agreed with Boateng and 3 that disagreed with him. 12 of the 19 could be identified as football fans and 7 were unknow or stated as neutral. The remaining two that disagreed with him were neutral and did not make any racist remarks.[198] At the end of the analysis, we can roughly assess how much impact the digital era actually has on users nowadays. If the incident concerns a certain club, how do their fans react? Do they stay loyal to their club, and do they even try to deny that it occurred? Or do they acknowledge the urgency of the incident and use of their voice to protest? In order to answer this question, the second part of the analysis will contain statements and responses mainly in the digital era. Thereby there is going to be a comparison to the incidents of the past how they changed to now. The idea of the analysis of those Twitter cases is to portray different perspectives when the aggressor changes. Another goal is to compare the statements of the

---

[197] https://twitter.com/jeromeboateng/status/1225054884279402496". Accessed 12. May 2022.
[198] Ibid.

corresponding fans, users, club officials and players. What sort of racism is expressed today on social media platforms and how does it manifest itself? Does racism manifest itself differently if the source is a club official (like a club CEO or board member), football fans, or an influential member of the society (like a politician) and how do the responses differ? In combination with the postings made in connection to certain incidents or case studies, it is important to get an understanding of the social media channels used by football clubs and their importance and role in connection to such incidents. Finally, when both eras are analysed, they will be subsequently compared in similarities and ad differences. The findings will be evaluated on how racism was experienced whether in the past or modern era in Germany's Elite League. Further, the study will analyse upon the case studies if users and fans benefit from social media as a source of availability.

5 Racist incidents in Germany from 1960's to early 2000's

5.1 Interview with former Football player Otto Addo

Nowadays it is quite normal to have players from abroad playing in German leagues. The first foreign player to play in the Bundesliga came from former Yugoslavia and Erwin Kostedde was the first black player to wear the German national jersey.[199] Otto Addo is a German-Ghanaian football coach and former player, who was born and raised by Ghanaian parents in Hamburg, West Germany. In December 2020, after a long career in several German Bundesliga clubs such as FSV Mainz, Hannover 96, Borussia Dortmund, and Hamburger SV he was recruited as the assistant coach of Borussia Dortmund. Since 2013, Otto Addo has been involved in the anti-racism campaign "Show Racism the Red Card- Deutschland e. V." and participated in the campaign "Unsere Elf gegen Racism" (Our eleven against racism). In 2021, Addo was one of the protagonists of the documentary Black Eagles of the streaming provider Prime Video.[200] The interview was conducted in order to obtain first-hand testimony about his experiences of racism in the Bundesliga during his active career from 1992 to 2008. In response to the question how racism has changed from the time of his active career as a player, Addo replied that on the whole, racism was worse then, than today. "It was different times", Addo explains, "the number of foreign players in teams were less but also the understanding for racism in the society". "Racism was not perceived as a big deal", he adds, which further indicates that racism was largely accepted at the time. Addo states that: "Nowadays it has become more obvious due to the new media. People can just post, share and send things about incidents rapidly. It enables the user to report those incidents from the perspective of the victims." This makes it possible for the people who trivialise racism to get a better understanding, Addo explains. Furthermore, he states that todays' postings about racism on social media serve as evidence that racist incidents really took place back then. "This is very important because in my time people would not always believe what happened and therefore refused to take it seriously. Moreover, it is noticeable that people take clear positions and discuss this topic more."[201]

During his career as coach, Addo was the youth coach of Borussia Dortmund. Since the youth that he coached at that time grew up at the time of social media, I asked him if racism played a significant role for them? He stated that it did for some of them but that how concerned they were depended on the degree of fame they had. "The more well-known a young player already is,

---

[199] „HISTORIE: Ausländer - Feature 74_75". *bundesliga.de - die offizielle Webseite der Bundesliga*,
https://www.bundesliga.com/de/bundesliga/news/1974-75-von-radi-ueber-buffy-bis-dino-_0000115020.jsp.
Accessed 11. Mai 2022.
[200] Ibid.
[201] Interview with Otto Addo 06.03.2022, 00.43.-2.52. min.

the more he gets confronted. Otherwise, it is not that common because they are still playing at youth level and the public does not care that much about them yet."[202]

On the question of how clubs position themselves in relation to racism at that time, Addo replied that when players suffered from racist chants from the stands their coaches advised them to stay calm, focus on their game and punish it with a good performance. This is also what he did himself, he explained: "I was a young player who had a dream, so I tried to just focus on me." Later in the interview Addo returned to how he, at this time, experienced being told to stay quiet in face of racist chants and having bananas thrown at him. He felt lonely and not supported, but he tried to punish this behaviour with good performances.[203]

When asked about the possibility to speak out and protest against racism at the time he compared the situation for football players in Germany with that of basketball players in the USA. It is much easier to speak out against racism as a basketball player in the US. As a football player at that time in Germany you were always dependent on your club and the association. However, Addo also states that it has gotten easier for professional athletes to raise their voices in protest against racism. This, he argues, is because athletes have been increasingly involved and given responsibilities in society. Addo believes athletes and football players in particular, the role of the players has expanded to something that goes beyond the football field. This expresses itself most clearly in terms of players being viewed as role models, due to the sport's popularity. a role model that so many kids look up and identify with. Therefore, Addo explains we need to understand that sport and politics are not to be divided. Sport is a part of the society and society is part of politics. "Everyone is looking towards sports to seek active support in war, injustice, and discrimination. You can't just pretend to only be an athlete, that's it. Sport is a powerful medium, which should be used and that was not always the case in the past"[204]

Here Addo explains that during his active career, players in general but especially black players were advised to stay quiet and just ignore the racist remarks by the fans. They were supposed to stay calm because the goals of the team were more important than the individual concerns. From Hirschman's perspective, one can say that club and association expected loyalty from the players, but loyalty was not given in reverse. There was no room for players to claim their concerns and worries. However, as there was no room to make use of their voice, exit is the only remaining option which in turn is too risky. The situation would be most likely the same if not worse in every other club in Germany. Moreover, being a professional a Football player is their profession, which they are earning money with and without it there is a chance of not surviving. According to Addo Football players were viewed differently, in terms of what role they played within the society unlike current times. When asked about how this struggle to combat racism has

---

[202] Ibid. 03.30.
[203] Ibid.
[204] Interview with Otto Addo, 06.03.2022, 05.45min.

developed from previous times to present times, he concludes that he thinks that things are going in the right direction but also that "much more remains to be done". There are still problematic fundamental racist structures and discrimination, and this is not even noticed by people who are not directly affected by it, adding, "they don't get awaken."[205] Addo states that people who have grown up in a society dominated by racism have a responsibility to remind people about these issues and to inform them of their possibilities and alternatives. He also emphasises that it is important to include people who are affected by racism in the struggle against structural racism. He argues that players have a responsibility to voice, and preferably to do so in an organised form. If athletes or NGOs could be more integrated in the German football association for instance it would make them more aware of the problem, he argues.[206] Addo also suggest that society needs to be involved, schools could integrate the issue of inequality and different forms of discrimination in the curriculum. In Particular, he emphasises the role of cultivating the children and teaching them to appreciate other cultures and diversity.[207] Addo also argues that the structure of social media platforms needs to change, so that users cannot use them to share racist thoughts. On the other hand, he admits, they are also a powerful tool to identify and counter racism and he mentions that on several occasions in the last years, in Germany and elsewhere, social media has helped in making people aware of racism, for example through posting about incidents and sharing the BLM movements postings. "Positioning is important, nowadays, Addo concludes, all clubs in Germany's Top Leagues take a clear position against racism but taking position is not enough, it is more important what the clubs are doing against it. We are not allowed to get tired of fighting racism."[208] According to Otto Addo nowadays fans and especially players have a strong platform to voice their opinion and put pressure on the club because the clubs are positioning themselves against it therefore, they have the ability to act accordingly and bring a change.

5.2   The Black Eagles

In the author and director Torsten Körner's 2021 documentary *Schwarze Adler* (Black eagles) the first generation of black professional football players and members of the German national team were able to share their personal stories.[209] It describes how they experienced and resisted racism and how they managed to perform for their home country with the German black eagle on their

---

[205] Ibid.

[206] Interview with Otto Addo 06.03.2022, 07:35min.

[207] Ibid.

[208] Ibid.

[209] KG, imfernsehen GmbH &. Co. „Schwarze Adler". *fernsehserien.de*, https://www.fernsehserien.de/filme/schwarze-adler. Accessed 20. May 2022.

chest, despite obstacles and hostility.[210] 14 football stars provide deep insights in front of the camera, from Erwin Kostedde (born in 1946) to Jean-Manuel Mbom (born in 2000), Steffi Jones and Shary Reeves as well as Anthony Baffoe, Guy Acolatse, who played for St. Pauli in 1963. And Otto Addo. They all have in common that they have been affected by racism. In the documentary they give witness to different ways of dealing with it.[211]

 From the interviews with the players, it seems clear that they viewed and experienced racism differently. The racist act itself was not necessarily differently done onto the players, but one can say that it was perceived worse by the players in the 1970s and 1980s because they did not receive the same support players nowadays receive from clubs, associations (e.g., sponsors) etc. Players that played in Germany's professional league or for the German national team all share these experiences and are in general transparent about these experiences.[212] Despites Germany's history of extreme nationalism and violent racism, society seemed not to have learned its lessons. Xenophobic and racist violence manifested itself with the first economic decline in Germany in 1966 and 1967, which were against foreign workers from Turkey or Italy. Although foreign workers were regarded as an economic compensation instrument, new fears of unemployment in the federal republican arose within the society. This caused dissatisfaction and the scapegoat identified found in foreigners.[213] Black players in top level German football rarely played at that time. Erwin Kostedde, Guy Acolatse, and Jimmy Hartwig were playing approximately during the same period. Kostedde and Hartwig are both sons of a German mother and an African American Father. Kostedde was, as mentioned, the first black player ever to play for the German National team.

Meanwhile, Acolatse was the first black African player, he was Togolese, to play in the German League for St. Pauli. "Most of the people haven't seen a black man before, maybe on TV or in a movie," Acolatse explained in the interview.[214] People came to the stadium to see him and stood and stared at him. However, in the interview in the film he says that he enjoyed the attention, and he prospered from it. Even the club's management paid him extra salary since they had more people coming to the matches to see him. People were unabashedly curious and said things like "my father and my grandfather would like to see you, can you come home with us?"[215] In the interview he keeps repeating that he enjoyed the attention. "People looked at me as if I would eat them right away."[216] Playing on this curiosity he would sometimes intimidate the opponent team's

---

[210] Ibid.

[211] Ibid.

[212] Black eagles' documentary (2021): 12:38min.

[213] Zuber, J. (2015). Gegenwärtiger Rassismus in Deutschland. P. 156

[214] Ibid.

[215] Ibid.

[216] Ibid.

defenders during a match by saying: "I'm going to bite you!"[217] When sociologist David Zimmermann differentiated between different categories of fans. He mentioned the type of fans that Acolatse was facing among others. A majority of the fans of St. Pauli came to see the black player because it was an attraction and entertainment to see a black player for the first time which had more audience as consequence in the stadium. Yet, it is still arguable as to how positive it is because it could remind one of an attraction as an animal in the circus.[218] However, Acolatse was able to transform this racism into positivity and energy the female player Shary Reeves felt that she was excluded and not integrated which made her believe it was due to her skin colour. As a child she therefore wanted to wash herself so she would get white again, so she did not have to feel the pain. Erwin Kostedde talks about the same experience, that he tried to wash himself in order to get white.[219] Both Kostedde and Reeves started to question their appearance and simultaneously started to question their roots. The German television and its advertisement during the 1970's did not necessarily help against it. The advertisement showed a black man getting washed in a washing machine and turning out white and "clean" again. It indicates that back then institutional racism was normalised. There was no social awareness that this form of advertisement was offensive and racist.[220] The previous chapters in previous research about guest worker confirmed those structural racism structures. A large part of the political level was against the permanent settlement of immigrants in the Federal Republic of Germany. The German government then admitted foreign workers only with the condition that they would only stay in the Federal Republic of Germany for a short-term economic temporary support. This makes it more obvious that a countries citizen will implement those structures.[221] One can identify a rather ambivalent approach and a less exemplary view for the population.[222] At this time, it seems racism was normalised to the point that people did not even notice it and thus, *voices* against it, Hirschman's terms, could not be expected from the society in general. At the same time voice could not be used by the players as they felt alone and felt that being white was the norm. However, this can also be because of the non-familiarity with black people and the lack of sensitivity with this topic. However, Zuber argued that German politics were thereby jointly responsible for the increasing public xenophobic and open racist tendencies within the course of immigration as they normalised those racist.[223] The weekly sports TV Show *Das aktuelle Sportstudio* which gets broadcasted in German TV Channel ZDF interviewed the footballer Anthony Baffoe who was born in Germany as the son of the Ghanaian ambassador. When asked about racist incidents he replied in a facetious manner and sometimes gave the audience the impression as he

---

[217] Ibid.

[218] Zimmermann 2005, P. 22.

[219] Ibid, 18:36min

[220] Ibid, 19:70min

[221]Zuber, J. (2015). P.158-159.

[222] Ibid, P. 158-159.

[223] Ibid.

did not take himself seriously. When asked if he would play for the German national team, he replied: yes, I would, to bring some colour into the team. And the audience applauded.[224] This scene of the documentary implied that you were only considered as a possible part of society if the country could potentially benefit from you. Baffoe was expected to play his role and the price of using voice was simply too high. Journalists or commentators, roles typically assigned with the role of acknowledging misconduct and abuse in society, make use of their voice to stand up against racist remarks. They failed to bring the right response when being in the stadium or during an interview. Kostedde tells about questions that he was asked by journalists that were experienced as outright disgraceful and shameful. Considering all these experiences in German society, added to the experience that it felt very difficult to gain any form of support or acknowledgement in terms of experiencing difficulties from society or the fans themselves, with one explanation being that they experienced racism as normalised.

"In Germany you have to be like Berti Vogts, that's how you can make it," Erwin Kostedde started just after his debuting game for the German national team. It means that you cannot experience loyalty if you are not white. His performance on his debut was not as pleasing as he summarised, and he felt like the German team had him in special observation than others. At the same time the feeling of belonging did not exist. On his way to the friendly match against England he experienced how German fans said that they do not want black players to play for their German National team. Kostedde describes how he was put under pressure by the national coach to assure that there was no racism in Germany. Kostedde insisted that it was not true, which the coach did not really like. He always had to strive to be better than the other players due to the fact that he was black coloured.[225] "Everyone gets hurt hearing things like that, and it follows you throughout the whole match, as his performance displayed".[226] It detains you from showing your actual potential, he admits. So, he was afraid of what people would think and especially say about him while watching the match, because according to him you will always be assessed differently by the Germans if you are black. His dream was always to perform for the German black eagle, but he admitted when looked back he had his doubts because he could never get warm with the German national team as he did not feel accepted.[227]

Being the first and that time the only black player to play for the national team, it seemed to be impossible to stand for your position in the team. The only remaining possibility seems to be exit as he was not part of the team. Former German Captain and Legend Franz Beckenbauer supported him by convincing the coach to set him up for the starting eleven. Thereby loyalty was only given under the condition that he was a good player. Considering Hirschman one can say

---

[224] Ibid, 45:14.

[225] Black eagles' documentary 2021, 32:33min.

[226] Ibid.

[227] Ibid, 33:38min.

that he did not even experience loyalty neither from the fans nor from his actual team coach. And if you stand up for yourself by disagreeing with your coach the only left opportunity is exit. Kostedde only made three games for Germany.[228] Other player Jimmy Hartwig said despite good performances in the Bundesliga and many goals that he scored it was impossible for him at the beginning to be called up for the German national team during the 1980s.[229] This points out the difficulty of a black German trying to play for the national team but it furthermore agrees with the experience of Kostedde stating that black players had to do more to be even considered. Black players did not have the same possibilities, you had to be like Bertig Vogts, who was white.[230] A change came when Ghanaian born Gerald Asamoah played for several Bundesliga clubs u.a. Hannover 96 and Schalke 04. He is considered as a Legend at Schalke 04. Asamoah was the first African born black player who made his debut for the German National team in 2001. During the 1970's a utopia, 27 years after when Kostedde made his debut for Germany.[231] During this period the German national team tried to make a difference and stand for diversity by implementing more and more German players with an ethical background. The goal was to represent diversity in Germany and that everyone is welcome. The reality still looked different. The society and Germany thought that this was a right step into the right direction, but the reality looked different.[232] You could play in the national team but still be booed out in the League. One day you feel like you belong to the country the next moment you feel all alone as Asamoah stated.[233] Later Asamoah admits that he is not sure if he would continue playing for Germany, if the Fans of the National team would insult him racially in any form.[234] In his position as a national player Asamoah vouched for his rights as a German by playing giving 100% for Germany, but if he experiences racist chants his answer to that will be an exit as Hirschman describes. Putting Asamoah in Hirschman's perspective, he showed loyalty towards the country that he grew in by being dedicated. At the same time, he points out to take advantage of exit if he experiences the same incidents in the national team too. This exit could have the consequence for Germany as a country not being able to gain more players who decide to play for Germany. Further, it could also mean that their process of integration and multiculturalism stagnates. It is striking that during such a match there is no one who intervened in the match, neither the referee nor the coaches. The problem was not acknowledged enough to be recognised. Yet it was unintelligible to the German Fans that some of the players with an ethnical background did not

---

[228] Welle (www.dw.com), Deutsche. „Erwin Kostedde: ‚Schwarze Spieler werden in Deutschland immer zweite Wahl sein' | DW | 05.04.2021". *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/de/erwin-kostedde-schwarze-spieler-werden-in-deutschland-immer-zweite-wahl-sein/a-55246926. Accessed 14. April 2022.

[229] Black eagles' documentary 2021, 35.00 min.

[230] Ibid.

[231] Ibid.

[232] Ibid, 1:02:15.

[233] Ibid, 1:03.15.

[234] ibid, 1:15:22.

sing the national anthem of Germany. The interviewed players claimed that they don't want their loyalty to be questioned because they are not singing the national anthem.[235] One could get the impression that some fans make their support dependent on singing the national anthem, meanwhile they are not acknowledging that they are not singing because it is their personal decision. During a match between Hannover 96 and Energie Cottbus in 1999 in the Stadium of friendship, Hannover player Otto Addo and his teammate then Gerald Asamoah suffered under racist chants from people among other families with their children in the stands of the stadium and asks himself how are these children supposed to grow up later? As racist of course. He states an important point, when wanting to fight racism everyone should be aware that no one is born to hate a person for his look.[236] The same scenario was recognised when Asamoah played for Schalke against east German Club Hansa Rostock in 2006. Asamoah got racially insulted by the opposing fans. The above-mentioned match against Energie Cottbus and now Rostock confirms Gunter Pilz statistic from 2003 regarding the image of East German football fans in the previous chapter. Thereby he stated that according to his survey 61.8% of ultras from new federal states denied that they would ban racist and right-wing fans from their blocks if those make racist remarks. In comparison only 11.8% affirm this claim. In contrast, 32.9% of ultras from the old federal states would actively defend themselves against those activities.[237] This points out the willingness of East German fans to be proactive in pre digital era around the early 2000s.[238]

Being asked how his football club positioned themselves against racism during a crucial and important game he stated that during a relegation match no one really cares how you feel about being insulted and discriminated against. The only thing that really counts, is the question if the club will reach the objectives such as keeping the league or getting promoted to the next higher league.[239] This statement of correlates with the argument of scholar Behn in the course of the clubs promotion, racist assaults and chants in the stadium are partly used to weaken the opposite team, which can have a significant impact when being in crucial stage. He implies that does chants do not always have a xenophobic background but they demonstrate power mark the stadium as their territory.[240] Zimmerman proved what is said by Asamoah and Addo, racist Fans scenes can create an ideologies of about the opposition which always indicates demarcation "we" against "them" and this can promote hostility to "others".[241] However, this does still do not change the fact, that it is racism and it harms the victim. Pilz assumption in the previous research

---

[235] Black eagles' documentary 2021, 1:15:22min.

[236] Nelson Mandela quote: *"No one is born hating another person because of the colour of his skin, or his background or religion. People must learn to hate and if they can learn to hate they can be taught to love for love comes more naturally to the human heart than its opposite."*

[237] Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. 2006. P. 331.

[238] Ibid.

[239] Black eagles' documentary 2021, 1:30:40min.

[240] Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. 2006. P. 331.

[241] Zimmermann 2005, P. 18.

proved this, in 2003 clubs did not clearly position themselves against right-wing extremist then. In conclusion it did not contribute to reduce the above-mentioned number rather it encouraged people to express their racist political views in those fan scenes.[242] Furthermore, it just corroborates what for example the government conveyed in their politics during the 1990s, when President then Helmut Kohl traced a policy which focused immigration and migration policy. Their policy claimed that Germany was not a country of immigration.[243] Following Hirschman theory, if a player does not receive any support from the club or association he can exit from the club. Players during that time did mostly not give any resistance and just showed loyalty towards the clubs. Gerald Asamoah was one of the few players to try to defend himself. The clubs did not care enough so the players did not have many options other than voice or exit.[244] At the of the documentary Junior Torunarigha who is a black active player in the German Bundesliga since 2015 sums up, that it has to be footballers with their range who need to help fight racism by making usage of their voice too. This is also a difference to the past which Otto Addo brought up. It was not normal for other players to call out on others to get active against racism. Further he explains that first of all players have to use their strong platform nowadays to position themselves and put pressure on the club as the clubs are capable of making a change.

[242] Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. 2006. P. 330-331.
[243] Zuber Ibid, P. 162.
[244] Black eagles' documentary 2021, p. 52:10min.

6 Racism in the digital era

6.1 Interview with social media manager of Eintracht Frankfurt

In the digital era the importance of social media, to share, inform and engage with the largest of audiences with the latest news around the world, has grown immensely. In comparison to traditional media outlets, the wide variety of social media platforms that are available to us allow everyday people to post the reality of live events.[245] Digital channels are important mediums in the work of public relations. As a professional football club, it is no longer avoidable to use of the channels. As everyone is on a digital move, fans want to be entertained and informed about the latest news about their club. Associations and clubs develop media houses.[246] In order to assess how clubs, respond to racism on social med I have conducted an interview with Julian Bente, the social media manager of the German Bundesliga club Eintracht Frankfurt. When asked how important positioning against racism is, Bente makes clear that the club does not tolerate any form of discrimination. And the club has certain codex which has to be respected by every club member. He mentions respect, openness, and equality among others. In order to combat racism Eintracht Frankfurt as a club regularly organizes campaigns and actions, that make fans realise the seriousness of this problem. Hereby there is similarity to be identified in what Otto Addo and Torunarigha said. There is a need to provide platform where those topics can be addressed by the club representants. Bente mentions that it is inadmissible in German society of diversity and various different cultures not to position yourself against racism.

The number of black players in the League changed, ongoing racist incidents in the world made aware of how important it is to stand against it, he explains. Therefore, this is another significant point in comparison to the period of former player Kostedde and Hartwig. They were a rarity therefore it was even harder to speak up. Kostedde mentions he was all alone.[247]It is striking that clubs include their fan base more in those campaigns by advertising them digitally and in the stadium. Position yourself as a club online and live by making the people aware of the clubs' values. As a club in Germany especially with countries historical background during the World War II. We really have to the most to position ourselves against racism. Football is for everyone and there are many foreign players but especially black players that are active in our clubs. Putting this into the lens of Hirschman not showing support and protect them from racism can cause an exit of players from the club as they do not feel welcome. This will further lead to the

---

[245] „Black Lives Matter: From Social Media Post to Global Movement". *BBC News*, 9. Juli 2020. *www.bbc.com*, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-53273381. Accessed 14. April 2022.

[246] Interview with Julian Bente: Social Media Manager of Eintracht Frankfurt, 09. May 2022, 00.30min.

[247] „Erwin Kostedde: ‚Schwarze Spieler werden in Deutschland immer zweite Wahl sein' | DW | 05.04.2021". *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/de/erwin-kostedde-schwarze-spieler-werden-in-deutschland-immer-zweite-wahl-sein/a-55246926. Accessed 17 April 2022.

consequences that Germany is not able to stand for its values of equality and multiculturalism. Bente admits that nowadays football clubs are more and more dependent on their international repetition and partnerships that acquires new fans abroad. This could be in a form of Football camps in Africa for example. At the same time, they are also dependent on deals abroad that increases sales. All this in relation to Hirschman indicates that clubs as Eintracht Frankfurt are in a dependent relation. if we do not make them feel welcome especially if they were maybe not born here, we will risk that Germany will firstly not be able to stand for its values of equality and multiculturalism. The club will also loose reputation. This will also lead to unattractiveness of the League, because black players would not consider transferring to a German club as the social media manager explains.[248] At this point one could question the seriousness of combatting racism due to ethic values or due to financial and commercial security. However, Bente states, that many actions in recent years, social media shows that it can be an important factor in the fight against racism. Even if there are of course also negative examples. Due to its engagement, social media is therefore more of a help than a burden. Unfortunately, there are incorrigible ones everywhere, but even on the Internet you should act against them and not give them a platform.[249] In order to combat the racist comments, he explains that the club follows strict rules. The social media platform is constantly monitored. Unpleasant comments will be either delated or disabled. The clubs page will be blocked for the user and the user will be reported to that particular platform. Thereby we have to be careful cause there is a difference between insulting player for his performance and criticizing him.[250] This measure shows within Hirschman that a club has its codex which has to be followed and respected. Every user can share their opinion, but it has to be respectfully. If it does not correlate with the club's codex the concerned person has to exit. If this was the case within the stadium, the match will be pause by the referee, one must leave stadium and the concerned person will be reported if he can be identified.[251] All these measures show the difference between experiences of Otto Addo and Kostedde in the 1960s when players got advised to ignore the chants. Eintracht Frankfurt emphasizes the importance to clear those racist cases by educating people, by taking care of the concerned. It is the duty of every club as they have a big impact on the society. Small children look up to these clubs and their stars, so they have served as an example. Everything is not possible to avoid neither online nor in real live during match, but we have to try the most Bente suggests. There is still a long way to go as we have been seen in German Football, but moments when for example the three black English players missed their penalties and received so much support on social media platforms are moments that reinforce how important it is to have strong opinion against racism.[252]

---

[248] Interview Julian Bente 2022, 02.10.min.
[249] Ibid.
[250] Ibid.
[251] Ibid.
[252] Ibid.

6.2   The Tönnies affair

 As generally known racist incidents have always been an issue in German football.[253] The era of social media proved its significant role within racism in Football. It has helped create awareness of racism but at the same used to spread racism.[254] One of the most prominent cases that caught media attention in German football was the incident around former Schalke 04 CEO, Clemens Tönnies. In July 2019 he criticised tax increases in the fight against climate change in front of 1600 guests during a speech. In doing so, however, he also established an alleged connection between energy supply, climate change and overpopulation in Africa. Instead of increasing the taxes, it would be better to finance 20 power plants in Africa every year, he said, according to the newspaper "Neue Westfälischen". And: "Then the Africans would stop cutting down trees, and they would stop producing children when it's dark.[255]However, out of the 360 comments of Tönnies case 50 have been reviewed. The post was drawn through of comments that were critical against Clemens Tönnies and his statements. The post was low on comments that agreed with him. I categorized those 50 comments into how many were supportive, critical, or racist comments. Out of those 50 comments 43 comments were critical towards Tönnies racist statements. 7 were supportive towards Tönnies. In a statement on the official club's homepage shared on Twitter, Tönnies apologises to the Schalke fans, and he assures that he surely stands behind the clubs' values and norms[256]:

> Dear Schalke,
> As a Chairman of the Supervisory Board of FC Schalke 04, I stand 1,000 percent behind our club values. This includes the fight against racism, discrimination, and exclusion. Therefore, I would like to apologise explicitly to you, the fans, members, and friends of FC Schalke 04, for my statement at the event. It was wrong, not considered, and thoughtless and in no way corresponded to our club's approach. I am very sorry. Clemens Tönnies."[257]

This implies that he firstly did not understand the problematic of his statement, he firstly fails to address the victims of his statement by only apologising to the clubs' members and everyone else

---

[253] „‚Neger' und ‚Judensau': Neun erschütternde Rassismus-Vorfälle aus der Bundesliga". *www.t-online.de*, https://www.t-online.de/-/87282180. Accessed 05. May 2022.

[254]Matamoros-Fernández A, Farkas J. Racism, Hate Speech, and Social Media: A Systematic Review and Critique. Television & New Media. 2021;22(2). P. 207.

[255] „Clemens Tönnies empört mit rassistischen Aussagen". *Der Spiegel*, 2. August 2019. *www.spiegel.de*, https://www.spiegel.de/wirtschaft/unternehmen/clemens-toennies-empoert-mit-rassistischen-aussagen-ueber-afrikaner-a-1280178.html. Accessed 19.04.2022.

[256] „Statement von Clemens Tönnies". *Fußball*, 2. August 2019, https://schalke04.de/inside/statement-von-clemens-toennies/Accessed 03. May 2022.

[257] Ibid.

who is related to Schalke 04 instead of apologising to African people. This is problematic as he is obviously only showing loyalty towards his own club but not to the actual concerned people.

On the 2nd of August 2019, The FC Schalke 04 board of directors explained that they have never experienced nothing but support from Tönnies and someone who identifies with the clubs' values. The club board regarded his apology as appropriate.[258]

Putting into perspective what Hirschman category indicates, the club recognizes the problem, but they are still trying to keep their loyalty to their CEO, who they owe a lot to in the club's history. On the other hand, the club leader has been heavily criticised for his statement. It is clear that those statements do not go along with the virtues of the club, which he seemed not to respect as a representative of the club. It also reinforces, that one, there is a financial dependency on a person as a club and therefore you are trying to take advantage of voice first than other consequences. On the other hand, Schalke as a club failed to recognize that his apology did not really target the actual insulted people. One can argue this on purpose to keep the loyalty towards him. However, the Ethics Committee of the German football association refused to continue their investigation in that case as they could not see any mean intention in Tönnies. Even though they classify Tönnies statements as a violation of the codes of the football association. However, the 63-year-old was able to convincingly convey that he was not a racist. As the German Football association, one could assume that they failed to set a meaningful statement. By showing backing the black people that were insulted and taking educational measures against Tönnies.[259] However, the reaction of fans, users, and celebrities regarding this Twitter post towards the statement of the Schalke 04's board differs from the statement. The majority of the users disagreed and boycotted the club's statement. It is noticeable that the users do not agree with the board that there are no consequences for the CEO. He apologised but he was not able to even address the actual targeted objective and the reaction of the club seems ridiculous according to the posts of users.

In order to demonstrate examples of those tweets, 10 comments under each Tweet were collected. Those 10 comments should reflect the type of comments that draw through the whole tweet. The users feel disappointed about how their club is handling the case and it shows in their comments under the original Twitter post:[260]

---

[258] „S04-Vorstand über Tönnies-Aussage". *Fußball*, 2. August 2019, https://schalke04.de/inside/s04-vorstand-ueber-toennies-aussage/ Accessed 05. May 2022.

[259] „Fall Tönnies: Ethik-Kommission des DFB verzichtet auf Verfahren". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/fall-toennies_ethik-kommission-des-dfb-verzichtet-auf-verfahren-756681/artikel. Accessed 05. Mai 2022.

[260] „https://twitter.com/s04/status/1157298751071019008". *Twitter*, https://twitter.com/s04/status/1157298751071019008. Accessed 05. Mai 2022.

@SO4 "You have your ass open, don't you? That was no excuse, these were 4 lines of empty words addressed to the completely wrong target group. Everyone who defends Tönnies after the action has damn not understood what FC Schalke 04 e.V. stands for!"[261]

„I am particularly disappointed in Peters, as it was he who took a clear stand on racism in the stadium on the MV. Apparently just hot air. What a pity. "[262]

"Seriously? That's it? This is pathetic and not worthy of FC Schalke 04."[263]

„Please, why doesn't the board take more time, check the feedback from the fans #Tönnies , consider what damage is currently being done to our club and then react appropriately, qualified, and credibly. If nothing more than this couplet happens here, I resign"[264]

„You have my #Austritt in your mailbox on Monday. As a reason, I am enclosing the mission statement of the
@s04 that you represent: "We show racism the red card and actively promote tolerance and fairness." Where is the red card for postcolonial racism in your own ranks?"[265]

"That's good and then that's enough. The statements are intolerable and unspeakably unworthy and inhuman. But he apologised. If Rudi had said it like that, everyone would have pushed it in his own way."[266]

"He is right - Africans are multiplying like crazy and instead of raising taxes in Germany, it is better to help the problem of environmental protection in industrialized countries"[267]

"An appeal to the players, finally shows political responsibility and positions yourself against such statements..."[268]

"If you don't think that, don't say that. Only someone who carries those believes within himself also speaks it out. A three-line, unbelievable statement doesn't help either. At some point, it is time to leave."[269]

Out of the shown 10 comments 9 were critical and 1 was supportive and arguably racist.

To summarise the comments, it is conspicuous that the replies confirm what Otto Addo said during the interview. According to him people take more positions and participate more and discuss racism since the era of social media. It can be argued that the possibility to complain

[261] Ibid.

[262] Ibid.

[263] Ibid.

[264] Ibid

[265] Ibid.

[266] Ibid.

[267]https://twitter.com/Nw300398/status/1157216646047645696?s=20&t=oYjuZ4a7kIMDDcClEOfNEw. Accessed 20. June 2022.

[268] https://twitter.com/marvolcomstoned/status/1157225871360561152?s=20&t=oYjuZ4a7kIMDDcClEOfNEw. Accessed 20. June 2022.

[269]https://twitter.com/Diddato04/status/1157220731488473088?s=20&t=oYjuZ4a7kIMDDcClEOfNEwAccessed 20. June 2022.

about certain things was ever more convenient than in the modern digital era. From the perspective of a club, it helps to take these platforms as it shows the parts where the club can definitely improve. Furthermore, the comments agree with the statements of Julian Bente when mentioning that fans would like to be informed and included in the clubs' happenings and topics. The availability of information and the platform enables it to the user to share thoughts and opinions on an incident regardless of agree or disagree, without being available at the actual match.[270] In Hirschman terms the reactions show that the users try to stand for the club's codes and use their twitter platform as voice to address it. Even though it is well known, how influential and what a financial impact he had on the club by supporting them in crisis or financing new players, the fans refuse to consider that in their opinion. They did not believe that he has to be treated differently, the majority of them demand that he has to accept the consequences and especially understand the problematic. Further they are not satisfied with how the club claimed to represent equality, anti-discrimination and in general the club's morals and values and yet fail to give an appropriate reaction. According to the Code of conduct on the club's official homepage of Schalke 04, the club explains their values. Schalke 04 stands for Unity, passion, and tolerance as important norms. The club points to the increasing need to meet legal social demands on the club, one crucial part is to tolerate each other. Social demands are tolerance for example and to convict those who harm tolerance. With these codes Schalke 04 as a club clearly distanced themselves from the incidents and actively participated in its combat like in this case. But the positioning in the case of Tönnies seems contractionary as they are neglecting their own statues by supporting the CEO. It could be argued that the club initially ignores their values to show loyalty.[271]

One fan even advised the club board to be more reflective and listen to the reaction of their fans. They even go further and threaten to resign as club members if that is how the club reacts. It confirms what Hirschman is saying an Exit is a cautioning sign of a threatening decline, therefore the club can benefit from providing space for criticism and improvements. If they are not able to provide room the consequence could be an exit as this user is saying and this would have wide consequences for the club as well. As they are losing important revenues. [272] There were rarely comments that support the apology of the CEO though some users stated that the statement inhuman and disrespectful, but mistakes are done, and apologies have to be accepted.

---

[270] Interview with Otto Addo 06.03.2022: min 45.14.

[271] „Code of Conduct". *Fußball*, https://schalke04.de/en/club/fc-schalke-04/code-of-conduct/. Accessed 15. May 2022.

[272] Hirschman 1970, p. 81.

In comparison to the previous chapter concerning racism, the availability of information and a platform to speak on was not given. Generally, there was no awareness of racism in general.

When Hirschman defined the third category loyalty. He believes that loyalty can impact the choice of whether choosing to exit or voice since the member must consider the worthiness of the possible outcome. In a Football club where strong loyalty by members is to be found, chances for a possible exit are mostly low.[273] In Hirschman terms this case indicated that the incidents were regardless of its outcome, it was worth applying pressure on the club. This occurred by criticising on, social media and protest by the fans in front of the club's stadium before a match led to the forced 3months resignation of Tönnies by the Schalke board. Putting the reaction of the fans into consideration of the Hirschman model, the fans and users succeed to make their voice heard. It shows that even though he has been helping the club throughout the club's history. Tönnies has been Chairman of the Schalke Supervisory Board since 2001. He also sat on the Schalke Economic Committee and the Urgent Committee for Sporting Decisions. Eventually, the club had to show a reaction according to the clubs' values.[274] Surely, one could argue why the Board did not put his club activities on hold immediately in the first place but instead waited till the voices around and outside the club became unavoidable. Yet there has been reconsideration of the case and a reaction which underlined their codes. It could have been different by just condemning the incidents and not taking any consequences. Football is the game, which lives mainly from the fans and their loyalty. As much as fans love this club, the Loyalty towards a club does not necessarily to tolerate the breach of the club's law. If a club therefore does not take the voice of their own fans into consideration it can have far reaching consequences such as protests, avoiding matches and resignation of memberships. Not only in terms of support there is a dependency on fans but also in marketing and sales. Moreover, regarding Partnerships and commercialising they are companies that do not necessarily wish to collaborate with a club which seems to tolerate any form discrimination.[275] In turn this again supports Hirschman assumption that Voice is more significant than exit in this case.[276] The black former Ghanaian and Schalke defender Hans Sarpei shared a statement on twitter regarding Tönnies' comment before he resigned:

"The statements of #Toennies shows a world view that is reminiscent of the colonial era. They are racist comments that are in no way compatible with the @s04 mission statement. As a

---

[273] Ibid.

[274] Welle (www.dw.com), Deutsche. „Bundesliga: Schalke Chairman Clemens Tönnies Resigns | DW | 30.06.2020". *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/en/bundesliga-schalke-chairman-clemens-t%C3%B6nnies-resigns/a-54001677. Accessed 07. May 2022.

[275] Ibid.

[276] Hirschman 1970. P. 33.

member, I would like the Honorary Council to take a clear position and discuss the consequences. "[277]

He continues, that these are statements which are not aligning the codes of FC Schalke 04 or our modern open society.[278] In the comment section of his post there was agreement in his statement to be found: "Absolutely right. There must be no place for racist shit at FC Schalke 04. Mr. Tönnies, draw the right conclusions, sincerely apologise, and resign immediately". [279] The statement shows the clear positioning of the fans towards the case and indicates that there is no other option than resignation. Another claimed that the values of their club got damaged and hurt: „It's hard to be an S04 fan after President Tönnies' unbearable words. An apology is no longer enough. The President has inflicted heavy damage on S04. There is only one consequence left! "[280]

Hans Sarpei calls out for consequences as he believes that Tönnies has been consciously stepping on the codes of the club, association, and human dignity.[281]

„Racism must have no place in society and must not remain without consequences, especially in management positions. Nor was it about Africa's energy supply or anything else. No relativizing racism please. "[282]

„That is not racist, it is the reality. "[283]

„However, the heavy clearing of forests for firewood and the explosion in population size are facts. Africa has the highest birth rate of any continent. It almost seems to me that some critics are also bothered that these topics were named. "[284]

„Unfortunately, true. I want more from Tönnies than just a succinct apology. I wish that he would reflect on his (racist) prejudices, work on himself, understand what it means to live as a black person in Germany, in Europe."[285]

The comments show that most of the users agree with his opinion. And it shows what has been mentioned in the documentary, former and active players should use their position to make aware of the problem and to educate people on this topic. Social media and especially Twitter as

---

[277] „https://twitter.com/hanssarpei/status/1157255399340412929". *Twitter*, https://twitter.com/hanssarpei/status/1157255399340412929. Accessed 08. May 2022.

[278] Ibid.

[279] https://twitter.com/hanssarpei/status/1157255399340412929. Accessed 08. May 2022.

[280] Ibid.

[281] Welle (www.dw.com), Deutsche. „Bundesliga: Schalke Chairman Clemens Tönnies Resigns | DW | 30.06.2020". *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/en/bundesliga-schalke-chairman-clemens-t%C3%B6nnies-resigns/a-54001677. Accessed 10. May 2022.

[282] Ibid.

[283] Ibid

[284] Ibid.

[285] Ibid.

a platform serves to be a convenient way to share thoughts and comments on an important topic of our society. But especially it shows the perceived urgency of a player who is in concern of the club as a member and concerned as he felt attacked as a black person. The Twitter account of the German Twitter newspaper *Der Spiegel* posted a statement of former black German National forward Gerald Asamoah where says that: he felt insulted and everyone else that is concerned felt insulted as well. Under the post one could find different replies under the posting of the German newspaper: some were agreeing with the Schalke Legend, various comments disagreed and failed to address the main problem of Tönnies statement:

"Asamoah is German, so why is he offended by critical statements about Africans? Ask for an explanation!"[286]

„But he didn't even apologise to those to whom his statements referred."[287]

„It is simply grotesque not to be asked to name one of Africa's biggest problems."[288]

„Resignation is probably the only thing that is right now   @s04"[289]The other side does not necessarily show agreements or understanding for the player but more not understanding statements and partly racist comments. Referring to Asamoah, a user stated that he is German as he is well known for playing for Germany. At the same time, it is well known that he also has its roots in Ghana as he was born and raised there. Another user suggests that the allegedly biggest problem of Africa, should be addressed differently and not by insulting its people.

These comments prove moreover what scholar John Suler says in his concept of *online disinhibition effect*. It supports the hypothesis of dissociative anonymity and physical invisibility.[290]

The effect generally explains that a person would necessarily say and behave differently on the internet as they would usually in person, regardless of if positive or negative. Anonymity on the Internet allows the use of an alternative identity, such as a pseudonym.[291]

Suler explains that concerned people are convinced that their invented personality has nothing to do with their real-life personality. The idea of Dissociative anonymity enables a detachment from the moral concepts of their identity in everyday life. The physical invisibility of the users could

---

[286] „https://twitter.com/derspiegel/status/1158302166164971520". *Twitter*, https://twitter.com/derspiegel/status/1158302166164971520. Accessed 06. May 2022.

[287] Ibid.

[288] Ibid.

[289] Ibid.

[290] Suler, J. 2004, p. 321-322.

[291] Ibid.

lead to the absence of non-verbal communication, such as facial expressions, gestures, and intonation, as well as to the absence of a visible reaction of the other person. This can reduce empathy. In addition, an image and a voice of the other person is created in one's own imagination, which comes from oneself. Further, the increasing use of technology and media in everyday life can reduce empathy. There is a minimization of status and authority online because both are initially not recognizable, from which a disinhibition in communication can follow.[292] Finally, as these replies on Twitter show, the above-mentioned factors of Suler have the potential to promote racist behaviour and comments on social media platforms. But on the other hand, it is observable that there is room provided on platforms such as Twitter to freely express racist and non-racist opinions.[293]

6.2 Responding to racist fans

A similar case which went out from fans, can be observed when in February 2021 Hertha BSC's player Jordan Torunarigha was racially insulted by fans during the match against Schalke 04. Additionally, the striker saw the red card. Jordan Torunarigha was born on 7 August 1997 in Chemnitz, Germany by Nigerian parents. His father Ojokojo Torunarigha was playing as a forward for Chemnitzer FC during the 1990's. His son Jordan Torunarigha has been playing for all German youth teams. After the second-round match between Schalke 04 and Hertha BSC, the result of the match faded into the background. Berliners complained about racist chants against their player.[294] The referees during the match failed to have the right response and sensitivity for the situation. The referee team argued that they did not hear any racist comments in the stadium. Even after Hertha BSC coach Jürgen Klinsmann indicated to him that his player was being insulted by parts of the Schalke fans, he refused to take measures instead he showed the player the red card as he kicked the water crate out of emotional reaction.[295] Torunarigha's Club Hertha, shared a statement of their player on twitter where he shared his thoughts and inner feelings on his personal social media account on Instagram. He explains that he was born and raised in Germany, speaks German, and went to a German school. Therefore, he feels that the statements by some idiots are not reasonable. "I'm glad I'm lucky enough to have such support from my family, my teammates, and the club! "The statement points out that he feels appreciated and supported by the club as they keep backing him during those situations. This differs with the

---

[292] Ibid. P. 323-324.

[293] Ibid. P. 322-323.

[294] Bark 2021, accessed 09.05.2021

[295] „Torunarigha ‚hat geweint und wollte aufhören' - Schneiders klare Worte". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/torunarigha_hat_geweint_und_wollte_aufhoeren_schneiders_klare_worte-768895/artikel. Accessed 03. Mai 2022.

58

positioning of the football clubs in the era of Erwin Kostedde, Gerald Asamoah and Otto Addo. The players claimed to not receive any support at all from their clubs, teammates nor from the society. They felt that defending yourself was pointless as no one would support you anyway. So, the only option was forcibly to stay calm or to exit which would have consequences as not finding any other suitable club at that time. Growing up as a son of a former football player for FC Chemnitz in East Germany he was familiar with racism in his daily life. He justified his emotional reaction by explaining that you cannot choose skin-colour at birth, and it shouldn't play any role anyway he stated.[296] Tourunarigha does what Otto Addo advocated. As a football player in his active career, you had a different value in society. Nowadays athletes have you use their platform as he does in order to help combat racism. And this is only achievable if you have the support by the clubs, association and especially by the fans. In an official statement on the club's website, Schalke 04 explained that there is no room for racism in this club:[297] "On the part of the association, there is zero tolerance for such behaviour. We will do everything we can to identify those who are responsible for this and to prove them with consequences.[298] The statement and the positioning is clear from Hirschman's perspective it seems to condemn the incidents. Generally, it is striking that Schalke 04 really tries to stick to their club codes as it was to be observed with the case of Clemens Tönnies. The difference here is that racist attack went off from the very own club CEO who is supposed to embody all the values, and, in this case, it went off by an anonymous group of fans. Social manager Bente already mentioned that it is nowadays impossible to not firstly position and secondly actively combat against racism. While clubs show their positioning in discriminating incidents like these it shows for example how racism is perceived by the Club. It is not only an issue of the players alone it concerns the clubs and their morals and values which they stand for. Opposing Team coach David Wagner of Schalke 04 stated: "I didn't hear the chants, but I want to apologise on behalf of Schalke 04, that's not to tolerate," Wagner said. For the fans who insulted Torunarigha, he demanded quick consequences: "In England, the person is immediately grabbed and then out"[299]

Torunarigha's Teammate and defender Niklas Stark emphasised that we must support our teammates and opponent players as a team, as a club and especially as a whole country.[300] The case of the Hertha player caught much attention in the social world. Former national player Jerome Boateng showed support towards Torunarigha by expressing his displeasure about the

---

[296] https://www.dw.com/en/hertha-berlins-jordan-torunarigha-speaks-out-after-alleged-racial-abuse/a-52281959 Accessed 11.04.2022.

[297] „Torunarigha ‚hat geweint und wollte aufhören' - Schneiders klare Worte". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/torunarigha_hat_geweint_und_wollte_aufhoeren_schneiders_klare_worte-768895/artikel. Accessed 03. May 2022.

[298] Ibid.

[299] Ibid.

[300] Ibid.

incident that happened in a multicultural and diverse Germany during 2021.[301] His opinion shows that this is not supposed to happen nowadays, but it was the daily life for players in the 1960 as Erwin Kostedde and Jimmy Hartwig. It was normal to be alone and to not experience support from team clubs. Considering the Hirschman concept, exit was the only option whereas the case of Torunarigha showed that you don't have to tolerate everything that happens to you. Considering the historical context with the German society, the number of black players and the availability of information it was difficult to speak up. Schalke 04 has been taking many measures in the form of campaigns against racism in the past. The most recent with an action under the slogan: "Stand up if you are Schalke. Stand up when you are human." Fan initiatives also repeatedly campaigned against xenophobia. Those actions correlate with Eintracht Frankfurt campaigns, where they do these campaigns to keep remembering people of the importance of this topic. The hosts showed solidarity with the Hertha player. Yet this did not save Schalke from a penalty. FC Schalke 04 has been fined 50,000 euros there of a part is supposed to be donated for a charity. for the racist chants of some of their fans. This verdict was made by the sports court of the German Football Association (DFB).[302] Nevertheless, even though there has been encouragement, predominant positive reaction from clubs' players and users online on Twitter, the case on the pitch still showed that there is room for improvement in how the referee team handled the situation. The referee was informed about the racist chants by the Berlin coach, yet he gave Torunarigha a red card because he reacted emotionally by kicking the crate although he got insulted.[303] The cases of Tönnies and now Torunarigha do not hold the same measurement by the German Football association. One can argue that there are measures to punish concerned clubs and people, but there is no clear scheme to be followed. It is questionable that the referees during the match failed to have the right response and sensitivity for the situation. The referee team claimed that they did not hear any racist remarks during the stadium. Even after Hertha BSC coach Jürgen Klinsmann indicated to him that his player was being insulted by part of the Schalke fans, he refused to take measures instead he showed the player the red card as he kicked the water crate out of emotional reaction. [304] In order to combat racism and any form of discrimination accordingly the UEFA & FIFA association created the *three steps protocol*.[305] The concept allows referees, in the match of serious discriminatory incidents to either stop the match, which is followed by an announcement with a corresponding explanation and a call to stop.

---

[301] „https://twitter.com/jeromeboateng/status/1225054884279402496". *Twitter*,
https://twitter.com/jeromeboateng/status/1225054884279402496. Zugegriffen 15. Mai 2022.
opened 10. May 2022.

[302] Ibid.

[303] „Torunarigha ‚hat geweint und wollte aufhören' - Schneiders klare Worte". *kicker*,
https://www.kicker.de/torunarigha_hat_geweint_und_wollte_aufhoeren_schneiders_klare_worte-768895/artikel.
Accessed 03. Mai 2022.

[304] Ibid.

[305] https://digitalhub.fifa.com/m/20dc9a5c0c772ec5/original/sn7trsj9kkrbufhobcx2-pdf.pdf. Accessed 11. May 2022.

Further, a referee can suspend a match and send the players back into the changing room, which is again followed by announcements and the request to stop. If this is the case, the referee team can decide to abandon the match and to leave the stadium in accordance with the stadium and security directions.[306] Applying this concept has caught heavy criticism, for example, after the racist insults against Jordan Torunarigha during the DFB-Cup match between Schalke 04 and Hertha BSC.[307] After seeing the replay of the match, he insisted that it happened but refused to react as the incident was not 20min ago and therefore not in the context of the match any longer. It can be argued that it does not play any role when racist chants and actions take place. There has to be measures. It proves that it takes the responsibility of every individual in a collective. Maybe the German Football association should work more hand in hand as they already do or just try to take those situations more seriously. Because from the perspective of Hirschman, we could argue the association is positioning their self-right but here they seemed to fail to react appropriately when the situation requires measures. Even though there is more backing from the boards, this could have the consequence that German Football associations tend to not meet the social demands on Germany as a country. However, the DFB must put up with the question of whether football has always taken advantage of all possibilities in the past to unequivocally oppose racist and discriminatory statements and to protect those affected. In the recent past, however, there have also been encouraging examples of how effectively football can combat racism.[308] When Leroy Kwadwo was racially insulted during a third-division match, the fans, Preußen Münster and the Würzburger Kickers, in the referee Katrin Rafalski and the DFB as well as the entire 3rd German Football division sent a clear message by: Red card to racism![309] It just proves German Football always had issues with racism especially due to its NS-Regime past, but shows that there has been changes in the perception of racism in German society also due to the impact of social media.

6.3 The Gauland case

In spring 2016 German right-wing politician and chairman AFD chairman (Alternative for Germany) Alexander Gauland shared a statement in a German Newspaper, that people respect and appreciate Jerome Boateng as a player, but they wouldn't like him to be their neighbour. Within this case Zuber confirms the impact which the media has for right-wing populist

---

[306] Ibid.

[307] https://www.dfb.de/news/detail/faq-zur-anwendung-des-drei-stufen-plans- Accessed 11. May 2022.

[308] Ibid.

[309] https://thesportsrush.com/preusen-munster-fans-inspiringly-fights-against-racism-while-defending-opposite-player. Accessed 17. April.

messages. This case is triggered by making headline and by promoting the German right-wing party *Alternative for Germany* (AFD). This statement caught much attention in the German society, and it approves that it is caused among others for the entertainment of media consuming citizens. Furthermore, the Statement calls up similarities to the concept of foreign workers in Germany within the 1960s/70s. The government followed a policy where they tried to make foreign workers leave after they supported the German economy, by giving them short-terminated contract. Which could raise up what Gauland implies here, he believes Boateng who is the son of a immigrants is only welcome because of his merits as a football player for Germany such as winning the Worldcup 2014, but he allegedly would not be appreciated as Neighbour. Gauland portrayed Boateng in the tabloid as a "good" immigrant. As David Zimmermann mentions in previous research the tabloid media supports the social debate about 'good' or 'bad' immigrants in a populistic way by outlining symbolically a threat posed by the alleged 'alienation' by immigrants from abroad.[310] In this context, it must be stated that this media violence has a direct share of responsibility for the dissemination and reproduction of the of racism. The case corroborates what was already mentioned in the previous research chapter, right wing populist will try to benefit from the media by sharing sensitive statements regarding racism and xenophobia. With short headlines, latent xenophobic and racist attitudes can be reinforced.[311] Furthermore, the tabloid media in particular support the social debate about 'good' or 'bad' immigrants in a populistic way by outlining symbolically a threat posed by the alleged 'alienation' by immigrants from abroad.[312] However, this case is a new dimension where a different actor as a Politician shares racist thoughts to promote the values of his party Alternative for Germany. A statement followed by a comment of DFB President Reinhard Grindel saying that the fans do love their national team the way it is, which indicates the multicultural image which Germany tries to represent.[313] The Statement was needed, the German National team back then consisted of at least 8 players with multicultural backgrounds. From the Hirschman perspective no reaction would mean that Germany does not value and protect their players. Furthermore, the consequence would be that the process of integrating players with different backgrounds stumbles. Vice versa if there would have been no loyalist from the German side towards their player Boateng, it would have made the impression as they would only appreciate him for his performances and his achievements rather than him as a personality. In that case exit would have been an option for Jerome Boateng. The example of the right-wing politician Gauland proved

[310] Zuber 2015, P. 213-215.
[311] Zimmermann 2005, P. 20.
[312] Zuber 2015, P. 213-215.
[313] *ZEIT ONLINE | Lesen Sie zeit.de mit Werbung oder im PUR-Abo. Sie haben die Wahl.*https://www.zeit.de/zustimmung?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.zeit.de%2Fpolitik%2Fdeutschland%2F2016-05%2Falexander-gauland-afd-vorabmeldung. Accessed 10. May 2022.

the changed attitude of the German Society towards their national team. While Kostedde suffered under loneliness and getting taunted by his own fans' player nowadays suffer from racism too, but not to the extent that they would have no support. Moreover, Kostedde stated in documentary, that during his career you could only make it and be supported in the German National Team if you are white. In the documentary and regarding Germanys history this seemed true as it seemed concomitant with the statements of the other players.[314] In this case it is arguable if Kostedde's projectable on Boateng and Gauland because the Fans do support him and rejected Gauland's statement. During the next match the majority of German fans condemned Garland's statement and showed solidarity by holding a signs and banners which stated "Jerome please be our neighbour"[315] It is obvious that racism is still a contemporary topic in Football, but this example showed we went from the Kostedde period where fans were screaming that they do not want black players in their team to welcoming Jerome Boateng. Jimmy Hartwig commented how unbelievable it was that a German politician talks like that about our national player. According to Hartwig it is a disgrace. People who insult others due to their skin-colour, heritage and religion have not learned from the past.[316] Considering Gaulands political view, it does not come surprisingly, nothing different is to be expected from a right-wing politician. The reaction off and on the field was positive users, athletes, politician, and other public figures took a standby supporting the German player on various social media platforms as we can see this with these examples:

„Before the pandemic, I actually thought: If you have a professor's title, at least you can't be stupid, and you have proven that you can deal with facts rationally. That was wrong. And to an extent that I would not have thought possible 2-3 years ago. "[317]

@DLF People think #Gauland sucks as a player and they don't want him either as a neighbour or as a politician[318]

---

[314] Black eagles' documentary 2021, 32:33min.

[315]https://www.faz.net/aktuell/politik/inland/afd-vize-gauland-beleidigt-jerome-boateng-14257743.html. 17 April 2022.

[316] Ibid.

[317] https://twitter.com/DLFNachrichten/status/736888716392828928?s=20&t=a38oCrkUl3ZqEIpMQ-Mf5g. Accessed 29. April 2022.

[318]Ibid.

The replies on the post on Twitter by a user highlighted that people on social media do not care about one's position if you have a title or etc. This is how social media helps to distinguish who holds racist values.

Summarising the three cases, the solidarity and the willing engagement is striking on Twitter. Surely there will be people that still have their values, but the tendency nowadays is going in the right direction compared to the past. This also shows that racism is not a private concern in Germany anymore but affects everyone that lives in the country. However, the stadium is to some extent always a reflection of the society as we see with the Gauland case. There will probably always be right-wing fans. It is therefore also up to politics whether it makes right-wing parties socially acceptable or tries to fight them politically. This case of showed, that it did not get the confirmation in the society that he and his right-wing party maybe hoped for, even though it was trending on several social media platforms. Jonas Zuber argued that social media can be observed contributor to the spread and reinforcement of racism but in Gauland's case the reaction of the fans on and off social media proved the opposite.

This is a reason why the Hirschman model is suitable for this study as it is considering every actor's perspective and the relation between them. Summarising the findings of the analysis of the data we could observe that the clubs and associations seem to perhaps have the authority to make a difference by changing the policy against racism. The social media manager of Eintracht Frankfurt showed that policy making for usage of official club channels on social media, does not come from the players but the club. This cannot come from the players as they cannot per se change policies, but they can contribute by sharing standpoints and views regarding this topic as we saw with Torunarigha case and the responses to a racist politician on social media. The club must provide a platform where their players and fans can speak up. And players can take advantage from their own role model function. On the other hand, making a change does not necessarily only ground in the club's interest of combating racism. Their actions could perhaps also rather come from realising losing revenues if the fans are leaving since the fans follow if the club might lose players. If clubs take a standpoint when their players get treated badly, fans will perhaps *voice* or follow due to their connection to their favourite players. Simultaneously, the model shows how to direct people in the right direction by showing the possible outcomes, consequences and how the way we view racism can be changed. Reviewing Twitter cases several different actors such as a CEO, fans, and politician   the responses proved that social media does not really care about your position about your title. It proved that your social status has a different impact on the society. One would not expect racist remarks from a CEO of a Football club, who is supposed to advertise the clubs' values. The Hertha case showed that racist fans

have a different impact on racism in Football as a CEO. This could be due to the fact they are allegedly more liberal in expressing their opinions. Lastly, the reaction of a German right- wing politician does not come surprisingly as he represents different values than CEO. Regardless of the position the racist incidents cases should not be justified with different positions. Summing up, the Twitter incidents of the digital era with the analysis of racist incidents in Germany from the 1960's to early 2000's there were major differences in the perception and positioning towards racism. Clubs did not support their players when they had to. One of the similarities comparing the interview with the documentary was that all the interviewed players from the pre social media era did not have any platform to speak up. Given the historical context from the 1960's onwards one could get the impression that racism was normalised because clubs refused to help their players. The self-conception of players such as Kostedde was not like the digital era. Speaking up had the consequences of not being considered anymore. Those similarities and distinctions could indicate a significant impact or change in racism. However, social media as a leverage can help to understand the development of racism in German football. The German media within the 1960's to 1990's raised a normalised impression of racism.

7   Conclusions

In my studies where I talked about Racism on and off the Football field. I discussed racism and the responses to racism in German Football from the pre-digital era to the present. Before I discussed the topic, I introduced the reader to this study by explaining previous research about this topic in order to understand the background of this topic. From a historical perspective Racism has always manifested itself. The threat of the 'different' immigrants with a migration background has thus been a politically topical debate for about 120 years in Germany.[319]

Especially the historical alleged ‚contamination of the ‚German race' by foreign immigrants seems virtually timeless.[320] The 'Gastarbeiter' (guest-worker) period in Germany during 1950's and 1960's for example indicated that immigration, migration, integrations policies and racism have always been on social and political agenda. And its truthiness was confirmed in the given documentary for instance. The term racism had to be explained but the study did not aim to define and explain the different forms of racism. Rather, all forms of racism against black people in the context of media and sports. The objective of the study was to analyse the responses of players, fans, and clubs in the pre-social media era and on social media towards racist cases. In order to compare the responses of the different actors I was mainly using three different forms of sources in the study. Namely interviews, documentary film and social media postings. In the analysis of the sources, the exit, voice, loyalty-model by Hirschman served as a framework to help to understand the responses in the data. The respective categories in the model – *exit, voice and loyalty* were applied on the particular source to show whether the individuals who are player and fans or the club made use of an exit, used their voice, or stayed quiet in connection to racist incidents in the Bundesliga, Germany's highest football league. The analysis of the sources was divided into the respective periods. While analysing the material of the pre social media period I firstly compared the statements of the interview which was conducted with former black Footballer and current coach, Otto Addo with the German documentary Black eagles from 2021. Those commonalities and distinctions could indicate a significant impact or change. Based on the data material, the correlation between the different responses and the football Club, fans, and players was showcased. One question that this study dealt with was therefore how racism was perceived in the pre-social media era within the Bundesliga. The second source of this study was

---

[319] Ibid, P. 155.
[320] Ibid.

this documentary. In the documentary black former football players gave first hand testimonies of the racism they experienced in the German football world, from the 1960's till nowadays. One of the similarities comparing the interview with the documentary was that all the interviewed players from the pre social media era did not have any platform to speak up. One could get the impression that racism was normalised because clubs refused to help their players. Talking about normalisation, the form of racism that occurred could be identified as institutional racism. The German media form of TV-Commercials raised a normalised impression of racism. From the Hirschman lens, we can now say that loyalty in a form of support was not given. Given the fact that according to the Documentary there were not many black players represented in the League and the society was not familiar with them. The self-conception of the players such as Kostedde was not as nowadays: the player explained the feeling of not belonging to Germany as a country and the feeling of being alone did not encourage to speak up. Speaking up had the consequences of not being considered anymore.

Kostedde reported that the only way of combating racism was to punish the behaviour with good performances. On the other hand, a good performance brought respect as a footballer but not as a person. This indicated the support in a form of loyalty was only given under special terms. If you were not performing good enough, you would be chosen as scapegoat as Kostedde stated. Additionally, the cases in the documentary can be as well portrayed as institutional racism.

Players were not always selected on ability but even then Kostedde stated as a black player and especially the first black player that played for the German national team would always make you feel monitored by others. The second part of the study was to discuss racism and its responses in the digital era. I emphasised how social media impacted the combat of racism. However, the idea of social media within Football clubs is also to merchandise the club, to gain range and to provide proximity to the fans. Fans want to be close to their idols. They want to know more about their private life and norms and values. Being closer to players creates identification and relatability.

Meanwhile players were only connected to football in the pre digital era. Due to Twitter's data accessibility the social media platform served as a platform of sources. The way Twitter is concepted as a microblogging platform it provides users a stage to share every opinion initially without a filter. [321] Within the era of social media there have been various cases of racist incidents in Europe's Football top leagues. Several cases took place in German Football and were discussed off the pitch on social media platforms. The majority of the responses to all three cases were denial on social platforms. Regardless of being a fan, musician or politician people condemned the behaviour and their statements which reflects in their actions. The Findings of

---

[321] „Twitter: Number of Users Worldwide 2020". Statista, https://www.statista.com/statistics/303681/twitter-users-worldwide/. Accessed 15. Mai 2022.

the Tönnies case showed structures of racism by limiting and creating prejudice towards black people. Additionally, it shed a bad light on Schalke 04 norms and clubs as a value. The case portrayed a CEO of the club that failed to stand as an example for his club. The case proved that racism did not necessarily change, the institutional structures from the past are still present. The new social racism in comparison to the past manifests itself by a trivialized concept of xenophobia such as a higher innate crime rate, lower productivity, lower cognitive abilities and much more.[322] The case studies proved that social media provides, on the other hand a more vulnerable platform to make racist remarks but on the other hand according to the findings of the analysed cases one can see that fans have a different position towards it compared to the past. Schalke fans, former players, refused Tönnies statement and forced the club with protest to pause Tönnies' position as he is not representing the clubs' values. The club followed with action after initially trying to hold on him. The reactions of the fans show the loyalty towards the club, and their values of tolerating diversity in Germany. Comparing this incident with the case of Hertha BSC players Jordan Torunarigha, the racist chants were going out from a fan. It differs from Tönnies as fans have more liberty to express themselves during an emotional stage of a match compared to a CEO of a Bundesliga club who serves as a representative of a club. This does not justify racist remarks of the fans, but it shows on which different levels on and off the pitch racism occurs. While Torunarigha got insulted by fans during the match , Tönnies made racist remarks towards Africans during a speech where he originally suggested the idea to build more powerhouses in Africa. One could observe his fellow teammates and the board of his club backed him by promising action and not tolerating this behaviour in the 21st century. After the match he stated that he was thankful for the reaction. Comparing Kostedde during his career, he explained that support was not to be found from any whether from the club, teammates, or the society. Lastly, the findings of right-wing politician Alexander Gauland towards Jerome Boateng showed his advertisement of the value of his party *Alternative for Germany*. It doesn't surprise that racist remarks come from a right-wing politician, yet it does not explain what he said but compared to Tönnies case it has a different impact as he represents a whole club. The case showcased the change of the perception of racism in German society. Fans of the German national team showed solidarity by holding signs that conceded solidarity towards Jerome Boateng when getting insulted by the politician. It is conspicuous that the cases contained structures of institutional racism by limiting and creating prejudice towards black people. Right-wing populism, therefore, adapts the long tradition of racism in a new, modernised guise and re-establishing it in broad areas in societies of European countries.[323] The devaluation of certain groups of people is made within right-wing populism by devaluating and discriminating against them which was striking in the case of right-wing politician Alexander Gauland. The case proved

---

[322] Zuber, P. 207-208.

[323] Betz, Hans-Georg (1998): Rechtspopulismus: Ein internationaler Trend? in: Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte, Beilage zur Wochenzeitung Das Parlament, B 9-10, 3-12, Bonn, S. 5.

that racism brought a modified version of racism which adapted to current needs, but the alleged motivations are the same.[324] The historical economic crisis in the past in the course of the employment of foreign workers caused several problems such as the tension between Germans and foreigners. The society had anxieties about their future and existence due to the foreign workers which made them regard foreigners as the scapegoat. But since the reforms which brought change of the migration policy at the end of the 1990s, it has overcome that immigrant in Germany are not "guests", anymore. This does not automatically mean that the problematic of racism in society and especially football has completely vanished as the modern cases around Tönnies, Gauland etc. showed. But naturalising has become more convenient nowadays than in the past. And multiculturalism is more positive accepted than it used to. One consequence of these reforms is that society is no longer divided into "Germans" and "foreigners" in public discourse. The German national team nowadays and the German society are reflection of those turns in contrast to the past. Moreover, thereby we can observe how the digital era and social media especially contributes to the abatement, spread and reinforcement of racism. Among other the arrival of right-wing populist proves that media can create social conflicts and problem situations as an important everyday discourse for their advantage. In this context, it must be stated that media violence has a direct share of responsibility for the dissemination and of racism in the past and present. The institutional racism and white supremacy portrayed itself in various positions of German society as the selection of actors showed in the cases. Especially, the historical discussion of Germany migration background in addition with documentary proved how foreigners and in particular black players were suffering daily and how white supremacy was lived out in society. For example, in the media, advertisements indicated that black people were inferior to white ones. The cases prove what the social media manager of Eintracht Frankfurt said, a club without social media is nowadays impossible. The club needs a platform for their fans to speak up regarding every topic. One can assume if people were provided at stage to share their thoughts and opinions back then, there would maybe have been more voices against it. Furthermore, it also proves what the theory of Hirschman indicated, if a club provides a platform for *voice* where they can address and comment on things that happen around the club the less likely it is to exit from the institution. If there is no voice exit is the only option which can lead to a collapse of a club according to Hirschman. Voice proved to be beneficial as the club can improve themselves. The example of the Schalke fan regarding Tönnies statement proved that fans wish to be more included sometimes before taking an important decision. Yet in the same way as social media is beneficial for fans and users simultaneously it shows that those platforms such as Twitter are, despite their controls and filters, still vulnerable for racist attacks and contractionary statements. The findings of the essay show the lack of information availability

---

[324] Ibid, P. 190-191.

impacted the experience and engagement with racism in the past. And since it was normalised anyway not many people would question it. Comparing those incidents with the digital era it is to be confirmed racism still manifested itself even in times of social media. The findings of the Twitter cases indicated the impact of the social media platforms and the influence of users on the clubs. Without being in the stadium fans and social media users can instantly find out what happened during matchday and give their opinion. The decisive difference between the past and pre-social-media era. Germany altered for diversity. The self-conception of the people changed. There are more people with an ethical background who are native to Germany. Simultaneously Clubs and players changed their virtues too, while clubs used to refuse to position themselves. Otto Addo stated it is not possible to consider yourself only as a football player. It is impossible to not take a clear position against racism as the responsible person for Eintracht Frankfurt confirmed. Considering the background of today's demographic change in the German society, foreign citizens have become even more important to the Federal Republic's economy and its multicultural society. It is striking that without them, Germany's role model function would not be possible. Thus, the historical effects of support from foreign citizens on the German society were and are still consistently impactful in the 21st century. The foreign population has developed into a permanent and supportive component of Germany. The investigated case studies demonstrate that fans engage more intensively with racism. This can be pro or against racism. However, the cases proved that the majority of the Fans position themselves clearly against racist remarks on and off the pitch. Summarising the findings of the investigation of racism and its responses in the pre social media era and digital era, one can clearly observe that there has been a change in the conception of racism in from the past to present day in a positive way. There are more benefits from it than disadvantages compared to the pre-social media era.

Sources and literature

Unpublished sources

Interview with Otto Addo 06.03.2022. 20minutes long.

Interview with Julia Bente, Social Media Manager of Eintracht Frankfurt, Germany. 09.05.2022.

Black eagles' documentary (2021). https://www.zdf.de/sport/zdf-sportreportage/fussball-dfb-nationalmannschaft-schwarze-adler-doku-100.html Accessed 05. May 2020.

Online sources

Bark, Marcus. „Rassistische Übergriffe gegen Herthas Torunarigha: ‚... dann kicken wir nicht weiter‘“. *Der Spiegel*, 5. Februar 2020. *www.spiegel.de*, https://www.spiegel.de/sport/fussball/jordan-torunarigha-von-hertha-bsc-rassistisch-beleidigt-dann-kicken-wir-nicht-weiter-a-d9368f1d-4b53-49a2-b234-d56a1b891187.

„Clemens Tönnies empört mit rassistischen Aussagen". *Der Spiegel*, 2. August 2019. *www.spiegel.de*, https://www.spiegel.de/wirtschaft/unternehmen/clemens-toennies-empoert-mit-rassistischen-aussagen-ueber-afrikaner-a-1280178.html. Accessed 14. April 2022.

„Erwin Kostedde: ‚Schwarze Spieler werden in Deutschland immer zweite Wahl sein‘ | DW | 05.04.2021“. *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/de/erwin-kostedde-schwarze-spieler-werden-in-deutschland-immer-zweite-wahl-sein/a-55246926. Accessed 17. April 2022.

„Fall Tönnies: Ethik-Kommission des DFB verzichtet auf Verfahren". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/fall-toennies_ethik-kommission-des-dfb-verzichtet-auf-verfahren-756681/artikel. Accessed 15. May 2022.

Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung. https://www.faz.net/aktuell/politik/inland/afd-vize-gauland-beleidigt-jerome-boateng-14257743.html. 17 April 2022.

Kein Platz für Rassismus - Eintracht Frankfurt Klub". *Eintracht Frankfurt*, https://klub.eintracht.de/soziales-engagement/kein-platz-fuer-rassismus/. Accessed 15. May 2022.

„Torunarigha ‚hat geweint und wollte aufhören‘ - Schneiders klare Worte". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/torunarigha_hat_geweint_und_wollte_aufhoeren_schneiders_klare_worte-768895/artikel. Accessed 03. May 2022.

Welle Welle (www.dw.com), Deutsche. „Bundesliga: Schalke Chairman Clemens Tönnies Resigns | DW | 30.06.2020". *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/en/bundesliga-schalke-chairman-clemens-t%C3%B6nnies-resigns/a-54001677. Accessed 15. Mai 2022.

*ZEIT ONLINE | Lesen Sie zeit.de mit Werbung oder im PUR-Abo. Sie haben die Wahl.*https://www.zeit.de/zustimmung?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.zeit.de%2Fpolitik%2Fdeutschland%2F2016-05%2Falexander-gauland-afd-vorabmeldung. Accessed 10. May 2022.

https://twitter.com/dlfnachrichten/status/736888716392828928. Accessed 16. April 2022.

https://twitter.com/s04/status/1157298751071019008. Accessed 05. Mai 2022.

https://twitter.com/dlfnachrichten/status/736888716392828928. Accessed 05. Mai 2022.

https://twitter.com/jeromeboateng/status/1225054884279402496". Accessed 12. May 2022.

https://twitter.com/s04/status/1157298751071019008?s=20&t=Ku7AlSBeu-pzVeFLpFMWXQ Accessed 17.June 2022.

https://twitter.com/marvolcomstoned/status/1157225871360561152?s=20&t=oYjuZ4a7kIMDDcClEOfNEw. Accessed 20. June 2022.

https://twitter.com/Diddato04/status/1157220731488473088?s=20&t=oYjuZ4a7kIMDDcClEOfNEw. Accessed 20. June 2022.

Literature

Ahmed, W., Bath, P. and Demartini, G. (2017) Chapter 4 Using Twitter as a Data Source: An Overview of Ethical, Legal, and Methodological Challenges. In: Woodfield, K., (ed.) The Ethics of Online Research. Advances in Research Ethics and Integrity (2). Emerald , p. 79-107.

Aichner, Thomas. (2019). Football clubs' social media use and user engagement. Marketing Intelligence & Planning. 37. p. 242-257.

Aichner, Thomas. (2021) Matthias Grünfelder, Oswin Maurer, and Deni Jegeni.Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking. p. 215-222.

Behn, S., & Schwenzer, V. (2006). Rassismus, Fremdenfeindlichkeit und Rechtsextremismus im Zuschauerverhalten und Entwicklung von Gegenstrategien. Wandlungen des Zuschauerverhaltens im Profifußball.

Betz, Hans-Georg (1998): Rechtspopulismus: Ein internationaler Trend?, in: Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte, Beilage zur Wochenzeitung Das Parlament, B 9-10, 3-12, Bonn.

Bennett, H. & Jönsson, A. (2017). Klick it out: Tackling online discrimination in football. In Kilvington, D., Price, J. (Eds.), Sport and discrimination, London, England: Routledge. p. 203–214.

Bradbury, S., 2013. Institutional racism, whiteness, and the under-representation of minorities in leadership positions in football in Europe. Soccer and Society, 14 (3), p.296-314.

Burdsey, D. (Ed.). (2011). Race, Ethnicity and Football: Persisting Debates and Emergent Issues (1st ed.). Routledge.

Cleland, J. (2014) 'Racism, Football Fans, and Online Message Boards: How Social Media Has Added a New Dimension to Racist Discourse in English Football', Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 38(5), p. 415–431.

Dembowski, G., & Scheidle, J. (2002). Tatort Stadion: Rassismus, Antisemitismus und Sexismus im Fußball (1. Aufl.). Köln: PapyRossa-Verl. P. 195.

Farrington, N., Hall, L., Kilvington, D., Price, J., & Saeed, A. (2014). Sport, Racism and Social Media (1st ed.). Routledge. Chapter 5. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203794807

Gabler, J. (2009). Ultrakulturen und Rechtsextremismus: Fußballfans in Deutschland und Italien (1. Aufl.). Köln: Freie Universität Berlin.

Glaser, J., and Kahn, K.B. (2005) 'Prejudice and discrimination and the Internet', The social Psychology of the Internet, P. 247-274.

Heitmeyer, W., & Peter, J.-I. (1988). Jugendliche Fußballfans: soziale und politische Orientierungen, Gesellungsformen, Gewalt. Weinheim [u.a.]: Juventa-Verl.

Hirschman, Albert. (1972) Exit, Voice, and Loyalty. [Edition missing]. 1972. Reprint, Harvard University Press, 1972.

Hylton, K. (2013) 'Dispositions to „race" and racism on the internet: online reactions to a ‚racist' comment against Tiger Woods' CERS Working Paper, University of Leeds.

Kilvington, D. and Price, J. (2019) 'Tackling Social Media Abuse? Critically Assessing English Football's Response to Online Racism', Communication & Sport, 7(1). P. 64–79.

Kuzma, Joanne et al. (2014)"A Study of the Use of Social Media Marketing in the Football Industry."

Lopez, Lori Kido, ed. Race and Media: Critical Approaches. NYU Press, 2020.

Matamoros-Fernández A, Farkas J. Racism(2021), Hate Speech, and Social Media: A Systematic Review and Critique. Television & New Media; 22(2). P. 205-224.

Nakamura, L. (2002) Cybertypes: Race, Ethnicity and. Identity on the Internet, New York: Routledge.

Pilz A., Gunter, (2016) Rassismus und Fremdenfeindlichkeit im Fußballumfeld – Herausforderungen für die Prävention. Strategien der extremen Rechten, 2016.

Pilz, G. A., & Wölki, F. (2004). Ultra-Szene in Deutschland (Teilstudie I im Rahmen des Gesamtprojekts "Wandlungen des Zuschauerverhaltens im Profifußball - Notwendigkeiten, Möglichkeiten und Grenzen gesellschaftlicher Reaktionen"). Hannover: Universität Hannover / Institut für Sportwissenschaft.

Purohit, H., Hampton, A., Shalin, V. L., Sheth, A. P., Flach, J., & Bhatt, S. (2013). What kind of #conversation is Twitter? Mining #psycholinguistic cues for emergency coordination. Computers in Human Behavior, 29(6), P. 2438-2447.

Porter, D., & Smith, A. (Eds.). (2004). Sport and National Identity in the Post-War World (1st ed.). Routledge.

Shakina E, Gasparetto T and Barajas A (2020) Football Fans' Emotions: Uncertainty Against Brand Perception. Front. Psychol. 11:659. P. 1-2.

Spracklen, Karl (2008) The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail: myths of scientific racism and the pursuit of excellence in sport, Leisure Studies, 27:2, P. 221-227,

Suler, J. (2004). The Online Disinhibition Effect. Cyberpsychology and Behavior, 7. P. 321-326.

Weller, Katrin & Kinder-Kurlanda, Katharina. (2015). Uncovering the Challenges in Collection, Sharing and Documentation: The Hidden Data of Social Media Research.

Zimmermann D. (2005) Fremdenfeindlichkeit und Rassismus bei Fussball-und Eishockey-Fans: Theorien, Strategien und Instrumente aus sozioprofessioneller Sicht.

Zuber, J. (2015). Gegenwärtiger Rassismus in Deutschland.

Webpages

Adel, O. (2022, March 3). *Black eagles: Documentary sheds light on racism in German football*. Gettotext. https://gettotext.com/blBlackeagles:DocumentaryshedslightonracisminGermanfootballackeagles -documentary-sheds-light-on-racism-in-german-football/? fbclid=IwAR2DEY7JZ5Cdp0ACM7DXkf1Iq5GXDpyQ5cSORupPwPUUGBWtIhyqY6ddCLc. Accessed 31. January 2022.

Ames, Nick. „Arsenal Distance Themselves from Mesut Özil Comments on Uighurs' Plight". The Guardian, 13. Dezember 2019. The Guardian, https://www.theguardian.com/football/2019/dec/13/arsenal-distance- themselves-from-mesut-ozil-comments-china-uighur-people. Accessed 02. March 2022.

Black Lives Matter: From Social Media Post to Global Movement". *BBC News*, 9. Juli 2020. *www.bbc.com*, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-53273381. Accessed 14. April 2022.

Christenson, M. (2018, June 24). *Sweden squad rally behind midfielder Jimmy Durmaz after racial abuse online*. https://www.theguardian.com/football/2018/jun/24/sweden-jimmy-durmaz-racial-abuse-germany-free-kick. Accessed 31. January 2022.

„Code of Conduct". *Fußball*, https://schalke04.de/en/club/fc-schalke-04/code-of-conduct/. Accessed 15. May 2022.

Declaration of the European Parliament on Tackling Racism in Football | European Website on Integration. https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/library-document/declaration-european-parliament-tackling-racism-football_en. Accessed 16. Mai 2022.

„Erwin Kostedde: ‚Schwarze Spieler werden in Deutschland immer zweite Wahl sein' | DW | 05.04.2021". *DW.COM*, https://www.dw.com/de/erwin-kostedde-schwarze-spieler-werden-in-deutschland-immer-zweite-wahl-sein/a-55246926. Accessed 17. April 2022.

„Fall Tönnies: Ethik-Kommission des DFB verzichtet auf Verfahren". *kicker*, https://www.kicker.de/fall-toennies_ethik-kommission-des-dfb-verzichtet-auf-verfahren-756681/artikel. Accessed 15. May 2022.

„HISTORIE: Ausländer - Feature 74_75". *bundesliga.de - die offizielle Webseite der Bundesliga*, https://www.bundesliga.com/de/bundesliga/news/1974-75-von-radi-ueber-buffy-bis-dino-_0000115020.jsp. Accessed 11. Mai 2022.

Kein Platz für Rassismus - Eintracht Frankfurt Klub". *Eintracht Frankfurt*, https://klub.eintracht.de/soziales-engagement/kein-platz-fuer-rassismus/. Accessed 15. May 2022.

KG, imfernsehen GmbH &. Co. „Schwarze Adler". *fernsehserien.de*, https://www.fernsehserien.de/filme/schwarze-adler. Accessed 15. May 2022.

Lewis, P. (2021, November 21). *Cloudflare*. Lordslibrary Parliament, https://lordslibrary.parliament.uk/black-history-month-racism-in-football/ Accessed 3. June 2022.

„‚Neger' und ‚Judensau': Neun erschütternde Rassismus-Vorfälle aus der Bundesliga". *www.t-online.de*, https://www.t-online.de/-/87282180. Accessed 15. May 2022.

No place for racism at Mainz 05. https://www.mainz05.de/en/news/no-place-for-racism-at-mainz-05/. Accessed 16. May 2022.

Rassismus. (n.d.). Mediendienst-Integration, https://mediendienst-integration.de/desintegration/rassismus.html. Accessed 04. June 2022.

Rassismus-Vorfälle in Deutschland 2021. (2021, December 20). Spox. from https://www.spox.com/de/sport/fussball/2112/Diashows/rassismus-im-deutschen-fussball/opoku-union-berlin-lehmann-bellingham.html. Accessed 4. June 2022.

Russo, Laura. Was ist Rassismus? Definitionen von Rassismus - humanrights.ch. https://www.humanrights.ch/de/ipf/menschenrechte/rassismus/dossier/was-ist-rassismus/. Accessed 15. May 2022.

https://www.sportspromedia.com/news/bayern-munich-agm-qatar-airways-deal-kahn-hainer-2022-fifa- world-cup/ Accessed 03. March 2022.

„Statement von Clemens Tönnies". *Fußball*, 2. August 2019, https://schalke04.de/inside/statement-von-clemens-toennies/Accessed 03. May 2022.

„Twitter: Number of Users Worldwide 2020". *Statista*. https://www.statista.com/statistics/303681/twitter-users-worldwide/. Accessed 15. March 2022.

„What Is Social Media?" WhatIs.Com, https://www.techtarget.com/whatis/definition/social-media. Accessed 02 February 2022.

ZIS Jahresbericht Fußball Saison 1999/2000, S. 5. In: http://www.polizei-nrw .de/lzpd/stepone/data/downloads/0d/00/00/1999_00jahresbericht-kurz.pdf

ZIS Jahresbericht Fußball Saison 2008/2009, S. 8. In: http://www.polizei-nrw.de/lzpd/stepone/data/downloads/63/00/00/2008-09jahresbericht-kurz.pdf.